



WEB COPY



H.C.P.No.2406 of 2023

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

Dated : 11.03.2024

CORAM :

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE M.S.RAMESH

AND

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE SUNDER MOHAN

H.C.P.No.2406 of 2023

B. Menaka

... Petitioner

Vs.

1.The Additional Chief Secretary to Government,
Home, Prohibition, Excise Department,
St.George Fort, Chennai - 600 009.

2.The Commissioner of Police,
Avadi Commissioner of Police, Avadi.

3.The Superintendent of Police,
Central Prison, Puzhal, Chennai 600 066

4.The Inspector of Police,
M-7, Manali New Town Police Station,
Chennai.

... Respondents

Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India, praying to issue Writ of Habeas Corpus, calling for the records relating to the detention order No.226/BCDFGISSSV/2023, dated 31.10.2023, passed by



H.C.P.No.2406 of 2023

the 2nd respondent under the respondent to produce the petitioner's husband S.Buveneswaran, S/o. Sando, aged about 31 years, the detenu, now confined in central Prison, Puzhal, before this Hon'ble Court and set him at liberty.

For petitioner : Mr.S. Apuna

For Respondents : Mr.E. Raj Thilak
Additional Public Prosecutor
Assisted by Aravind.C

ORDER

M.S.RAMESH, J.

and

SUNDER MOHAN, J.

The petitioner, wife of the detenu namely Buveneswaran, aged about 31 years, S/o. Sando, has come forward with this petition challenging the detention order passed by the 2nd respondent, dated 31.10.2023 slapped on her husband, branding him as "Goonda" under the Tamil Nadu Prevention of Dangerous Activities of Bootleggers, Drug Offenders, Forest Offenders, Goondas, Immoral Traffic Offenders, Sand Offenders, Slum Grabbers and Video Pirates Act, 1982 [Tamil Nadu Act 14 of 1982].



H.C.P.No.2406 of 2023

WEB COPY 2. Heard the learned counsel for the petitioner and the learned Additional Public Prosecutor appearing for the respondents.

3. Though several grounds were raised by the learned counsel for the petitioner, it is stated that the detention order is liable to be quashed on the sole ground that the date of Remand Extension Order in Tamil differs from the English Version.

4. On a perusal of the Remand Extension Order and the translated version, we find that, in English version the date is mentioned as 18.10.2023 whereas, in the Tamil version it is mentioned as 25.10.2023. This is bound to confuse the detenu and deny the right to make effective representation.

5. In this context, it is useful to refer to the judgment of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in *Powanammal Vs. State of Tamil Nadu* reported in **(1999) 2 SCC 413**. The Hon'ble Supreme Court had occasion to deal with similar situation where in the Grounds of Detention referred to an order



H.C.P.No.2406 of 2023

remanding the detenu therein to judicial custody was in English language.

Since the tamil version of the document was not supplied to the detenu therein, a specific issue was raised by the Hon'ble Supreme Court whether failure to supply tamil version of the remand order passed in English, a language not known to the detenu therein, would vitiate the detenu's further detention. The Hon'ble Supreme Court, after discussing the safeguards embodied in Article 22[5] of the Constitution, observed that the detenu should be afforded an opportunity of making representation effectively against the Detention Order and that, the failure to supply every material in the language which can be understood by the detenu, is imperative. In the said context, the Hon'ble Supreme Court has held in Paragraphs 9 and 16 as follows:

“9.However, this Court has maintained a distinction between a document which has been relied upon by the detaining authority in the grounds of detention and a document which finds a mere reference in the grounds of detention. Whereas the non-supply of a copy of the document relied upon in the grounds of detention has been held to be fatal to continued detention, the detenu need not show that any prejudice is caused to him. This is because the non-supply of



such a document would amount to denial of the right of being communicated the grounds and of being afforded the opportunity of making an effective representation against the order. But it would not be so where the document merely finds a reference in the order of detention or among the grounds thereof. In such a case, the detenu's complaint of non-supply of document has to be supported by prejudice caused to him in making an effective representation. What applies to a document would equally apply to furnishing a translated copy of the document in the language known to and understood by the detenu, should the document be in a different language.

.....

16.For the above reasons, in our view, the non-supply of the Tamil version of the English document, on the facts and in the circumstances, renders her continued detention illegal. We, therefore, direct that the detenue be set free forthwith unless she is required to be detained in any other case. The appeal is accordingly allowed.”

6.Thus, the detention order is vitiated on the ground of improper translation of the Remand Extension Order and hence, the same is liable to be quashed.



H.C.P.No.2406 of 2023

WEB COPY

7. Accordingly, the detention order passed by the 2nd respondent dated 31.10.2023 in No. 226/BCDFGISSSV/2023, is hereby set aside and the Habeas Corpus Petition is allowed. The detenu viz., Buvaneswaran, S/o.Sando, aged about 31 years, is directed to be set at liberty forthwith unless he is required in connection with any other case.

(M.S.R., J.) (S.M., J.)
11.03.2024

bga

Internet : Yes

Index : Yes / No

Neutral Citation : Yes / No



H.C.P.No.2406 of 2023

To

WEB COPY

- 1.The Additional Chief Secretary to Government,
Home, Prohibition, Excise Department,
St.George Fort, Chennai - 600 009.
- 2.The Commissioner of Police,
Avadi Commissioner of Police, Avadi.
- 3.The Superintendent of Police,
Central Prison, Puzhal, Chennai 600 066
- 4.The Inspector of Police,
M-7, Manali New Town Police Station,
Chennai.
- 5.The Public Prosecutor,
High Court, Madras.
6. The Joint Secretary,
Law and Order Department,
Secretariat, Chennai.



WEB COPY



H.C.P.No.2406 of 2023

M.S.RAMESH, J.
and
SUNDER MOHAN, J.

bga

H.C.P.No.2406 of 2023

11.03.2024