# IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE OF BOMBAY
# BENCH AT AURANGABAD

## WRIT PETITION NO. 10432 OF 2025

MANSI PRAKASHRAO SATAMWAR UNDER GUARDIAN OF
FATHER PRAKASH VITTHAL SATAMWAR
*VERSUS*
THE STATE OF MAHARASHTRA AND ANOTHER

AND

## WRIT PETITION NO. 10433 OF 2025

SANJAY VITTHALRAO SATAMWAR
*VERSUS*
THE STATE OF MAHARASHTRA AND OTHERS

AND

## WRIT PETITION NO. 10434 OF 2025

SHIVAJI VITTHALRAO SATAMWAR
*VERSUS*
THE STATE OF MAHARASHTRA AND OTHERS

....

Mr. Pratap V. Jadhavar, Advocate for the Petitioners
Ms Kalplata Patil Bharaswadkar, AGP and Mr. S. D. Ghayal, Addl. G.P. for the Respondents – State

....

**CORAM : MANISH PITALE AND**
**Y. G. KHOBRAGADE, JJ.**

**DATE : 21.08.2025**

**ORDER (PER: Y. G. KHOBRAGADE, J.)** :-

1. In these Petitions, the Petitioners who are paternal blood relatives, have challenged the common order dated

08.08.2025, passed by Respondent No.2 Scrutiny Committee, invalidating their “Mannervarlu” Scheduled Tribe certificates.

2. In Writ Petition No.10432 of 2025, the Petitioner is the aspiring student and intends to secure admission for professional course. In Writ Petition Nos.10433 of 2025 and 10434 of 2025, the Petitioners are in employment and serving with Respondent No.3. Therefore, considering the extreme urgency shown, the Petitions are taken up for disposal at the stage of admission.

3. Issue notice to Respondent Nos.1 and 2. The learned AGP waives notice on behalf of Respondent Nos.1 and 2 in all the Petitions.

4. Heard both the sides at length.

5. As per the genealogical tree, Vitthal Naganna Satamwar, the forefather of the Petitioners have three sons, namely, Sanjay (Petitioner in Writ Petition No.10433 of 2025), Prakash and Shivaji (Petitioner in Writ Petition No.10434 of 2025). Pranita, Mansi (Petitioner in Writ Petition No.10432 of 2025) and Pranjal, are the children of Prakash. Pratik and Tejas are the sons of Shivaji.

6. On face of record, it appears that on 06.11.2023, the Scrutiny Committee has granted “Mannervarlu” Scheduled Tribe validity certificate in favour of Pranita Prakash Satamwar, the niece of the Petitioners Sanjay and Shivaji and real sister of Mansi, Petitioner in Writ Petition No.10432 of 2025. Further, on 07.07.2011, the Scrutiny Committee granted “Mannervarlu” Scheduled Tribe validity certificate in favour of Nikhil Sanjay Satamwar. This Court, on 20.11.2020 in Writ Petition Stamp No.21450 of 2020 (Sanket Shriram Satamwad Vs. The State of Maharashtra and others), directed the Scrutiny Committee to issue conditional “Mannervarlu” Scheduled Tribe validity certificate in favour of the Petitioner therein.

7. On 21.10.2021, this Court has passed order in Writ Petition No.10560 of 2021 (Yogesh Sanjayrao Satamwar Vs. The State of Maharashtra and others) and directed the Scrutiny Committee to issue conditional “Mannervarlu” Scheduled Tribe validity certificate in favour of the Petitioner therein. Therefore, it prima-facie appears that the paternal blood relatives of these Petitioners are holding validity certificates. However, on 08.08.2025, the Scrutiny Committee has passed the impugned order and invalidated the caste claim of the Petitioners on the ground that the blood relatives of the Petitioner

have obtained the validity certificates by playing fraud and suppressing the material fact.

8. Since the paternal blood relatives of the Petitioners are having “Mannervarlu” Scheduled Tribe validity certificates, considering the parity, the Petitioners are also entitled to have “Mannervarlu” Scheduled Tribe validity certificates. However, such validity shall be subject to the outcome of the decision I the proceeding in respect of blood relatives of the Petitioners, which the Respondent No.2 Scrutiny Committee decided to re-open.

9. Considering the law laid down in the cases of ***Mah. Adiwasi Thakur Jamat Swarakshan Samiti Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.; AIR 2023 SC 1657, Shweta Balaji Isankar Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors., 2018 SCC Online Bom. 10341, Apoorva Vinay Nichale Vs. Divisional Caste Certificate Scrutiny Committee No.1 and Ors., 2010(6) Mh.L.J. 401,*** wherein it has been concluded that when the biological father, biological siblings, biological uncle etc., are granted validity certificates, a candidate so related to them, cannot be deprived of a validity certificate. The present Petitioners are entitled to have certificate of validity on the ground of parity, however, the

such validity shall be subject to the outcome of the decision in the proceeding in respect of blood relatives of the Petitioners, which the Respondent No.2 Scrutiny Committe decided to re-open.

10. Since the Petitioner in Writ Petition No.10432 of 2025 appears to be the aspiring candidates for admission to professional course and she intend to secure admission under the Scheduled Tribe reserved category, she is directed to furnish undertaking that, in the event her claim is invalidated by Respondent No.2 Scrutiny Committee, she shall pay the tuition and admission fees applicable to a candidate from open category and no equity shall lie in her favour. So also, the Petitioners in Writ Petition Nos.10433 of 2025 and Writ Petition No. 10434 of 2025, are in employment working with Respondent No.3, therefore, they shall execute undertaking with their respective employer and Respondent No.2 Scrutiny Committee that they will not claim any equity in case the validity certificate of their paternal blood relatives are revoked and they will cooperate with the Scrutiny Committee.

11. In view of the above discussion, the present Petitions deserve to be partly allowed and the impugned order dated

08.08.2025, passed by Respondent No.2, needs to be quashed and set aside. Accordingly, we proceed to pass the following order:-

## ORDER

(i) The Writ Petitions are partly allowed.

(ii) The impugned order dated 08.08.2025, passed by Respondent No.2 Scrutiny Committee, is hereby quashed and set aside.

(iii) Respondent No.2 Scrutiny Committee shall **immediately** issue "Mannervarlu" Scheduled Tribe validity certificates in favour of the Petitioners, which shall be subject to following conditions:-

(a) The caste validity certificate shall be subject to the outcome of the re-verification of the validity certificates of their blood relatives proposed by the Scrutiny Committee.

(b) The Petitioner in Writ Petition No.10432 of 2025 shall furnish undertaking before the Registrar (Judicial) of this Court as well as before Respondent No.2 Scrutiny Committee and the Educational Institution with which she seek admission for professional courses, stating that in the event of her caste validity is revoked, she shall deposit the tuition fees and other charges applicable to the candidates from open category.

(c) The Petitioners shall not claim any equity.

(d) The Petitioners shall cooperate with the Scrutiny Committee.

(iv) The blood relatives of the Petitioners, shall furnish undertaking before the Scrutiny Committee, stating that they will cooperate and appear before the Scrutiny Committee as and when called upon.

(v) The Writ Petitions are disposed of. Pending applications, if any, also stand disposed of.

**[ Y. G. KHOBRAGADE, J. ]** **[ MANISH PITALE, J. ]**

SMS