



W.P.(MD).No.2608 of 2024

BEFORE THE MADURAI BENCH OF MADRAS HIGH COURT

DATED : 15.10.2024

CORAM:

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE R.VIJAYAKUMAR

W.P(MD)No.2608 of 2024

and

W.M.P(MD) Nos. 2629 and 2630 of 2024

C.Lilly Rose

... Petitioner

Vs.

1. The Directorate of Collegiate Education,
I.A.S.E. Campus,
577, Anna Salai, Saidapet,
Chennai – 600 015.

2. The Regional Joint Director of Collegiate Education,
Madurai Region,
Madurai – 625 002.

3. The Secretary/Correspondent,
V.V.Vanniaperumal College for Women,
Virudhunagar – 626 001.

... Respondents

PRAYER: Writ Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India, praying this Court to issue a Writ of Certiorarified Mandamus, calling for the records of the impugned order passed by the first respondent in ஓ.மு.எண். 31616/ஐ/2023 நாள்: 10.01.2024 and quash the same as illegal and unconstitutional, consequently direct the respondents 1 and 2 to approve the promotion of the petitioner as Junior Assistant in the third respondent college



W.P.(MD).No.2608 of 2024

with effect from 12.05.2022 and grant her all attendant, service and all other monetary benefits within the time stipulated by this Court.

For Petitioner : Mr.S.Balamurugan

For R1 and R2 : Mr.N.Satheesh Kumar
Additional Government Pleader

For R3 : No appearance

ORDER

The instant Writ Petition has been filed by a Junior Assistant appointed in the third respondent College, challenging the order passed by the first respondent, wherein the request of the Management for approval of the promotion orders have been rejected.

2. The petitioner herein, who was working as a Lab Assistant in the third respondent Institution was promoted as a Junior Assistant in the same College. The said promotion order was forwarded to the first respondent herein for her approval. Under the impugned order dated 10.01.2024, the said proposal was rejected on the ground that the post of Lab Assistant is equivalent to the post of Junior Assistant and therefore, the appointment of



W.P.(MD).No.2608 of 2024

the petitioner from the post of Lab Assistant to Junior Assistant cannot be approved as a promotion. The said order is under challenge in the present writ petition.

3.The issue involved in the present writ petition is no longer *res integra*. The Hon'ble Division Bench of this Court after considering all the above said issues has dismissed the writ petition filed by the State in W.A. (MD)Nos.114 & 9 of 2020, dated 25.03.2021.

4. Per Contra, the learned Additional Government Pleader appearing for the respondents 1 and 2 herein would contend that when sanction was granted to the Aided College for appointment to the post of Lab Assistant, it was treated only as non-promotional post. Therefore, the petitioner can never be promoted as Junior Assistant/Typist, considering the post of Lab Assistant as feeder category. He further contended that the pay scale of the Lab Assistant is equivalent to that of Junior Assistant/Typist and therefore, the same is non-promotional post also. He further contended that in case, the petitioner is promoted as a Junior Assistant/Typist, the same will be treated as a feeder category for further promotion and it would create financial



W.P.(MD).No.2608 of 2024

WEB COPY

implications to the Government. Hence he prayed for dismissal of the writ petition.

5. I have carefully considered the submission made on either side and perused the materials available on record.

6. A perusal of the impugned order reveals that the request of the management for approving the promotion order from the post of Lab Assistant to the post of Junior Assistant/Typist has been rejected on the sole ground that the post of Junior Assistant/Typist can never be treated to be a promotional post, in view of the fact that the salary of both the posts are one and the same.

7. The Hon'ble Division Bench of our High Court, in the judgment W.A(MD)Nos.114 & 9 of 2020, dated 25.03.2021, has considered a similar issue. The operative portions of the order in Paragraph No.2 to 6 are extracted as follows:-

“2.In both the cases, promotions have been given from the post of Lab Assistant to Junior Assistant. It appears that



W.P.(MD).No.2608 of 2024

both the posts carry the same scale of pay. The case of the appellants in these cases is that, inasmuch as Lab Assistant post is not the feeder category to the post of Junior Assistant, where is a question of promotion being approved by them?

3.The learned Special Government Pleader submitted that under those circumstances, the orders passed require interference.

4.The learned counsel appearing for respondent No.1 in W.A.(MD)No.9 of 2020 placing reliance upon G.O.Ms.No.11, Education Department, dated 04.01.1989, submitted that recruitment by transfer is permissible from Lab Assistant to Junior Assistant. Secondly, it is submitted that the post of Junior Assistant is a feeder category to the post of Assistant and thereafter, Superintendent. However, the post of Lab Assistant is not a feeder category. The incumbents are languishing in the post of Lab Assistant for decades. Therefore, in any case, no prejudice would be caused.

5.We find force in the submissions made by the learned counsel appearing for the respondents. As per G.O.Ms.No.11, Education Department, dated 04.01.1989, the recruitment by transfer can be made from the post of Lab Assistant to the post of Junior Assistant. Though it has been misconstrued as that of promotion from the post of Lab Assistant to the post of Junior Assistant, inasmuch as there is no loss of revenue to the appellants, such recruitment by transfer cannot be objected to,



W.P.(MD).No.2608 of 2024

after all, both the posts are drawing the same scale of pay, which certainly benefits the persons, who moved from the post of Lab Assistant to the post of Junior Assistant.

6.Right to be considered for promotion cannot be denied, though it is not a vested right. The proceedings relied upon by the appellants are meant for Specific Service Rules namely, the Tamil Nadu Private Colleges (Regulation) Act, 1976 and therefore, it cannot be applied in the case on hand. Even otherwise, as observed by us, the facts would clearly establish that no prejudice is caused. To put it differently, the Management can very well fill the post of Junior Assistant. If the post is filled otherwise, the appellants would have given sanction/permission. Admittedly, the posts are also vacant. Therefore, looking from any perspective, we do not find any reason to interfere with the order of the learned Single Judge. Accordingly, these Writ Appeals are dismissed. No costs. Consequently, connected Miscellaneous Petitions are closed.”

8. In view of the judgment of the Hon'ble Division of our High Court, the respondent authorities cannot take a stand that both the posts of Lab Assistant as well as the post of Junior Assistant/Typist are drawing the same pay scale and therefore, it is not a promotional post and the issue has already been decided by the above said Judgment of the Hon'ble Division Bench.



W.P.(MD).No.2608 of 2024

WEB COPY

9. In view of the above said deliberations, the order impugned in the writ petition is set aside and the respondents are directed to approve the promotion of the writ petitioner as Junior Assistant with effect from 12.05.2022 and pass orders and conferring all consequential benefits within a period of twelve weeks from the date of receipt of a copy of this order.

10. With the above said observations, this Writ Petition stands allowed to the extent as stated above. There shall be no order as to costs. Consequently connected Miscellaneous Petitions stand closed.

NCC : Yes/No
Index : Yes / No
Internet : Yes / No
ebsi

15.10.2024
1/2



W.P.(MD).No.2608 of 2024

WEB COPY

To

1. The Directorate of Collegiate Education,
I.A.S.E. Campus,
577, Anna Salai, Saidapet,
Chennai – 600 015.
2. The Regional Joint Director of Collegiate Education,
Madurai Region,
Madurai – 625 002.
3. The Secretary/Correspondent,
V.V.Vanniaperumal College for Women,
Virudhunagar – 626 001.



WEB COPY



W.P.(MD).No.2608 of 2024

R.VIJAYAKUMAR,J.

ebsi

W.P(MD)No.2608 of 2024

15.10.2024

1/2