



WEB COPY

W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED: 08.02.2024

CORAM :

THE HONOURABLE DR.JUSTICE ANITA SUMANTH

W.P.Nos.2750, 2753, 2761 & 2765 of 2024

W.P.No.2750 of 2024

Dr.B.Aashika

.. Petitioner

VS

- 1.The State of Tamil Nadu
Rep. by its Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai - 09.
 - 2.Directorate of Medical Education and Research,
Rep. by the Director of Medical Education and Research,
Kilpauk, Chennai - 10.
 - 3.Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
Rep. by its Director of Public Health and
Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 06.
 - 4.Tamil Nadu Medical Services Corporation Limited,
Rep. by its Chairman,
No.417, Pantheon Road, Egmore,
Chennai - 600 008.
 - 5.Tirunelveli Medical College,
Rep. by its Dean,
High Ground, Tirunelveli - 627 011.
 - 6.Government Headquarters Hospital,
Rep. by Joint Director of Health Service,
Aruppukotai, Virudhunagar.
- .. Respondents



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

W.P.No.2753 of 2024

Dr.D.Sowmiya

.. Petitioner

VS

- 1.The State of Tamil Nadu
Rep. by its Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai - 09.
- 2.Directorate of Medical Education and Research,
Rep. by the Director of Medical Education and Research,
Kilpauk, Chennai - 10.
- 3.Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
Rep. by its Director of Public Health and
Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 06.
- 4.Tamil Nadu Medical Services Corporation Limited,
Rep. by its Chairman,
No.417, Pantheon Road, Egmore,
Chennai - 600 008.
- 5.Government Kilpauk Medical College,
Rep. by its Dean,
Chennai - 600 010.
- 6.Government Medical Hospital,
Rep. by its Dean,
Nagapattinam.

.. Respondents

W.P.No.2761 of 2024

Dr.R.Gokul

.. Petitioner

VS

- 1.The State of Tamil Nadu
Rep. by its Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai - 09.



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

2. Directorate of Medical Education and Research,
Rep. by the Director of Medical Education and Research,
Kilpauk, Chennai – 10.

3. Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
Rep. by its Director of Public Health and
Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai – 06.

4. Tamil Nadu Medical Services Corporation Limited,
Rep. by its Chairman,
No.417, Pantheon Road, Egmore,
Chennai – 600 008.

5. Madras Medical College,
Rep. by its Dean,
Chennai – 600 003.

6. Government Primary Health Centre,
Rep. by Block Medical Officer,
Tirunavalur Block, Kallakurichi.

.. Respondents

W.P.No.2765 of 2024

Dr.S.Gokulram

.. Petitioner

VS

1. The State of Tamil Nadu
Rep. by its Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai - 09.

2. Directorate of Medical Education and Research,
Rep. by the Director of Medical Education and Research,
Kilpauk, Chennai – 10.

3. Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
Rep. by its Director of Public Health and
Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai – 06.

4. Tamil Nadu Medical Services Corporation Limited,
Rep. by its Chairman,



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

No.417, Pantheon Road, Egmore,
Chennai – 600 008.

WEB COPY

5.Tirunelveli Medical College,
Rep. by its Dean,
Highground, Tirunelveli.

6.Government Hospital,
Rep. by Joint Director of Health Services,
Arani, Tiruvannamalai

.. Respondents

Prayer in WP No. 2750 of 2024 : Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying to issue a writ of mandamus directing respondents 1 to 6 to treat the petitioner's two-year compulsory bond period as completed in line with the service rendered during the Covid 19 period and to consequently relieve the petitioner from his bonded service in 6th respondent hospital and also to direct 1st and 5th respondent to return the petitioner's original certificates and documents collected by 1st and 5th respondent while admitting the petitioner to the Post Graduate degree course along with his Post Graduate degree certificate within a time frame to be fixed by this Court.

Prayer in WP No. 2753 of 2024 : Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying to issue a writ of mandamus directing respondents 1 to 6 to treat the petitioner's two-year compulsory bond period as completed in line with the service rendered during the Covid 19 period and to consequently relieve the petitioner from his bonded service in 6th respondent hospital and also to direct 1st and 5th respondent to return the petitioner's original certificates and documents collected by 1st and 5th respondent while admitting the petitioner to the Post Graduate degree course along with his Post Graduate degree certificate within a time frame to be fixed by this Court.

Prayer in WP No. 2761 of 2024 : Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying to issue a writ of mandamus directing respondents 1 to 6 to treat the petitioner's two-year compulsory bond period as completed in line with the service rendered during the Covid 19 period and to consequently relieve the petitioner from his bonded service in 6th respondent hospital and also to direct 1st and 5th respondent to return the petitioner's original certificates and documents collected by 1st and 5th respondent while admitting the petitioner to the Post Graduate



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

degree course along with his Post Graduate degree certificate within a time frame to be fixed by this Court.

WEB COPY

Prayer in WP No. 2765 of 2024 : Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying to issue a writ of mandamus directing respondents 1 to 6 to treat the petitioner's two-year compulsory bond period as completed in line with the service rendered during the Covid 19 period and to consequently relieve the petitioner from his bonded service in 6th respondent hospital and also to direct 1st and 5th respondent to return the petitioner's original certificates and documents collected by 1st and 5th respondent while admitting the petitioner to the Post Graduate degree course along with his Post Graduate degree certificate within a time frame to be fixed by this Court.

For Petitioner : Mr.G.Pranavacharan
(in all writ petitions)

For Respondents : Mr.G.Ameedius
Government Advocate
(in all writ petitions)

COMMON ORDER

Mr.G.Ameedius, learned Government Advocate accepts notice for the respondents and is armed with instructions to enable final disposal of the matter, even at this juncture. Hence, by consent of both learned counsel, these Writ Petitions are taken up for final disposal, even at the stage of admission.

2. I have considered an identical prayer as in the present Writ Petitions in W.P.No.28238 of 2023 and have held as follows:

"The petitioner is a Doctor, who had completed Post Graduation in General



WEB COPY



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

Medicine from KAP Viswanathan Medical College in the non service category. He had completed the course in May, 2022 and had, at the time of admission to the course, executed a bond for a sum of Rs.40 lakhs undertaking that he would serve the State for a period of two years after completion of the course. The bond period, admittedly, runs till 31.05.2024.

2. Within a few months of commencing the course, the Covid 19 pandemic had struck and the petitioner, and, in fact several other identically / similarly placed candidates, were required to be on covid duty in R5 Hospital. Though no appointment orders could be issued seeing as the petitioner was a student then, his services during the covid period is not disputed as duty sheets for the service rendered have duly been produced by the petitioner and verified by the respondent counsel.

3. The question as to whether covid duty would constitute in-bond service is no longer res integra having been considered and accepted by two learned Judges in W.P.No.26556 of 2022 (decision dated 02.02.2023) and W.P.No.22894 of 2023 (decision dated 08.09.2023). In these cases, the petitioners were students who were required to perform covid duty during their course and this Court has held, and I concur with these decisions, that the covid duty rendered by the students should be taken note of as service during the bond period.

4. An additional question that arises in this case is as to whether quarantine relatable to covid period is also be taken as bond service. The period of quarantine is, in my considered view, nothing but an extension of covid duty itself as the Rules prevalent then required mandatory quarantine. The petitioner would well have continued with the duty in the covid ward itself has it not been for the mandate of



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

compulsory quarantine. Thus, taking the period of quarantine also as on-duty, such period in this case is quantified as 150 days. On-duty call sheets duly signed by the Dean of R5 college have been produced by the petitioner. This will advance the closure of bond period to 02.01.2024 from 31.05.2024.

5. The petitioner's request for a mandamus directing the respondents to treat compulsory bond period as concluding on 02.01.2024 is accepted. R5 is directed, upon completion of bond period on 02.01.2024, to return to the petitioner, his original certificates received at the time of admission to PG course.

6. Allowed in the above terms. No costs. Connected miscellaneous petition is closed."

3. Yet another development has been noted by me in W.P.Nos.32073, 33124, 32505, 32512, 29724 and 32380 of 2023 to following effect:

"The issue of treating Covid duty as period of duty for the purpose of computing of bond service now stands settled categorically by virtue of an order passed by the First Bench in W.P.Nos.25827, 25785 and 27568 of 2023, decided on 16.11.2023.

2. Those Writ Petitions relate to the recruitment of Assistant Surgeons. In the course of the discussion, the First Bench has settled the position that, both for the purpose of Under Graduate (UG) as well as Post Graduate (PG) medical education, the duties performed during covid period/treating covid patients should be treated as eligible duty.

3. The discussion from paragraph 7 onwards is clear to this effect and reads as follows:

7. It is true that the services rendered by the Post-Graduate students is part of their 36 months period training which they undergo. The said period is



WEB COPY



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

supposed to be the practical training towards the subject in which they undergo the study. Because of the abnormal situation arising out of the COVID - 19 pandemic, they were also roped in COVID - 19 duty in the COVID - 19 wards in the Government Hospitals. It is not in dispute that they put in the same kind of duty and underwent the same rigors as that of the other medical officers recruited by the State Government. As a matter of fact, the persons, who were recruited by the State Government for the said purpose of performing COVID - 19 duty in these wards which are set up as part of the disaster management, are categorised as 'Medical Officers'.

7.1. It may be seen that both these temporary appointees as well as the Post-Graduate medical students are registered medical practitioners eligible to be appointed as Assistant Surgeons. Service to the Health Department, Government of Tamil nadu is governed by the Statutory Rules known as Tamil Nadu Medical Service Rules. It contains two parts namely, Branch-I Medical and Branch-II Nursing. As far as the medical cadre is concerned, as per Rule 2, it is divided into Civil Surgeon cadre and Assistant Surgeon cadre. All the entry level posts of Assistant Surgeon in the general line, Non-Clinical Lectures, Tutors / Assistant Professors, Clinical Lecturers, Senior Residents / Assistant Professors and the Women State Family Planning Officer are all grouped under the cadre of Assistant Surgeon. Thus, it can be seen that there is no such post as such called 'Medical Officer'. But, the term 'Medical Officer' is widely used in the rules to denote every registered medical practitioner appointed to any



WEB COPY



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

post. When it comes to deputing personnel for the Chennai City Police, they are called Medical Officers to the Chennai City Police. The Senior Residents are also termed as 'Resident Medical Officers' Similarly, the term 'Medical Officer' is generally used in the context of referring to the person who is working in any capacity with the qualified medical degree (in common parlance, the Doctors working in the department).

4. Thus, the submission of the respondents to the effect that PG students were only been given 'training' and that such service must be disregarded for computation of duty/bond period cannot be accepted. In light of the decision of the First Bench cited supra affirming the principle that the duty performed by PG students during Covid period must be taken as regular medical service.

5. The State has now issued G.O.Ms.No.371 dated 18.11.2023 directing that the term 'Medical Officers' mentioned at Para 5.1(i) of G.O.(MS.) No.278, Health and Family Welfare (B1) Department dated 17.08.2023 be replaced as 'Medical Officers including Post Graduate Students'. The authorities have been directed to issue certificates confirming the number of days when covid duty was performed by the students.

6. In light of the above, let such certificates be issued to the petitioners at least two days prior to the next date of hearing. List on 05.12.2023. Written instructions/counter, if any, by then with an advance copy to the petitioners."

4. The petitioners have received and have placed on record covid duty certificates in terms of G.O.Ms.No.371 dated 18.11.2023 and G.O.(MS.) No.278 dated 17.08.2023. The details of the post-graduation courses completed by the petitioners and the number of days of covid duty rendered by the petitioners as per the certificates



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

issued by the respondents, are as follows:

W.P. No	PETITIONERS' NAME	PG in :	PG COURSE	DURATION OF COVID-19 DUTY	PLACE OF POSTING	DURATION OF BOND DUTY
2750 of 2024	Dr.B.Aashika	Tirunelveli Medical College (June 2020 TO June 2023)	M.D.Radio Diagnosis	25.06.2020 to 04.05.2023 (3 years)	Tirunelveli Medical College	2 years
2753 of 2024	Dr.D.Sowmiya	Government Kilpauk Medical College (June 2020 TO June 2023)	M.D.Anesthesiology	26.06.2020 to 05.05.2023 (3 years)	Government Kilpauk Medical College	2 years
2761 of 2024	Dr.R.Gokul	Madras Medical College (July 2020 to May 2023)	M.D.Dermatology, Vereology & Leprosy)	07.2020 to 02.2022	Madras Medical College	2 years
2765 of 2024	Dr.S.Gokulram	Tirunelveli Medical College (July 2020 to July 2023)	M.D.Pediatrics	31.07.2020 to 30.07.2023 (3 years)	Tirunelveli Medical College	2 years

5. Mr.G.Ameedius, learned Government Advocate for the respondents would categorically confirm that the particulars as set out in the tabulation above have been verified with the authorities to be correct and representing the proper sequence of events.

6. Three of the petitioners have served for a period of three year [Dr.B.Aashika, Dr.D.Sowmiya & Dr.S.Gokulram] and one petitioner - Dr.R.Gokul has served for a period of two years during the covid pandemic. The Health and Family Welfare (MCA-1) Department vide G.O.Ms.No.351 dated 27.10.2023 has stipulaed that the bond period for Non Service Post Graduates



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

(Degree/Diploma) who have completed their Post Graduate courses in the year 2023 will be reduced from two years to one year. The benefit of this reduction is available to the present petitioners.

7. The petitioners have admittedly received regular posting orders as well, which they have not responded to on the ground that they have served during the covid period. In light of the narration in the previous paragraphs, this fact will not militate against the consideration of the relief sought for, as the petitioners are seen to have served in excess of the requirement of one year (far in excess, in the cases of Dr.B.Aashika, Dr.D.Sowmiya & Dr.S.Gokulram) as per Government Order dated 27.10.2023.

8. The petitioners are all hence released from bonded Government service and there is a direction to the Deans of the respective colleges, all arrayed as respondents to return their original certificates when the petitioners presents themselves before them, forthwith.

9. These Writ Petitions are disposed in the aforesaid terms. No costs.

08.02.2024

Index:Yes/No
Neutral Citation:Yes
ssm



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

To

- 1.The Principal Secretary,
Health and Family Welfare Department,
Secretariat, Chennai - 09.
- 2.The Director of Medical Education and Research,
Directorate of Medical Education and Research,
Kilpauk, Chennai - 10.
- 3.The Director of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
Directorate of Public Health and Preventive Medicine,
359, Anna Salai, Chennai - 06.
- 4.The Chairman,
Tamil Nadu Medical Services Corporation Limited,
No.417, Pantheon Road, Egmore,
Chennai - 600 008.
- 5.The Dean,
Tirunelveli Medical College,
High Ground, Tirunelveli - 627 011.
- 6.The Joint Director of Health Service,
Government Headquarters Hospital,
Aruppukotai, Virudhunagar.
- 7.The Dean,
Government Kilpauk Medical College,
Chennai - 600 010.
- 8.The Dean,
Government Medical Hospital,
Nagapattinam.
- 9.The Dean,
Madras Medical College,
Chennai - 600 003.
- 10.The Block Medical Officer,
Government Primary Health Centre,
Tirunavalur Block, Kallakurichi.
- 11.The Dean,



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

Tirunelveli Medical College,
Highground, Tirunelveli.

WEB COPY

12.The Joint Director of Health Services,
Government Hospital,
Arani, Tiruvannamalai



WEB COPY



W.P.No.2750 of 2024 batch

DR. ANITA SUMANTH,J.

ssm

W.P.Nos.2750, 2753, 2761 & 2765 of 2024

08.02.2024