



WEB COPY

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

Dated: 02.02.2024

CORAM

THE HONOURABLE **DR. JUSTICE ANITA SUMANTH**

W.P.Nos.2364 & 2369 of 2024
and W.M.P.Nos.2555 & 2566 of 2024

W.P.No.2364 of 2024

- 1.Dr.Manar Moideen
- 2.Dr.Arsha A.Shan
- 3.Dr.Mohsina Sharafudeen
- 4.Dr.Shaheer Shahul Hameed

... Petitioners

vs

- 1.The State of Tamil Nadu
Rep. by its Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai - 600 009.
- 2.Directorate of Medical Education,
Rep. by its Director of Medical Education,
Kilpauk, Chennai - 600 010.
- 3.Directorate of Medical and Rural Health Services,
Rep. by its Director of Medical Health and Rural Health Services,
359, Anna Salaia, Chennai - 600 006.
- 4.Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
Rep. by its Director of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 600 006.
- 5.The Joint Director of Health Service
Thoothukudi & Kanyakumari



WEB COPY

6.The Joint Director of Health Services
Ramanathapuram.

7.Government Kilpauk Medical College & Hospital
Represented by its Dean
Poonamalee High Road, Kilpauk,
Chennai-600 010.

8.Government Medical College, Karur
Represented by its Dean
Gandhigramam, Karur – 639 004.

9.Government Thoothukudi Medical College
Represented by its Dean
Kamaraj Nagar, 3rd Mile,
Thoothukudi – 628 008.

10.Government Theni Medical College
Represented by its Dean
Kochi-Madurai-Tondi Point Rd.,
Kanavilakku, Theni-625 531.

11.Madurai Medical College
Represented by its Dean
Panagal Road, Alwarpuram,
Madurai-625 050.

.... Respondents

PRAYER: Writ Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying to issue a Writ of Mandamus directing the Respondents to treat the Petitioners' two-year compulsory bond period as completed, and to consequently direct the Respondent Nos. 2 to 8 to relieve the Petitioners from the bonded service and to direct the Respondent Nos. 7 to 11 to return the Petitioners' original certificates and documents collected by the Respondent Nos. 9 to 11



while admitting the Petitioners to the post graduate degree course along with their Post Graduate degree certificate.

WEB COPY

AND

W.P.No.2369 of 2024

1.Dr. Madhuri R.A.

2.Dr.Arya A.R.

.... Petitioners

VS

1.The State of Tamil Nadu

Rep. by its Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai - 600 009.

2.Directorate of Medical Education,

Rep. by its Director of Medical Education,
Kilpauk, Chennai - 600 010.

3.Directorate of Medical and Rural Health Services,

Rep. by its Director of Medical Health and Rural Health Services,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 600 006.

4.Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,

Rep. by its Director of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 600 006.

5.Government Medical College & Hospita, Thiruvallur,

Rep. by its Dean,
JN Road, Periyakuppam, Thiruvallur-602 001

6.The Joint Director of Health Services,

Tenkasi.

7.Kilpauk Medical College

Represented by its Dean



Poonamalee High Road, Kilpauk,
Chennai-600 010.

8. Madurai Medical College
Represented by its Dean
Panagal Road, Alwarpuram,
Madurai-625 050.

... Respondents

PRAYER: Writ Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying to issue a Writ of Mandamus directing the Respondents to treat the Petitioners' two-year compulsory bond period as completed, and to consequently direct the Respondent Nos. 2 to 6 to relieve the Petitioners from the bonded service and direct the Respondent Nos. 5, 7 and 8 to return the Petitioners' original certificates and documents collected by the Respondent Nos. 7 and 8 while admitting the Petitioners to the post graduate degree course along with their Post Graduate degree certificate.

In both writ petitions

For Petitioners : Mr.Suhrith Parthasarathy

For Respondents : Mr.A.Anandan,
Government Advocate

COMMON ORDER

WMP Nos.2554 and 2565 of 2024 filed seeking permission to file a single Writ Petition is ordered on payment of separate Court fee.

2. Mr.A.Anandan, learned Government Advocate accepts notice for the respondents and is armed with instructions to enable final disposal of the matter,



even at this juncture. Hence, by consent of both learned counsel, these Writ

Petitions are taken up for final disposal, even at the stage of admission.

WEB COPY

3. I have considered an identical prayer as in the present Writ Petitions in

W.P.No.28238 of 2023 and have held as follows:

The petitioner is a Doctor, who had completed Post Graduation in General Medicine from KAP Viswanathan Medical College in the non service category. He had completed the course in May, 2022 and had, at the time of admission to the course, executed a bond for a sum of Rs.40 lakhs undertaking that he would serve the State for a period of two years after completion of the course. The bond period, admittedly, runs till 31.05.2024.

2. *Within a few months of commencing the course, the Covid 19 pandemic had struck and the petitioner, and, in fact several other identically / similarly placed candidates, were required to be on covid duty in R5 Hospital. Though no appointment orders could be issued seeing as the petitioner was a student then, his services during the covid period is not disputed as duty sheets for the service rendered have duly been produced by the petitioner and verified by the respondent counsel.*

3. *The question as to whether covid duty would constitute in-bond service is no longer res integra having been considered and accepted by two learned Judges in W.P.No.26556 of 2022 (decision dated 02.02.2023) and W.P.No.22894 of 2023 (decision dated 08.09.2023). In these cases, the petitioners were students who were required to perform covid duty during their course and this Court has held, and I concur with these decisions, that the covid duty rendered by the students should be taken note of as service during the bond period.*



WEB COPY

4. *An additional question that arises in this case is as to whether quarantine relatable to covid period is also be taken as bond service. The period of quarantine is, in my considered view, nothing but an extension of covid duty itself as the Rules prevalent then required mandatory quarantine. The petitioner would well have continued with the duty in the covid ward itself has it not been for the mandate of compulsory quarantine. Thus, taking the period of quarantine also as on-duty, such period in this case is quantified as 150 days. On-duty call sheets duly signed by the Dean of R5 college have been produced by the petitioner. This will advance the closure of bond period to 02.01.2024 from 31.05.2024.*

5. *The petitioner's request for a mandamus directing the respondents to treat compulsory bond period as concluding on 02.01.2024 is accepted. R5 is directed, upon completion of bond period on 02.01.2024, to return to the petitioner, his original certificates received at the time of admission to PG course.*

6. *Allowed in the above terms. No costs. Connected miscellaneous petition is closed.*

4. Yet another development has been noted by me in W.P.Nos.32073, 33124, 32505, 32512, 29724 and 32380 of 2023 to following effect:

The issue of treating Covid duty as period of duty for the purpose of computing of bond service now stands settled categorically by virtue of an order passed by the First Bench in W.P.Nos.25827, 25785 and 27568 of 2023, decided on 16.11.2023.

2. *Those Writ Petitions relate to the recruitment of Assistant Surgeons. In the course of the discussion, the First Bench has settled the position that, both for the purpose of Under Graduate (UG) as well as Post Graduate (PG) medical education, the duties performed during covid*



WEB COPY



period/treating covid patients should be treated as eligible duty.

3. The discussion from paragraph 7 onwards is clear to this effect and reads as follows:

7. It is true that the services rendered by the Post~Graduate students is part of their 36 months period training which they undergo. The said period is supposed to be the practical training towards the subject in which they undergo the study. Because of the abnormal situation arising out of the COVID - 19 pandemic, they were also roped in COVID 19 duty in the COVID ~ 19 wards in the Government Hospitals. It is not in dispute that they put in the same kind of duty and underwent the same rigors as that of the other medical officers recruited by the State Government. As a matter of fact, the persons, who were recruited by the State Government for the said purpose of performing COVID - 19 duty in these wards which are set up as part of the disaster management, are categorised as Medical Officers.

7.1. It may be seen that both these temporary appointees as well as the Post~Graduate medical students are registered medical practitioners eligible to be appointed as Assistant Surgeons. Service to the Health Department, Government of Tamil nadu is governed by the Statutory Rules known as Tamil Nadu Medical Service Rules. It contains two parts namely, Branch~I Medical and Branch~II Nursing. As far as the medical cadre is concerned, as per Rule 2, it is divided into Civil Surgeon cadre and Assistant Surgeon cadre. All the entry level posts of Assistant Surgeon in the general line, Non~Clinical Lectures, Tutors /



WEB COPY



Assistant Professors, Clinical Lecturers, Senior Residents / Assistant Professors and the Women State Family Planning Officer are all grouped under the cadre of Assistant Surgeon. Thus, it can be seen that there is no such post as such called ?Medical Officer. But, the term Medical Officer is widely used in the rules to denote every registered medical practitioner appointed to any post. When it comes to deputing personnel for the Chennai City Police, they are called Medical Officers to the Chennai City Police. The Senior Residents are also termed as Resident Medical Officers. Similarly, the term Medical Officer is generally used in the context of referring to the person who is working in any capacity with the qualified medical degree (in common parlance, the Doctors working in the department).

4. Thus, the submission of the respondents to the effect that PG students were only been given 'training' and that such service must be disregarded for computation of duty/bond period cannot be accepted. In light of the decision of the First Bench cited supra affirming the principle that the duty performed by PG students during Covid period must be taken as regular medical service.

5. The State has now issued G.O.Ms.No.371 dated 18.11.2023 directing that the term 'Medical Officers' mentioned at Para 5.1(i) of G.O.(MS.) No.278, Health and Family Welfare (B1) Department dated 17.08.2023 be replaced as 'Medical Officers including Post Graduate Students'. The authorities have been directed to issue certificates confirming the number of days when covid duty was performed by the students.

6. In light of the above, let such certificates be issued to the petitioners at least two days prior to the next date of hearing. List on 05.12.2023. Written instructions/counter, if any, by then with an advance copy to the petitioners.



5. The petitioners have received covid duty certificates in terms of G.O.Ms.No.371 dated 18.11.2023 and G.O.(MS.) No.278 dated 17.08.2023.

The details of the post-graduation courses completed by the petitioners and the number of days of covid duty rendered by the petitioners as per the certificates issued by the respondents, are as follows:

W.P.No	PETITIONERS' NAME	PG IN:	DM/M.CH/PG COURSE	DURATION OF COVID-19 DUTY	DATE OF POSTING ORDER	PLACE OF POSTING	DURATION OF BOND DUTY
2364 of 2024	Dr.Manar Moideen	Government Thoothukudi Medical College (June 2020 to June 2023)	MS Orthopaedics	29.06.2020 to 04.05.2023 (2 years, 10 months & 6 days)	11.10.2023	Government Kilpauk Medical College & Hospital	03.11.2023 to 02.02.2024
	Dr.Arsha A.Shan	Government Thoothukudi Medical College (June 2020 to June 2023)	MS General Surgery	29.06.2020 to 04.05.2023 (2 years, 10 months & 6 days)	15.11.2023	Government Headquarters Hospital, Padmanabapuram, Kanyakumari	21.11.2023 to 02.02.2024
	Dr.Mohsina Sharafudeen	Government Theni Medical College (June 2020 to June 2023)	MS Obstetrics & Gynecology	29.06.2020 to 04.05.2023 (2 years, 10 months & 6 days)	20.10.2023	Government Medical College, Karur	01.11.2023 to 20.11.2023
	Dr.Shaheer Shahul Hameed	Madurai Medical College (June 2020 to June 2023)	MS Orthopaedics	01.06.2020 to 04.05.2023 (2 years, 11 months & 4 days)	11.10.2023	Government Hospital, Kamuthi, Ramanatha-puram	21.10.2023 to 02.02.2024
2369 of 2024	Dr.Madhuri R.A.	Kilpauk Medical College	MS Obstetrics and Gynaecology	24.03.2020 to 30.04.2022 (2 years &	07.07.2022	Government Medical College & Hospital, Thiruvallur	21.07.2022 to 20.01.2023



W.P.N o	PETITIONERS' NAME	PG IN:	DM/M.CH/PG COURSE	DURATION OF COVID- 19 DUTY	DATE OF POSTING ORDER	PLACE OF POSTING	DURATION OF BOND DUTY
		(May 2019 to April 2022)		37 days)			
	Dr.Arya A.R.	Madurai Medical College (May 2019 to April 2022)	MS Ophthalmology	11.03.2020 to 30.04.2020 (2 years, 1 month & 20 days)	16.02.2023	Government Hospital, Sivagiri, Tenkasi District	13.03.2023 to 02.10.2023

6. Mr.A.Anandan, learned Government Advocate would categorically confirm that the particulars as set out in the tabulation above have been verified with the authorities to be correct and representing the proper sequence of events.

7. The petitioners had completed their courses in April, 2022 and June, 2023 respectively. They have received posting orders on belatedly and as per the decision of the First Bench of this Court in *State of Tamil Nadu vs P.S.Sairam and others* (2020) 7 Madras LJ 513, the posting orders are to run co-terminus with the period of successful completion of course of the candidate.

8. That apart, the Health and Family Welfare (MCA-1) Department vide G.O.Ms.No.17 dated 11.01.2024 and G.O.Ms.No.351 dated 27.10.2023 has issued an order to the effect that the bond period for Non Service Post Graduates (Degree/Diploma) who have completed their Post Graduate courses in the year



2022 and 2023 respectively will be reduced from two years to one year. The benefit of this reduction is thus available to the present petitioners.

WEB COPY

9. In light of the above, nothing stands in the way of the petitioners being given the benefit of mandamus as sought, to treat the two year compulsory bond period as completed. In fact, in all the cases, they have rendered covid duty service in excess of the two years provided for under the Bond. In addition, they have also rendered regular duty service over and above what was required by them. Thus, seen from any angle, the petitioners have served far in excess of the requirement of one year as per Government Orders dated 27.10.2023 and 11.01.2024 and are entitled to the return of the certificates as sought for. .

10. The petitioners are hence released from bonded Government service and there is a direction to the Dean of respective colleges all arrayed as respondents to return their original certificates when the petitioners present themselves before them, forthwith.

11. These Writ Petitions are disposed in the aforesaid terms. No costs. Connected Miscellaneous Petitions are closed.

02.02.2024

Index : Yes/No

Speaking Order:Yes

Neutral Citation:Yes

sl



WEB COPY

- 1.The State of Tamil Nadu
Rep. by its Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai - 600 009.
- 2.Directorate of Medical Education,
Rep. by its Director of Medical Education,
Kilpauk, Chennai - 600 010.
- 3.Directorate of Medical and Rural Health Services,
Rep. by its Director of Medical Health and Rural Health Services,
359, Anna Salaia, Chennai - 600 006.
- 4.Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
Rep. by its Director of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 600 006.
- 5.The Joint Director of Health Service
Thoothukudi & Kanyakumari
- 6.The Joint Director of Health Services
Ramanathapuram.
- 7.Government Kilpauk Medical College & Hospital
Represented by its Dean
Poonamalee High Road, Kilpauk,
Chennai-600 010.
- 8.Government Medical College, Karur
Represented by its Dean
Gandhigramam, Karur – 639 004.
- 9.Government Thoothukudi Medical College
Represented by its Dean



Kamaraj Nagar, 3rd Mile,
Thoothukudi – 628 008.

WEB

10. Government Theni Medical College

Represented by its Dean
Kochi-Madurai-Tondi Point Rd.,
Kanavilakku, Theni-625 531.

11. Madurai Medical College

Represented by its Dean
Panagal Road, Alwarpuram,
Madurai-625 050.

12. Government Medical College & Hospita, Thiruvallur,

Rep. by its Dean,
JN Road, Periyakuppam, Thiruvallur-602 001

13. The Joint Director of Health Services,

Tenkasi.



WEB COPY

W.P.Nos.2364 & 2369 of



DR.ANITA SUMANTH, J.

sl

W.P.Nos.2364 & 2369 of 2024
and
W.M.P.Nos.2555 & 2566 of 2024

02.02.2024