



IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT BOMBAY  
BENCH AT AURANGABAD

WRIT PETITION NO. 3706 OF 2025

POONAM DHONDIRAM NAGRALE

VERSUS

1. THE STATE OF MAHARASHTRA THROUGH ITS SECRETARY,  
TRIBAL DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT, MANTRALAYA, MUMBAI.
2. THE SCHEDULED TRIBE CERTIFICATE VERIFICATION  
COMMITTEE KINWAT, HEAD QUARTER AT CHH. SAMBHAJINAGAR,  
THROUGH ITS DY. DIRECTOR (R), DIST. SAMBHAJINGAR.
3. THE COMMISSIONER OF STATE TAX, MAHARASHTRA STATE,  
MUMBAI, 8TH FLOOR, VIKRIKAR BHAVAN, MAZGAON, MUMBAI
4. THE ADD. COMMISSIONER OF STATE TAX, MAHARASHTRA  
STATE, MUMBAI, OPPOSITE GOLF CLUB, AIRPORT ROAD,  
YERWADA, PUNE, DIST. PUNE.
5. THE ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OF STATE TAX, STATE TAX  
COMMISSIONERATE, VAT ADMINISTRATION OFFICE, GST BHAVAN,  
HOTAGI ROAD, SOLAPUR, DIST. SOLAPUR.

...

Advocate for the Petitioner : Mr. Sunil Mahadevappa Vibhute  
AGP for Respondents/State : Mr. S. R. Wakale

...

CORAM : MANGESH S. PATIL &  
Y. G. KHOBRAGADE, JJ.

DATE : 18.03.2025

PER COURT :

. Issue notice. The learned AGP waives service for all respondents. On the joint request, the matter is heard finally at the stage of admission.

2. The petitioner is challenging the judgment and order dated 07.03.2025 of respondent No. 2 – the Scrutiny Committee refusing to validate her '*Koli Mahadev*' scheduled tribe certificate.

3. It is being pointed out that vigilance enquiry was conducted in the matter of petitioner's first degree cousin – Megharani Ganpat Nagrale. The petitioner was allowed to adopt the reply filed by her as is evident from paragraph No. 4 of the impugned order and the matter was decided. This demonstrates that the evidence that was before the committee while deciding the claim of Megharani is the subject matter of scrutiny even in the petitioner's claim. Megharani has faced invalidation and was held entitled to have a certificate of validity by the order dated 21.08.2019 in writ petition No. 9187 of 2019 (principal seat).

4. Since the same set of evidence is subject matter of scrutiny of this Court in the matter of Megharani, no separate reasoning can be assigned.

5. For the selfsame reasons as have been recorded by the coordinate division bench in the matter of Megharani, the petitioner is entitled to have a certificate of validity.

6. The writ petition is allowed partly.

7. The impugned judgment and order is quashed and set aside. The committee shall issue a certificate of validity to the petitioner of '*Koli Mahadev*' scheduled tribe. It shall be subject to the final outcome of the matter which the committee has decided to re-open.

8. The petitioner shall not be entitled to claim equities.

(Y. G. KHOBRAGADE, J.)

(MANGESH S. PATIL, J.)

jhs/