



**IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE OF BOMBAY
BENCH AT AURANGABAD**

WRIT PETITION NO.3688 OF 2024

Bhavana Yashwantrao Bagul ... **PETITIONER**

VERSUS

The State of Maharashtra & ors. ... **RESPONDENTS**

.....
Mr. R.K. Mendadkar, Advocate with
Mr. V.G. Gangalwad, Advocate for petitioner
Mr. S.D. Ghayal, A.G.P. for State
.....

**CORAM : R.G. AVACHAT AND
ABASAHEB D. SHINDE, JJ.**

DATE : 19th NOVEMBER, 2025

ORDER :

Heard. The petitioner claims to have belonged to "Thakur" Scheduled Tribe. His tribe claim was subjected to validation. The respondent No.2 Scrutiny Committee invalidated the petitioner's claim. She is, therefore, before us in this Writ Petition.

2. Learned counsel for the petitioner mainly relies on

the validity certificate granted by this Court in favour of the petitioner's blood relations pursuant to the orders dated 11/6/2025 and 3/9/2025, passed in Writ Petition No.3569/2024 and 10499/2025 respectively. He also relies on the entry in the birth register of Ramchandra Maharuru Thakur, great-great-great grandfather of the petitioner. The said entry indicates the great-great-great grandfather of the petitioner is shown to have belonged to "Thakur" community. He, therefore, urged for setting aside the order impugned herein and grant of at least conditional validity certificate.

3. The learned A.G.P. has strong reservations to allow the Writ Petition. He first adverted our attention to the school record of the forefathers of the petitioner and even of Ramchandra Maharuru itself, wherein his/ their caste is shown as "Bhat". According to the learned A.G.P., the entry in the birth register of Ramchandra Maharuru was not placed before the respondent Scrutiny Committee. According to him, it is a matter of fact, this Court cannot give any finding at least about genuineness of this document. According to him, the respondent Scrutiny Committee gave a finding based on the

material placed before it, wherein Ramchandra Maharu and other forefathers of the petitioner were shown to have belonged to Brahma-Bhat, Rajput etc. He, therefore, urged for remanding the matter to the Scrutiny Committee to test the veracity of the said document.

4. We have considered the submissions advanced. Perused the documents on record. This Court, vide orders dated 11/6/2025 and 3/9/2025, passed in Writ Petition No.3569/2024 and 10499/2025 respectively granted conditional validities to the blood relations of the petitioner. One of those relatives is real brother and real sister, who hold validity certificates on the strength of the orders passed by this Court. Since the co-ordinate Bench of this Court granted those conditional validities, we are unable to take a different view. More so, when the order dated 11/6/2025, passed by the Division Bench, wherein one of us (R.G. Avachat, J.) was a member, the said Bench had referred to entry of Ramchandra Maharu in the birth register besides the order passed by the co-ordinate Bench on 3/9/2025 in Writ Petition No.10499/2025. Admittedly, the respondent Scrutiny Committee has not

challenged the orders dated 11/6/2025 and 3/9/2025, passed by this Court in Writ Petition No.3569/2024 and 10499/2025 respectively. In this view of the matter, we are inclined to grant the petitioner conditional validity. The petition, therefore, succeeds. Hence, the order :

ORDER

- (i) The Writ Petition is partly allowed.
- (ii) The order impugned herein is hereby set aside. The respondent Scrutiny Committee is directed to issue the petitioner validity certificate of belonging to "Thakur" Scheduled Tribe. The certificate to be issued to the petitioner shall be conditional i.e. subject to the outcome of the proceedings which are said to have been reopened.

(ABASAHEB D. SHINDE, J.)

(R.G. AVACHAT, J.)

fmp/-