



WEB COPY

W.P.No.3059 of 2024

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED: 12.02.2024

CORAM :

THE HONOURABLE DR.JUSTICE ANITA SUMANTH

W.P.No.3059 of 2024
and
W.M.P.No.3343 of 2024

- 1.Dr.N.Prasath Kumaran
- 2.Dr.G.Ranganathan
- 3.Dr.Mithuna Pranav J.
- 4.Dr.R.Raja Meena
- 5.Dr.P.Manisha

.. Petitioners

VS

- 1.The State of Tamil nadu
Rep. by its Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai - 600 009.
- 2.Directorate of Medical Education,
Rep. by its Director of Medical Education,
Kilpauk, Chennai - 600 010.
- 3.Directorate of Medical and Rural Health Services,
Rep. by the Director of Medical Health and
Rural Health Services,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 600 006.
- 4.Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
Rep. by the Director of Public Health and
Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 600 006.
- 5.The Joint Director of Health Services,
Villupuram.
- 6.The Deputy Director of Health Services,
Virudhunagar.



W.P.No.3059 of 2024

7.The Joint Director of Health Services,
Chengalpet.

8.Government Thiruvallur Medical College,
Rep. by its Dean,
JN Road, Periyakuppam,
Thiruvallur - 602 001.

9.Government Stanely Medical College,
Rep. by its Dean,
No.1, Old Jail Road,
Chennai - 600 001.

.. Respondents

Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying to issue a writ of mandamus directing the respondents to treat the petitioners' two-year compulsory bond period as completed, and to consequently direct the respondent nos. 2 to 8 to relieve the petitioner nos. 2 to 5 from the bonded service and to direct the respondent no.8 and 9 to return the petitioners' original certificates and documents collected by the 9th respondent while admitting the petitioners to the post graduate degree course along with their Post Graduate degree certificate.

For Petitioner : Mr.Suhrith Parthasarathy

For Respondents : Mr.G.Ameedius
Government Advocate

ORDER

W.M.P.No.3342 of 2024 is ordered on payment of a separate court fee, if not already paid.

2. Mr.G.Ameedius, learned Government Advocate, accepts notice for the respondents and is armed with instructions to enable final disposal of the matter, even at this juncture. Hence, by consent of both learned counsel, these Writ Petitions are taken up



W.P.No.3059 of 2024

for final disposal, even at the stage of admission.

WEB COPY

3. I have considered an identical prayer as in the present

Writ Petitions in W.P.No.28238 of 2023 and have held as follows:

"The petitioner is a Doctor, who had completed Post Graduation in General Medicine from KAP Viswanathan Medical College in the non service category. He had completed the course in May, 2022 and had, at the time of admission to the course, executed a bond for a sum of Rs.40 lakhs undertaking that he would serve the State for a period of two years after completion of the course. The bond period, admittedly, runs till 31.05.2024.

2. Within a few months of commencing the course, the Covid 19 pandemic had struck and the petitioner, and, in fact several other identically / similarly placed candidates, were required to be on covid duty in R5 Hospital. Though no appointment orders could be issued seeing as the petitioner was a student then, his services during the covid period is not disputed as duty sheets for the service rendered have duly been produced by the petitioner and verified by the respondent counsel.

3. The question as to whether covid duty would constitute in-bond service is no longer res integra having been considered and accepted by two learned Judges in W.P.No.26556 of 2022 (decision dated 02.02.2023) and W.P.No.22894 of 2023 (decision dated 08.09.2023). In these cases, the petitioners were students who were required to perform covid duty during their course and this Court has held, and I concur with these decisions, that the covid duty rendered by the students should be taken note of as service during the bond period.

4. An additional question that arises in this



WEB COPY



W.P.No.3059 of 2024

case is as to whether quarantine relatable to covid period is also be taken as bond service. The period of quarantine is, in my considered view, nothing but an extension of covid duty itself as the Rules prevalent then required mandatory quarantine. The petitioner would well have continued with the duty in the covid ward itself has it not been for the mandate of compulsory quarantine. Thus, taking the period of quarantine also as on-duty, such period in this case is quantified as 150 days. On-duty call sheets duly signed by the Dean of R5 college have been produced by the petitioner. This will advance the closure of bond period to 02.01.2024 from 31.05.2024.

5. The petitioner's request for a mandamus directing the respondents to treat compulsory bond period as concluding on 02.01.2024 is accepted. R5 is directed, upon completion of bond period on 02.01.2024, to return to the petitioner, his original certificates received at the time of admission to PG course.

6. Allowed in the above terms. No costs. Connected miscellaneous petition is closed."

4. Yet another development has been noted by me in W.P.Nos.32073, 33124, 32505, 32512, 29724 and 32380 of 2023 to following effect:-

"The issue of treating Covid duty as period of duty for the purpose of computing of bond service now stands settled categorically by virtue of an order passed by the First Bench in W.P.Nos.25827, 25785 and 27568 of 2023, decided on 16.11.2023.

2. Those Writ Petitions relate to the recruitment of Assistant Surgeons. In the course of the discussion, the First Bench has settled the position that, both for the purpose of Under Graduate (UG) as well as Post Graduate (PG) medical education, the duties performed during covid period/treating



WEB COPY



W.P.No.3059 of 2024

covid patients should be treated as eligible duty.

3. The discussion from paragraph 7 onwards is clear to this effect and reads as follows:

7. It is true that the services rendered by the Post-Graduate students is part of their 36 months period training which they undergo. The said period is supposed to be the practical training towards the subject in which they undergo the study. Because of the abnormal situation arising out of the COVID - 19 pandemic, they were also roped in COVID - 19 duty in the COVID - 19 wards in the Government Hospitals. It is not in dispute that they put in the same kind of duty and underwent the same rigors as that of the other medical officers recruited by the State Government. As a matter of fact, the persons, who were recruited by the State Government for the said purpose of performing COVID - 19 duty in these wards which are set up as part of the disaster management, are categorised as 'Medical Officers'.

7.1. It may be seen that both these temporary appointees as well as the Post-Graduate medical students are registered medical practitioners eligible to be appointed as Assistant Surgeons. Service to the Health Department, Government of Tamil nadu is governed by the Statutory Rules known as Tamil Nadu Medical Service Rules. It contains two parts namely, Branch-I Medical and Branch-II Nursing. As far as the medical cadre is concerned, as per Rule 2, it is divided into Civil Surgeon cadre and Assistant Surgeon cadre. All the entry level posts of Assistant Surgeon in the general line, Non-Clinical Lectures, Tutors / Assistant Professors, Clinical Lecturers, Senior Residents / Assistant



WEB COPY



W.P.No.3059 of 2024

Professors and the Women State Family Planning Officer are all grouped under the cadre of Assistant Surgeon. Thus, it can be seen that there is no such post as such called 'Medical Officer'. But, the term 'Medical Officer' is widely used in the rules to denote every registered medical practitioner appointed to any post. When it comes to deputing personnel for the Chennai City Police, they are called Medical Officers to the Chennai City Police. The Senior Residents are also termed as 'Resident Medical Officers' Similarly, the term 'Medical Officer' is generally used in the context of referring to the person who is working in any capacity with the qualified medical degree (in common parlance, the Doctors working in the department).

4. Thus, the submission of the respondents to the effect that PG students were only been given 'training' and that such service must be disregarded for computation of duty/bond period cannot be accepted. In light of the decision of the First Bench cited supra affirming the principle that the duty performed by PG students during Covid period must be taken as regular medical service.

5. The State has now issued G.O.Ms.No.371 dated 18.11.2023 directing that the term 'Medical Officers' mentioned at Para 5.1(i) of G.O.(MS.) No.278, Health and Family Welfare (B1) Department dated 17.08.2023 be replaced as 'Medical Officers including Post Graduate Students'. The authorities have been directed to issue certificates confirming the number of days when covid duty was performed by the students.

6. In light of the above, let such certificates be issued to the petitioners at least two days prior to the next date of hearing. List on 05.12.2023. Written instructions/counter, if any, by then with an advance copy to the petitioners."



W.P.No.3059 of 2024

5. The petitioners have received and have placed on record covid duty certificates in terms of G.O.Ms.No.371 dated 18.11.2023 and G.O.(MS.) No.278 dated 17.08.2023. The details of the post-graduation courses completed by the petitioners and the number of days of covid duty rendered by the petitioners as per the certificates issued by the respondents, are as follows:

S.No	PETITIONER S' NAME	PG in :	PG COURSE	DURATION OF COVID-19 DUTY	Date of Posting Order	PLACE OF POSTING	DURATION OF BOND DUTY
1	Dr.N.Prasath Kumaran	Stanley Medical College (Respondent no.9)	MD Anesthesiology	22.06.2020 to 31.05.2022 (1 year, 11 months, 10 days)	11.10.2023	Government Medical College, The Nilgiris	Not joined
2	Dr.G.Ranganathan	Stanley Medical College (Respondent no.9)	MD Anesthesiology	04.08.2020 to 31.05.2022 (1 year, 9 months, 28 days)	15.10.2023	Government Tiruvallur Medical College	01.11.2023 to 12.02.2024
3	Dr.Mithuna Pranav J.	Stanley Medical College (Respondent no.9)	MD Anesthesiology	01.06.2020 to 31.05.2022 (2 years)	21.10.2023	Government Hospital, Gingee, Villupuram	06.11.2023 to 12.02.2024
4	Dr.R.Raja Meena	Stanley Medical College (Respondent no.9)	MD Respiratory Medicine	30.07.2020 to January, 2022 (1 year, 6 months, 2 days)	26.11.2023	Government Primary Health Centre, Mallankinar, Virudhunagar	25.10.2023 to 12.02.2024
5	Dr.P.Manisha	Stanley Medical College (Respondent no.9)	MD Anesthesiology	24.06.2020 to 31.05.2022 (1 year 11 months 8 days)	11.10.2023	Government Hospital, Maduranthagam, Chengalpeta	27.10.2023 to 01.12.2023

6. Mr.G.Ameedius, learned Government Advocate for the respondents would categorically confirm that the particulars as set out in the tabulation above have been verified with the authorities to be correct and representing the proper sequence of events.

7. The petitioners have produced covid duty certificates issued by their respective Heads of Department Anaesthesiology



W.P.No.3059 of 2024

and Thoracic Medicine. This aspect was specifically brought to the notice of learned Government Advocate, who would concur on the position that it would suffice that the covid duty certificate be issued by the Head of the Department and not necessarily by the Dean of the respective colleges. This is recorded. The Health and Family Welfare (MCA-1) Department vide G.O.Ms.No.17 dated 11.01.2024 has issued an order to the effect that the bond period for Non Service Post Graduates (Degree/Diploma) who have completed their Post Graduate courses in the year 2022 will be reduced from two years to one year. The benefit of this reduction is thus available to the present petitioners as they have all rendered covid duty in excess of one year.

8. In addition, all the petitioners, barring Dr.N.Prasath Kumaran and Dr.P.Manisha, are stated to be rendering regular service now. In fact, thus, seen from any angle, the petitioners have served in excess of the requirement of one year as per Government Order dated 27.10.2023.

9. The petitioners are hence released from bonded Government service and there is a direction to the Deans of their respective colleges, all arrayed as respondents, to return their original certificates when the petitioners presents themselves before them, forthwith.



W.P.No.3059 of 2024

10. This Writ Petition disposed in the aforesaid terms. No costs. Connected miscellaneous petition is closed.

12.02.2024

Index:Yes/No

Neutral Citation:Yes

ssm

To

- 1.The Principal Secretary,
The State of Tamil nadu
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai - 600 009.
- 2.The Director of Medical Education,
Directorate of Medical Education,
Kilpauk, Chennai - 600 010.
- 3.The Director of Medical Health and Rural Health Services,
Directorate of Medical and Rural Health Services,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 600 006.
- 4.The Director of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 600 006.
- 5.The Joint Director of Health Services,
Villupuram.
- 6.The Deputy Director of Health Services,
Virudhunagar.
- 7.The Joint Director of Health Services,
Chengalpet.



WEB COPY



W.P.No.3059 of 2024

DR. ANITA SUMANTH,J.

ssm

8.The Dean,
Government Thiruvallur Medical College,
JN Road, Periyakuppam,
Thiruvallur - 602 001.

9.The Dean,
Government Stanely Medical College,
No.1, Old Jail Road,
Chennai - 600 001.

W.P.No.3059 of 2024

12.02.2024