



W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023

BEFORE THE MADURAI BENCH OF MADRAS HIGH COURT

WEB COPY

DATED: **05.12.2023**

CORAM

THE HONOURABLE **MR.JUSTICE S.M.SUBRAMANIAM**
AND
THE HONOURABLE **MR.JUSTICE V.LAKSHMINARAYANAN**

W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023
and
C.M.P.(MD)Nos.9758 & 9760 of 2023

The President,
E.E.224, Kalunguvilai Primary Agricultural
Cooperative Credit Society,
Office at Alwarthirunagari and Post,
Tiruchendur Taluk, Thoothukudi District. ... Appellant
in W.A.(MD)No.1283 of 2023

The President,
Kurumbur Primary Agricultural
Cooperative Credit Society,
Kurumboor, Thiruchendur Taluk,
Thoothukudi District. ... Appellant
in W.A.(MD)No.1284 of 2023

-Vs.-

- 1.M.Ahamad
- 2.L.Subramanian
- 3.T.Amutharani
- 4.The Principal Secretary to Government,
Cooperative, Food and Consumer
Protection Department,
Fort St.George, Chennai – 600 009.



W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023

5.The Registrar of Cooperative Societies,
NVN Natarajan Maligai,
170, EVR High Road,
Kilpauk, Chennai – 10.

6.The Registrar General Manager,
NABARD, No.48, Mahatma Gandhi Road,
Post Box No.6074, Nungambakkam,
Chennai-34.

... Respondents
in W.A.(MD)No.1283 of 2023

1.J.Devaraj
2.Johnny Chanrakantha Ganabai
3.S.Saravanan
4.Sudha
5.Sivagami
6.M.Seenivasan
7.K.John Nallathambi

8.The Principal Secretary to Government,
Cooperative, Food and Consumer
Protection Department,
Fort St.George, Chennai – 600 009.

9.The Registrar of Cooperative Societies,
NVN Natarajan Maligai,
No.170, EVR, High Road,
Kilpauk, Chennai – 10.

10.The Registrar General Manager,
NABARD, No.48, Mahatma Gandhi Road,
Post Box No.6074, Nungambakkam,
Chennai-34.

..... Respondents
in W.A.(MD)No.1284 of 2023

COMMON PRAYER:- Writ Appeals filed under Clause 15 of Letters
Patent Act, to set aside the orders dated 19.12.2018 made in W.P.
(MD)Nos.14636 and 9186 of 2014 on the file of this Court.



W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023

WEB COPY

For Appellant	: Mr.S.Kumar (in both W.As.)
For R1	: P.Senthur Pandian
For R2 & R3	: No Appearance
For R4 to R6	: Mr.S.Kameswaran, Government Advocate (in W.A.(MD)No.1283 of 2023)
For R1 & R2, R4 to R7	: No Appearance
For R3	: Mr.P.Senthur Pandian
For R8 to R10	: Mr.S.Kameswaran, Government Advocate (in W.A.(MD)No.1284 of 2023)

COMMON JUDGMENT

(Judgment of the Court was delivered by **S.M.SUBRAMANIAM, J.**)

These Writ Appeals have been instituted by the Co-operative Societies registered under the provisions of the Tamil Nadu Co-operative Societies Act, 1983 against the orders of the learned Single Judge.

2. The Writ Petitions were instituted by the employees of the Co-operative Society / private respondents questioning the validity of the Government Order passed in G.O.Ms.189, Co-operation, Food and



W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023

Consumer Protection Department, dated 17.11.2009 and claiming fixation of Dearness Allowance at the rate 97% from 01.04.2008, against the Government Order, fixing 84% of dearness allowance.

3. It is not in dispute that the private respondents are the employees of the Co-operative Society registered under the provisions of the Tamil Nadu Co-operative Societies Act, 1983. Each Co-operative Society is an independent entity registered separately holding registration number assigned by the competent authority under the Act. Each Society is following its special bylaws as approved by the competent authority under the Act governing the service conditions. Salary fixed by the Management of Society has to be approved by the competent authority under the Tamil Nadu Co-operative Societies Act, 1983.

4. Government in order to maintain uniformity in the matter of granting dearness allowance to the employees of the Co-operative Societies passed G.O.No.189, Cooperation, Food and Consumer Protection Department, dated 17.11.2009. The said Government Order was issued pursuant to the recommendation of the Pay Regulatory Commission constituted by the Government to rectify the discrepancies



W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023

in the fixation of pay to the employees of the Co-operative Societies across the State of Tamil Nadu. Accepting the Commissioner's Report, the Government issued G.O.Ms.No.189, dated 17.11.2009.

5. It is not in dispute between the parties that the said Government Order has been uniformly implemented by all the Co-operative Societies by granting 84% of dearness pay to the employees of the respective Co-operative Society concerned. All the employees had already received 84% of the dearness allowance. The learned counsel appearing on behalf of the appellants further made a submission that 12% of dearness allowance in addition had already been granted to the employees of the Co-operative Societies during the pendency of the litigation and therefore, the employees are not entitled to any further dearness allowance as claimed by them.

6. The employees of the Co-operative Societies cannot seek pay on par with the Government employees. Service conditions of the Co-operative Societies employees are governed under the provisions of the Tamil Nadu Co-operative Societies Act and Rules and the Special By-laws approved by the Registrar. That being so, the dearness allowance granted to maintain uniformity cannot be further extended by



W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023

the Court by granting 97% of dearness allowance by relying on dearness allowance granted to the Government Employees. Such a comparison is impermissible.

7. The Writ Petitions were filed challenging the Government Order granting dearness allowance, but the said dearness allowance had already been granted to all the employees, more so, additional dearness allowance of 12% was also sanctioned and disbursed in favour of the employees. That being the factum, if any grievance exists for the employees of the Co-operative Societies they are at liberty to approach the Government for further relief in the manner known to law.

8. The power of Judicial Review cannot be expanded for the purpose of enhancing dearness allowance and therefore, this Court is of the opinion that the reliance placed on by the learned Single Judge in W.A.No.452 of 2012 dated 20.07.2012 is misplaced. In respect of the said order of the Hon'ble Division Bench, it was passed based on certain mistaken facts and the mistake committed by Government was admitted before this Court in another Writ Proceedings in W.P.(MD) No.19043 and 19049 of 2020. It was mistakenly placed before the earlier Division



W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023

Bench that the Government granted 97% dearness allowance to the Co-operative Societies employees. Based on such mistake, the relief was granted in the said Writ Appeal and therefore, the said Writ Appeal cannot be followed as a precedent for the purpose of extending 97% dearness allowance to the employees of the Co-operative Societies.

9. Considering the facts and circumstances, we are of the considered opinion that the Writ Petitioners / private respondents are not entitled for the reliefs as such sought for in the Writ Proceedings. Thus, the orders impugned in these Writ Appeals are set aside and the Writ Appeals are allowed. Consequently, connected Miscellaneous Petitions are closed.

**[S.M.S.J.,] & [V.L.N.J.,]
05.12.2023**

NCC :Yes/No
Index :Yes/No

Yuva

To

1.The Principal Secretary to Government,
Cooperative, Food and Consumer
Protection Department,
Fort St.George, Chennai – 600 009.

2.The Registrar of Cooperative Societies,
NVN Natarajan Maligai,
Kilpauk, Chennai – 10.



W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023

3. The Registrar General Manager,
NABARD, No.48, Mahatma Gandhi Road,
Post Box No.6074, Nungambakkam,
Chennai-34.



WEB COPY



W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023

S.M.SUBRAMANIAM, J.
AND
V. LAKSHMINARAYANAN, J.

Yuva

W.A.(MD) Nos.1283 & 1284 of 2023

05.12.2023