



W.P.No.27137 of 2023

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED : 15.09.2023

CORAM

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE M.SUNDAR
and

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE R.SAKTHIVEL

W.P.No.27137 of 2023

Selvam

S/o.Chinnathurai

.. Petitioner

Vs.

1. The State rep. by its
The Deputy Inspector General of Prison
Office of the Deputy Inspector General of Prison
Trichy Range, Race Course Road,
Trichy District - 620 023.
 2. The Superintendent of Prison
Central Prison at Trichy
Trichy - 620 020.
 3. The Superintendent of Prison
Central Prison at Puzhal-I
Thiruvallur District - 600 066.
- ..Respondents

Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying writ of Mandamus to direct the respondents to grant 40 days ordinary leave

Page Nos.1/15



WP.No.27137 of 2023

without escort to the petitioner / convict namely, Mr.Selvam, son of Chinnathurai, by considering petitioner's representation dated 28.07.2023 presently, who is detained under third respondent respectively.

For Petitioner : Mr.M.Mohamed Saifulla
For Respondents : Mr.E.Raj Thilak
Additional Public Prosecutor

ORDER

[Order of the Court was made by M.SUNDAR, J.,]

Captioned writ petition has been filed in this Court on 11.09.2023 with a mandamus prayer qua writ petitioner's representation dated 28.07.2023 seeking 40 days ordinary leave (to be noted, writ petitioner is a life convict prisoner). To be noted, this representation dated 28.07.2023 shall hereinafter be referred to as 'said representation' for the sake of convenience and clarity.

2. Short facts (shorn of elaboration / particulars that are not imperative for appreciating this order) are that writ petitioner was convicted in and by judgment of conviction and sentence dated 05.10.1998 in S.C.No.392 of 1997 on the file of learned Principal District and Sessions Judge's Court, Tirunelveli; that originally capital punishment was awarded



WP.No.27137 of 2023

for a 302 of 'the Indian Penal Code, 1860 (Act 45 of 1860)' [hereinafter 'IPC' for the sake of brevity] offence; that thereafter, the matter travelled to this Court, Hon'ble Supreme Court and by way of Mercy pleas before Hon'ble Governor, His Excellency the President; that capital punishment was modified as life imprisonment; that writ petitioner is now lodged in Central Prison, Puzhal, Tiruvallur District - 600 066 (Convict No.23170); that writ petitioner has remained incarcerated from 1994 for 29 years now; that writ petitioner has been granted leave and has gone on leave multiple times (15 times) in the past and on all occasions, he has returned and surrendered without any untoward incident; that now vide said representation, 40 days ordinary leave has been sought on two grounds namely, (a) to make arrangements for admission of writ petitioner's two children in B.E., and M.E. courses and (b) to repair his homestead; that said representation remains unattended is learned petitioner counsel's say and that has necessitated the filing of captioned writ petition in this Court on 11.09.2023 is his further say.

3. In the hearing today, Mr.M.Mohamed Saifulla, learned counsel on



WP.No.27137 of 2023

record for petitioner drew our attention to said representation and submitted that the aforementioned two grounds on which ordinary leave has been sought snugly fits into sub-clauses (ii) and (iii) of Rule 20 of 'the Tamil Nadu Suspension of Sentence Rules 1982' [hereinafter 'said Rules' for the sake of convenience and clarity]; that on all earlier occasions of leave, there has been nothing untoward and writ petitioner has returned promptly; that there is no impediment in granting 40 days ordinary leave that has been now sought.

4. Issue notice.

5. Mr.E.Raj Thilak, learned State Additional Public Prosecutor accepts notice for all three respondents.

6. Learned Prosecutor, on instructions, submits that said representation is being processed and a call has to be taken qua said representation by first respondent owing to Rule 19 of said Rules. It is also submitted by learned Prosecutor that as part of said representation being



WP.No.27137 of 2023

considered, report of jurisdictional Probation Officer has been obtained and there is nothing adverse in the same. To state with specificity, learned Prosecutor says that jurisdictional Probation Officer's report says that leave as sought for shall be granted albeit with escort is jurisdictional Probation Officer's report.

7. In the light of the narrative thus far, it comes to light that the captioned matter turns on a very narrow compass and therefore with the consent of both sides, the captioned writ petition was taken up and heard out.

8. After careful consideration of facts and the trajectory the matter has taken thus far, including the trajectory of incarceration of writ petitioner for nearly three decades (29 years) now (from 1994) we are of the view that request / plea qua said representation has to be acceded to i.e., writ petitioner has to be granted 40 days ordinary leave as sought for and reasons are as follows:

(i) As rightly pointed out by learned counsel for writ petitioner, two grounds i.e., admission of children and repair work of homestead snugly fit into sub-clauses (ii) and (iii) of



WP.No.27137 of 2023

WEB COPY

Rule 20 of said Rules captioned 'Grounds for the grant of ordinary leave'. There is no disputation or contestation about these grounds;

(ii) Convict prisoner has gone on leave as many as 15 times thus far and details of the same as placed before us by learned Prosecutor are as follows:



WEB COPY



WP.No.27137 of 2023

Sl. No.	Name of the Judge	Designation	Period of Leave	Number of Days	Remarks
1	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	10.10.2023 to 10.10.2023	1	On leave
2	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	11.10.2023 to 11.10.2023	1	On leave
3	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	12.10.2023 to 12.10.2023	1	On leave
4	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	13.10.2023 to 13.10.2023	1	On leave
5	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	14.10.2023 to 14.10.2023	1	On leave
6	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	15.10.2023 to 15.10.2023	1	On leave
7	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	16.10.2023 to 16.10.2023	1	On leave
8	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	17.10.2023 to 17.10.2023	1	On leave
9	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	18.10.2023 to 18.10.2023	1	On leave
10	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	19.10.2023 to 19.10.2023	1	On leave
11	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	20.10.2023 to 20.10.2023	1	On leave
12	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	21.10.2023 to 21.10.2023	1	On leave
13	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	22.10.2023 to 22.10.2023	1	On leave
14	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	23.10.2023 to 23.10.2023	1	On leave
15	Mr. Justice A. K. Ramaswami	Chief Justice	24.10.2023 to 24.10.2023	1	On leave

The above tabulation makes it clear that on 2 out of 15 occasions, this Court i.e., Hon'ble coordinate Division Benches of this Court have granted leave. Be that as it may, what is of



WP.No.27137 of 2023

WEB COPY

greater significance is, on all 15 occasions, nothing untoward has happened, convict prisoner has returned and surrendered on the leave period elapsing;

(iii) As regards said representation which we are concerned with in the captioned matter i.e., representation dated 28.07.2023, it is submitted that jurisdictional Probation Officer's report does not say anything adverse and it only says that it is desirable to grant 40 days leave with escort. To be noted, learned counsel for writ petitioner, on instructions, submits that writ petitioner is willing to go with escort. This submission is recorded;

The aforementioned two reasons, i.e., the reasons which snugly fit into sub-clauses (ii) and (iii) of Rule 20 of said Rules, in our view are very compelling as it pertains to education of writ petitioner's children. In this regard, we remind ourselves that a prisoner and his fundamental rights do not part ways at the prison gates and Right to Education is indisputably a fundamental right. The said Rules is a piece of Subordinate



WP.No.27137 of 2023

WEB COPY

Legislation made by Executive i.e., Government of Tamil Nadu in exercise of Rule making powers *inter alia* under Section 432(5) of 'The Code of Criminal Procedure, 1973 (2 of 1974)' [hereinafter 'Cr.PC' for the sake of brevity and clarity]. A piece of Subordinate Legislation which has not gone through grind i.e., Legislative grind in the Legislature can hardly constrict or in any manner hamper Constitutional powers of this Court, more so, when such Constitutional powers pertain to Article 21 of Constitution of India. In this regard, we remind ourselves of recent judgement of Hon'ble Supreme Court in ***Elgar Parishad*** case i.e., ***Vernon*** case [***Vernon Vs. State of Maharashtra and another*** reported in **2023 SCC OnLine SC 885 : 2023 LiveLaw (SC) 575**], wherein ***K.A.Najeeb*** principle [***Union of India Vs. K.A.Najeeb*** reported in **2021 3 SCC 713**] was reiterated to say that a bail restricting clause in a Statute cannot denude jurisdiction of Constitutional Court and that this is a fundamental proposition. Though ***K.A.Najeeb*** principle and ***Elgar Parishad*** case were rendered in the light of Section 43D



WP.No.27137 of 2023

WEB COPY

of Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act, 1967, principle applies in all fours i.e., principle that a restriction clause in a Statute cannot denude jurisdiction of a Constitutional Court applies in all force. We draw inspiration from Hon'ble Supreme Court, having declared that this is a fundamental proposition. Reverting to the case on hand, said Rules is not even a Statute, it is a Subordinate Legislation made under Rule making powers vested with the Executive under Section 432(5) of Cr.PC and this Subordinate Legislation has not gone through legislative grind of law making in the Legislature. Therefore, this piece of Subordinate Legislation is only a codified guideline for the Executive to deal with requests for leave from prisoners and it cannot abridge Constitutional powers which this Court is exercising. At the risk of repetition, we reiterate that a prisoner and his fundamental rights do not part ways at the prison gates. To put it in a nutshell, Subordinate Legislation cannot denude nay not even abridge Constitutional powers.



WP.No.27137 of 2023

WEB COPY

(M.S.,J.)

(R.S.V.,J.)

15.09.2023

Index : Yes

Speaking

Neutral Citation : Yes

mk

Note: Upload forthwith

P.S.: Though captioned writ petition is disposed of, Registry to list the captioned writ petition under the cause list caption 'FOR REPORTING COMPLIANCE' on 03.11.2023.

M.SUNDAR, J.,
and
R.SAKTHIVEL, J.,

mk

To

1. The State rep. by its

Page Nos.12/15



WEB COPY



W.P.No.27137 of 2023

The Deputy Inspector General of Prison
Office of the Deputy Inspector General of Prison
Trichy Range, Race Course Road,
Trichy District - 620 023.

2. The Superintendent of Prison
Central Prison at Trichy
Trichy - 620 020.
3. The Superintendent of Prison
Central Prison at Puzhal-I
Thiruvallur District - 600 066.
4. The Public Prosecutor
High Court, Madras.

W.P.No.27137 of 2023

15.09.2023

W.P.No.27137 of 2023

S.S. SUNDAR, J.
and
SUNDER MOHAN, J.

[Order of the Court was made by **S.S. SUNDAR, J.**]

Page Nos.13/15



WP.No.27137 of 2023

Today, the matter has been listed under the caption “for being mentioned”.

2.It is pointed out that, in the final order dated 15.09.2023, at Para No.9 Sub-Clause (ii), by mistake, it is stated that the petitioner shall surrender before “third respondent” instead of “second respondent” where the petitioner was confined earlier.

3.Having regard to the submission of the learned counsel for the petitioner, Sub-Clause (ii) of Para No.9 of the order, dated 15.09.2023, in W.P.No.27137 of 2023, shall read as follows :

“9. .. (ii) Writ petitioner shall surrender before second respondent by dusk on 01.11.2023 Wednesday i.e., by 5.30 p.m;”

S.S. SUNDAR, J.
and
SUNDER MOHAN, J.

mkn



WP.No.27137 of 2023

WEB COPY 4. Registry is directed to issue the amended copy of the order to the petitioner, immediately.

(S.S.S.R., J.) (S.M., J.)
17.10.2023

Note to Registry :
Issue order copy immediately.

mkn

W.P.No.27137 of 2023