



WEB COPY



W.P.No.21844 of 2018

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED : 15.02.2024

CORAM

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE BATTU DEVANAND

W.P.No.21844 of 2018
and WMP.No.25619 of 2017

K.Krishnasamy

... Petitioner

Vs.

1.The Regional Accounts Officer (Audit)
Department of School Education
Coimbatore – 641 001.

2.The Director
Directorate of School Education
Chennai – 600 006.

3.The Chief Educational Officer,
Erode, Erode District.

4.The Headmaster,
Government High School,
Kaspapettai,
Modakkurichi,
Erode District.

5.The Registrar
Vinayaka Missions University
Salem – 636 308.

6.The Secretary,
University Grants Commission,
New Delhi – 110 002.

... Respondents



W.P.No.21844 of 2018

Prayer : Writ petition is filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India for issuance of a Writ of Certiorarified Mandamus to call for the records relating to the impugned order dated 22.03.2018 made in Na.Ka.No.357/E6/2018 passed by the 1st respondent, quash the same, consequently direct the respondents 1 to 4 to continue the payment of incentive for qualifying M.Phil degree granted by the 5th respondent and pass such further or suitable orders.

For Petitioner : Mr.N.Manokaran

For Respondents : Mr.L.S.M.Hasan Fizal, AGP for R1 to R4.
Mr.Saravanan for R5.
Mr.P.R.Gopinathan for R6.

ORDER

Heard the learned counsel for the petitioner and the learned Additional Government Pleader for first respondent, learned standing counsel for respondents 5 & 6 and perused the materials available on record.

2. The case of the petitioner is that he was appointed as B.T.Assistant and joined duty on 28.10.2005 at Panchayat Union Middle School, Minnappalayam, Erode District. After appointment, the petitioner obtained permission from the department and completed M.Phil degree on 30.06.2008. Thereafter, he was sanctioned with incentive for passing M.Phil w.e.f. 01.06.2008 and another one incentive for passing M.Sc., degree on 14.05.2014.



WEB COPY

3. After sometime, when internal Audit was conducted and in the auditing raised an objection against sanctioning of incentive increment granted to the petitioner for acquiring M.Phil degree from the year 2008, on the ground that the M.Phil degree obtained from the Vinayaka Missions University is not valid. Accordingly, the first respondent issued the impugned proceedings in Na.Ka.No.357/E6/2018 dated 22.03.2018 to recover the incentive increment granted in favour of the petitioner for the period from 2015-2016 and 2016-2017 by calling upon the petitioner to remit the same in Government account immediately.

4. No counter affidavit has been filed by the respondents.

5. The learned counsel for the petitioner submits that the Vinayaka Missions University is part of the Vinayaka Missions Research Foundation, Salem was considered to be deemed to be University and approval given by the UGC. As such, the M.Phil degree obtained by the petitioner from the said University is valid and legal. The learned counsel further contends that the petitioner completed the M.Phil degree course at Vinayaka Missions University in the year 2008. The duration of the said course is one year. At the relevant point of time, from 2007-2012 the University was given institution wise recognition. As such, the M.Phil degree obtained by the



W.P.No.21844 of 2018

petitioner is valid.

WEB COPY

6. The learned counsel for the petitioner further contends that the doubt that has arisen by auditing which has been shown as the reason that the petitioner had obtained the M.Phil degree from Vinayaka Missions University cannot be a valid degree and the incentive increment granted in favour of the petitioner has been stopped and the amount proposed to be recovered cannot have any legal backing, in view of the notification issued by the Government of India which has been published in the Gazettee of India dated 08.04.1995.

7. The learned Additional Government Pleader submits that while the pay of the petitioner refixed after sanction of the incentive increment by the 4th respondent. As the 1st respondent raised his objection stating that the petitioner is not eligible for getting incentive increment for acquiring M.Phil degree qualification in Vinayaka Missions Deemed University, Salem through distance education and the excess pay drawn by the petitioner has to be remitted in the Government account. To implement the audit objection the 1st respondent issued proceedings vide Na.ka.No.357/E6/2018 dated 22.03.2018 to remit the amount for the years 2015-2016 and 2016-2017 sanctioned towards incentive amount granted to the petitioner for having possessed M.Phil degree. Instead of remitting the excess amount drawn,



the petitioner has approached this Court and obtained the interim stay order for recovery of the said amount. In order to rectify the Audit objection, the 1st respondent issued impugned order insisting the petitioner to remit the over payment amount to the Government.

8. Having considered the averments of the learned counsel on either side and after perusing the impugned order, it appears that the auditing has raised the objection that the M.Phil degree possessed by the petitioner from the Vinayaka Missions University cannot be an approved degree and it cannot be accepted as valid degree for the purpose of awarding any advance incentive increment. To implement the audit objections, the 1st respondent issued an order dated 22.03.2018, directing the petitioner to remit the said amount to the Government account.

9. The learned counsel for the petitioner had drawn the attention of this Court to the common judgment dated **04.08.2023** in **WA.No.2328 of 2018 & batch**, contending that the issue raised in the present writ petition has already been decided by the Division Bench of this Court.

10. The Division Bench while allowing the batch of writ appeals in identical circumstances, taken into consideration the notification issued by the Government



Of India which has been published in Gazettee of India dated 08.04.1995 and notification issued by the Government of India on 19.08.2004, wherein the Vinayaka Missions University part of Vinayaka Mission's Research Foundation, Salem was considered to be deemed to be University and as such, the approval given by the UGC has been made clear in this proceedings.

11. The relevant paragraph 35 of the judgment is extracted hereinunder :-

“35. In the result, the following orders are passed in these writ appeals :-

That the impugned order passed by the writ Court dated 06.09.2018 is set aside. As a sequel, the impugned order that was challenged before the Writ Court in the respective petitions is also set aside to the extent that those teachers who had studied in the Vinayaka Missions-s University during the relevant point of time i.e., 2007 to 2009 since had acquired the qualification during the period which the University also enjoyed the approval or recognition from the DEC, IGNO, the said objection raised by the audit Department would not be sustained. Therefore, on that ground, the incentive increment already allowed to these teachers need not be disturbed. If the increment already been allowed to these teachers have been cancelled or stopped by virtue of the order, which is impugned herein, the same shall be restored and the arrears to that effect shall



W.P.No.21844 of 2018

WEB COPY

be calculated and be paid to the teachers/appellants. To that extent, all these writ appeals are allowed. No costs. Connected miscellaneous petitions are closed.”

12. In the present case also, the petitioner had studied in the Vinayaka Missions University during the relevant point of time and had acquired M.Phil degree. As such, the order of the Division Bench is squarely applicable to the facts of the present case and the objections raised by the Audit department would not sustain. Accordingly, the order impugned in this writ petition also would not sustain and it is liable to be set aside.

13. For the reasons stated above, this writ petition is allowed with the following directions :-

(i) The impugned order in Na.Ka.No.357/E6/2018 dated 22.03.2018 issued by the 1st respondent is hereby set aside.

(ii) If the increment already been sanctioned to the petitioner has been cancelled or stopped by virtue of the impugned order and arrears to that effect shall be calculated and be paid to the petitioner.

14. There shall be no order as to costs.

15. Consequently, connected miscellaneous petition is closed.

15.02.2024

Index :Yes/No



W.P.No.21844 of 2016

Neutral Citation :Yes/No
tsh

WEB COPY

To

1.The Regional Accounts Officer (Audit)
Department of School Education
Coimbatore – 641 001.

2.The Director
Directorate of School Education
Chennai – 600 006.

3.The Chief Educational Officer,
Erode, Erode District.

3.The Chief Educational Officer,
Erode, Erode District.

4.The Headmaster,
Government High School,
Kasphapettai, Modakkurichi,
Erode District.

5.The Registrar
Vinayaka Missions University
Salem – 636 308.

6.The Secretary,
University Grants Commission,
New Delhi – 110 002.



WEB COPY



W.P.No.21844 of 2018

BATTU DEVANAND, J.

tsh

W.P.No.21844 of 2018

15.02.2024