



WEB COPY

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

Dated: 04.01.2024

CORAM

THE HONOURABLE **DR. JUSTICE ANITA SUMANTH**

W.P.Nos.36215, 36218, 36310, 36314, 36465 & 36468 of 2023 &

WMP.Nos.36240, 36291, 36295 & 36296 of 2023

WP.No.36215 of 2023

Dr.S.P.Anusha

... Petitioner

Vs

- 1.The State of Tamil Nadu
Represented by its Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai-600 009.
- 2.Directorate of Medical Education,
Represented by the Director of Medical Education,
Kilpauk, Chennai-600 010.
- 3.Directorate of Medical and Rural Health Services
Represented by the Director of Medical Health and
Rural Health Services,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai-600 006.
- 4.Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine
Represented by the Director of Public Health and
Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai-600 006.



5. Government Thanjavur Medical College,
Represented by its Dean,
Thanjavur-613004.

WEB COPY

6. National Medical Council
Represented by its Secretary
Pocket 14, Sector-8, Dwarka Phase I
New Delhi – 110 077.
(& etc. batch)

... Respondents

PRAYER in W.P.No.36215 of 2023: Writ Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying to issue a Writ of Mandamus directing the Respondents to treat the Petitioner's two-year bond period as completed and to consequently relieve her from her bonded service in the Government Primary Health Centre, Kollanalli, Erode Health Unit District and to direct the 5th Respondent to return the her original certificates and documents collected during her Post-Graduate degree certificate, within a time limit to be stipulated by this Hon'ble Court.

<i>Case Nos.</i>	<i>For Petitioners</i>	<i>For Respondents</i>
WP.Nos.36215 & 36218 of 2023	Ms.K.Dhivyashree	Mrs.Geetha Thamaraiselvan (R1 to R5) Special Government Pleader Mr.K.Lokesh Khanna (R6) for Ms.Shubaranjani Ananth
WP.Nos.36310 & 36314 of 2023	Mr.Suhrith Parthasarathy	Mrs.Geetha Thamaraiselvan Special Government Pleader
WP.Nos.36465 & 36468 of 2023	Ms.K.Dhivyashree	Mrs.Geetha Thamaraiselvan (R1 to R5) Special Government Pleader Mr.K.Lokesh Khanna (R6) for Ms.Shubaranjani Ananth



COMMON ORDER

Heard Mr.Suhrith Parthasarathy and Ms.K.Dhivyashree, learned counsel for the petitioners, Mrs.Geetha Thamaraiselvan, learned Special Government Pleader and Mr.K.Lokesh Khanna, learned counsel for Ms.Shubaranjani Ananth, learned counsel for the State.

2. WMP Nos.36290 & 36295 of 2023 filed seeking permission to file a single Writ Petition are ordered on payment of separate Court fee.

3. I have considered an identical prayer as in the present Writ Petitions in W.P.No.28238 of 2023 and have held as follows:

The petitioner is a Doctor, who had completed Post Graduation in General Medicine from KAP Viswanathan Medical College in the non service category. He had completed the course in May, 2022 and had, at the time of admission to the course, executed a bond for a sum of Rs.40 lakhs undertaking that he would serve the State for a period of two years after completion of the course. The bond period, admittedly, runs till 31.05.2024.

2. *Within a few months of commencing the course, the Covid 19 pandemic had struck and the petitioner, and, in fact several other identically / similarly placed candidates, were required to be on covid duty in R5 Hospital. Though no appointment orders could be issued seeing as the petitioner was a student then, his services during the covid period is not disputed as duty sheets for the service rendered have duly been produced by the petitioner and verified by the respondent counsel.*

3. *The question as to whether covid duty would constitute in-bond service is no longer res integra having been considered and accepted by two learned Judges in W.P.No.26556*



WEB COPY

of 2022 (decision dated 02.02.2023) and W.P.No.22894 of 2023 (decision dated 08.09.2023). In these cases, the petitioners were students who were required to perform covid duty during their course and this Court has held, and I concur with these decisions, that the covid duty rendered by the students should be taken note of as service during the bond period.

4. An additional question that arises in this case is as to whether quarantine relatable to covid period is also be taken as bond service. The period of quarantine is, in my considered view, nothing but an extension of covid duty itself as the Rules prevalent then required mandatory quarantine. The petitioner would well have continued with the duty in the covid ward itself has it not been for the mandate of compulsory quarantine. Thus, taking the period of quarantine also as on-duty, such period in this case is quantified as 150 days. On-duty call sheets duly signed by the Dean of R5 college have been produced by the petitioner. This will advance the closure of bond period to 02.01.2024 from 31.05.2024.

5. The petitioner's request for a mandamus directing the respondents to treat compulsory bond period as concluding on 02.01.2024 is accepted. R5 is directed, upon completion of bond period on 02.01.2024, to return to the petitioner, his original certificates received at the time of admission to PG course.

6. Allowed in the above terms. No costs. Connected miscellaneous petition is closed.

4. Yet another development has been noted by me in W.P.Nos.32073, 33124, 32505, 32512, 29724 and 32380 of 2023 to following effect:

The issue of treating Covid duty as period of duty for the purpose of computing of bond service now stands settled categorically by virtue of an order passed by the First Bench in W.P.Nos.25827, 25785 and 27568 of 2023, decided on 16.11.2023.



WEB COPY



2. *Those Writ Petitions relate to the recruitment of Assistant Surgeons. In the course of the discussion, the First Bench has settled the position that, both for the purpose of Under Graduate (UG) as well as Post Graduate (PG) medical education, the duties performed during covid period/treating covid patients should be treated as eligible duty.*

3. *The discussion from paragraph 7 onwards is clear to this effect and reads as follows:*

7. It is true that the services rendered by the Post~Graduate students is part of their 36 months period training which they undergo. The said period is supposed to be the practical training towards the subject in which they undergo the study. Because of the abnormal situation arising out of the COVID 19 pandemic, they were also roped in COVID 19 duty in the COVID ~ 19 wards in the Government Hospitals. It is not in dispute that they put in the same kind of duty and underwent the same rigors as that of the other medical officers recruited by the State Government. As a matter of fact, the persons, who were recruited by the State Government for the said purpose of performing COVID 19 duty in these wards which are set up as part of the disaster management, are categorised as Medical Officers.

7.1. It may be seen that both these temporary appointees as well as the Post~Graduate medical students are registered medical practitioners eligible to be appointed as Assistant Surgeons. Service to the Health Department, Government of Tamil nadu is governed by the Statutory Rules known as Tamil Nadu Medical Service Rules. It contains two parts namely, Branch~I Medical and Branch~II Nursing. As far as the medical cadre is concerned, as per Rule 2, it is divided into Civil Surgeon cadre and Assistant Surgeon cadre. All



WEB COPY



the entry level posts of Assistant Surgeon in the general line, Non~Clinical Lectures, Tutors / Assistant Professors, Clinical Lecturers, Senior Residents / Assistant Professors and the Women State Family Planning Officer are all grouped under the cadre of Assistant Surgeon. Thus, it can be seen that there is no such post as such called Medical Officer. But, the term Medical Officer is widely used in the rules to denote every registered medical practitioner appointed to any post. When it comes to deputing personnel for the Chennai City Police, they are called Medical Officers to the Chennai City Police. The Senior Residents are also termed as Resident Medical Officers. Similarly, the term Medical Officer is generally used in the context of referring to the person who is working in any capacity with the qualified medical degree (in common parlance, the Doctors working in the department).

4. Thus, the submission of the respondents to the effect that PG students were only been given 'training' and that such service must be disregarded for computation of duty/bond period cannot be accepted. In light of the decision of the First Bench cited supra affirming the principle that the duty performed by PG students during Covid period must be taken as regular medical service.

5. The State has now issued G.O.Ms.No.371 dated 18.11.2023 directing that the term 'Medical Officers' mentioned at Para 5.1(i) of G.O.(MS.) No.278, Health and Family Welfare (B1) Department dated 17.08.2023 be replaced as 'Medical Officers including Post Graduate Students'. The authorities have been directed to issue certificates confirming the number of days when covid duty was performed by the students.

6. In light of the above, let such certificates be issued to the petitioners at least two days prior to the next date of



hearing. List on 05.12.2023. Written instructions/counter, if any, by then with an advance copy to the petitioners.

WEB COPY

5. The petitioners have received covid duty certificates in terms of G.O.Ms.No.371 dated 18.11.2023 and G.O.(MS.) No.278 dated 17.08.2023.

6. The details of the post-graduation courses completed by the petitioners and the number of days of covid duty rendered by the petitioners as per the certificates issued by the respondents, are as follows:

WP.No.	PETITIONERS' NAME	PG in :(MAY 2019 TO May 2022)	PG COURSE	DURATION OF COVID-19 DUTY	PRESENTLY POSTED/ SERVING AT
36215 of 2023	Dr.S.P.Anusha	Govt. Tanjore Medical College	MD Anaesthesiology	24.03.2020 to 31.03.2022 (2years and 6 days)	Government Primary Health Centre, Kolanalli, Erode Health Unit District
36218 of 2023	Dr.P.C.Ganapathy Shakthivel	Govt. Tanjore Medical College	MD Anaesthesiology	24.03.2020 to 31.03.2022 (2years and 6 days)	Govt. PHC Madukkur, Thanjavur Health Unit District.
36465 of 2023	Dr.S.Keerthana	Govt. Tanjore Medical College	MD Anaesthesiology	24.03.2020 to 31.03.2022 (24 months and 6 days)	Govt. Primary Health Centre, Palayapatti, Tanjore Health Unit District
36468 of 2023	Dr.I.Samson Ebenezar	Govt. Tanjore Medical College	MD Anaesthesiology	24.03.2020 to 31.03.2022 (24 months and 6 days)	Govt. Hospital, Devakottai, Sivaganga District
36310 of 2023	Dr.Sri Pavithra N.	Government Thoothukkudi Medical College	General Surgery	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2years and 37 days)	Government Primary Health Centre, Vellakoil, Tiruppur HUD
	Dr.Sabarija M.S.	Government Thoothukkudi	General Surgery	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022	Government Taluk Hospital,



WP.No.	PETITIONERS' NAME	PG in :(MAY 2019 TO May 2022)	PG COURSE	DURATION OF COVID-19 DUTY	PRESENTLY POSTED/ SERVING AT
		Medical College		(2 years and 37 days)	Thiruvadanai, Ramanathapuram
	Dr.V.Pradeepkumar	Government Kilpauk Medical College	General Medicine	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Government Hospital, Sholingur, Ranipet
	Dr.Shanu S.Igno	Government Kilpauk Medical College	General Medicine	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Government Primary Health Centre, Thirukurangudi, Tirunelveli HUD
	Dr.Gopika S.R.	Government Thoothukkudi Medical College	Paediatrics	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Government Primary Health Centre, Thengapattinam, Nagercoil HUD
	Dr.Jabzeer J.N.	Government Thoothukkudi Medical College	General Surgery	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Government Hospital, Sankarankoil, Tenkasi
36314 of 2023	Dr.Sahitya S.	Madurai Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Chengalpattu Medical College
	Dr.Devi Priya R	Madurai Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	11.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 40 days)	Government Pudukottai Medical College
	Dr.P.Anu	Madurai Medical College	Anesthesiology	11.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 40 days)	Government Primary Health Centre, Manikampalayam, Namakkal
	Dr.Yamini R.	Government Tirunelveli Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Government Medical College, Vellore
	Dr. T.S.Abirami	Government Theni	Obstetrics and	24.03.2020 to	Government



WP.No.	PETITIONERS' NAME	PG in :(MAY 2019 TO May 2022)	PG COURSE	DURATION OF COVID-19 DUTY	PRESENTLY POSTED/ SERVING AT
		Medical College	Gynecology	30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Pudukkottai Medical College
	Dr.Moneekha Priyadarshini	Stanley Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Government Medical College, Vellore
	Dr.Nivetha S	Stanley Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Government Medical College, Vellore
	Dr.Keerthana V.	Stanley Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Government Medical College, Vellore
	Dr.Sabiha Nikhat N	Madras Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	26.04.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 5 days)	Government Medical College, Vellore
	Dr.Monisha S	Madras Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	26.04.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 5 days)	Government Pudukkottai Medical
	Dr.Vijayalakshmi K	Government Villupuram Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Government Medical College, the Nilgiris
	Dr.Sornalatha C.L.	Madurai Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	11.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 40 days)	Government Hospital, Coonoor, Nilgiris
	Dr.Monisha K	Stanley Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	March 2020 to April 2022 (2 years, 1 month)	Government Medical College, Vellore
	Dr.R.Pavithra	Madras Medical College	Obstetrics and Gynecology	26.04.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years and 5 days)	Government Medical College, Vellore
	Dr.Baby Lalli	Government	Psychiatry	24.03.2020 to	Government



<i>WP.No.</i>	<i>PETITIONERS' NAME</i>	<i>PG in :(MAY 2019 TO May 2022)</i>	<i>PG COURSE</i>	<i>DURATION OF COVID-19 DUTY</i>	<i>PRESENTLY POSTED/ SERVING AT</i>
		Mohan Kumaramangalam Medical College, Salem		30.04.2022 (2 years and 37 days)	Primary Health Centre, Periyamanali, Namakkal

7. In light of the above, nothing stands in the way of the petitioners being given the benefit of mandamus as sought, to treat the two year compulsory bond period as completed. In fact, in all the cases, they have rendered service in excess of the two years provided for under the Bond.

8. The petitioners are hence released from bonded Government service and there is a direction to the Deans of the respective medical colleges arrayed as respondents in the Writ petitions to return their original certificates when the petitioners presents themselves before them, forthwith.

9. These Writ Petitions are disposed in the aforesaid terms. No costs. Connected Miscellaneous Petitions are closed.

04.01.2024

sl

Index : Yes/No

Speaking Order:Yes

Neutral Citation:Yes



To

- 1.The State of Tamil Nadu
Represented by its Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai-600 009.
- 2.Directorate of Medical Education,
Represented by the Director of Medical Education,
Kilpauk, Chennai-600 010.
- 3.Directorate of Medical and Rural Health Services
Represented by the Director of Medical Health and
Rural Health Services,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai-600 006.
- 4.Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine
Represented by the Director of Public Health and
Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai-600 006.
- 5.Government Thanjavur Medical College,
Represented by its Dean,
Thanjavur-613004.
- 6.National Medical Council
Represented by its Secretary
Pocket 14, Sector-8, Dwarka Phase I
New Delhi – 110 077



WEB COPY

W.P.Nos.36215, 36218, 36310, 36314, 36465 & 36468



DR.ANITA SUMANTH, J.

Sl

W.P.Nos.36215, 36218, 36310, 36314,
36465 & 36468 of 2023 &
WMP.Nos.36240, 36291,
36295 & 36296 of 2023

04.01.2024