

**IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT BOMBAY
CIVIL APPELLATE JURISDICTION**

WRIT PETITION NO. 142 OF 2023

M/s. Garve Motors Private Limited through its
Director Shri. Vinayak Kishor Garve

...Petitioner

Versus

The Assistant Commissioner of Income Tax,
Circle-1(1), Pune & Ors.

...Respondents

Mr. Sagar Tilak a/w Ms. Payal Rathod & Ms. Tanvi Phatak i/b Mr.
Sachin Hande for Petitioner.

Mr. Suresh Kumar for Respondents-Revenue.

**CORAM: K. R. SHRIRAM &
DR. NEELA GOKHALE, JJ.**
DATED: 27th February 2024

PC:-

1. This petition relates to Assessment Year 2017-2018.
2. Counsels state that in this petition the issue of improper sanction having been obtained, has been raised among other grounds, in the petition as well as during the hearing. Counsels state that the issue of improper sanction has been decided by this Court in the case of *Siemens Financial Services Private Limited Vs. Deputy Commissioner of Income Tax and Others*¹, wherein the Court has held that for Assessment Year 2016-2017, the sanction should have been given under Section 151(ii) and not under Section 151(i) of the Income Tax Act, 1961 (**"the Act"**). Consequently, the sanction is

1. (2023) 457 ITR 647 (Bom.).

invalid. The Court has stated that in view of the invalid sanction, the notice issued itself will be invalid and has to be quashed. We would also add, if the notice has to be quashed, if there is an assessment order passed subsequently, that assessment order having been passed relying on an incorrect sanction, will also have to be quashed.

3. Counsels further state that the findings in *Siemens Financial Services Private Limited (supra)* would squarely apply to this petition as well on the issue of sanction. Therefore, all such notices issued for Assessment Year 2017-2018 and orders impugned in this petition are quashed and set aside. All consequential notices, assessment order and the consequential orders, if any, are also hereby quashed and set aside.

4. Petition disposed.

5. We clarify that all other grounds could be raised by the parties at appropriate stage in any other proceeding.

(DR. NEELA GOKHALE, J.)

(K. R. SHRIRAM, J.)

GITALAXMI
KRISHNA
KOTAWADEKAR

Digitally signed by
GITALAXMI KRISHNA
KOTAWADEKAR
Date: 2024.02.28
15:20:29 +0545

Gitalaxmi