



WEB COPY



W.P.No.1907 of 2014

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED: 20.10.2023

CORAM :

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE D.KRISHNAKUMAR

and

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE P. DHANABAL

W.P.No.1907 of 2014 and

M.P.No.1 of 2014

1. Union of India, rep. by its General Manager,
Southern Railway, Park Town,
Chennai 600 003.

2. The Senior Divisional Personnel Officer,
Southern Railway, Palghat Division,
Palghat.

3. The Senior Divisional Financial Manager,
Southern Railway, Palghat Division,
Palghat

... Petitioners

Vs.

1. The Registrar,
Central Administrative Tribunal,
Madras Bench, Chennai 600 104.

2. VVenkatachalam

3. V.Padmanabhan

4. Vellasamy Ramu

5. K.N.Subramanian



W.P.No.1907 of 2014

6. J.Sivagurunathan

... Respondents

Prayer: Writ petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India seeking to issue a Writ of Certiorari calling for the entire records of the first respondent in O.A.No.978/2011, including the order dated 28.03.2012 and the order dated 22.06.2012 made in R.A.No.22/2012 and quash the same.

For petitioners : Mr.P.T.Ramkumar, Standing Counsel

For Respondents : Mr.A.Abdul Ajees
respondents 2 to 6

ORDER

(Order of the Court was delivered by D.KRISHNAKUMAR, J.)

Challenging the order dated 28.03.2012 passed in O.A.No.978/2011 in and by which, the appellants herein were directed to *grant the benefit of 55% of pay element for pensionary benefits to the respondents 2 to 6*; and also the dismissal order passed in R.A.No.22/2012 in OA No.978/2011, dated 22.06.2012, , this writ petition has been filed.

2. The brief facts leading to the filing of the present writ petition is as follows.

The respondents 2 to 6 were initially appointed as Fireman 'A' and



W.P.No.1907 of 2014

subsequently, they worked as Goods Drivers, Passenger Drivers, Mail Drivers, PRCs and then promoted as Loco/Senior Loco Inspectors.

According to them, they were appointed in running category and posted to work in the stationary post of Loco/Senior Loco Inspectors and hence, in terms of Rule 1514 & 1515 of Indian Railway Establishment Code Volume-I (Annexure A-2), Loco Inspectors are entitled for running allowance. Therefore, their pensionary benefits should be calculated by adding 55% of the pay elements. However, the petitioners herein had not considered their representations and hence, they had filed the above original application before the Tribunal. The Tribunal, by taking into account the orders passed by the Tribunal in similar matters in O.A.No.679/2011, O.A.No.294/2011, O.A.No.996/2011, and O.A.Nos.676, 1188, 1189/2010 and O.A.No.978/2011, had granted the above benefits to the respondents, subject to the outcome of SLP(C) No.11805 to 11808/2009, pending before the Hon'ble Supreme Court. Challenging the above order, the Department had filed the review petition in R.A.No.22/2012 and the same was also dismissed by the Tribunal, vide order dated 22.06.2012. Challenging orders passed in the original application as well as the review application, present writ petition



W.P.No.1907 of 2014

has been filed by the Department.

WEB COPY

3. The learned Standing Counsel appearing for the petitioners submitted that, in similar matters, the orders passed by the Central Administrative Tribunal was challenged before the Delhi High Court by filing writ petitions and the same were dismissed. As against the orders passed by the Delhi High Court in W.P.(C) No.8363/2007 etc., dated 18.09.2008, an appeal in SLP (C) No.11805/2009 along with other cases were filed by the Department before the Hon'ble Supreme Court, and the same were disposed of, vide order dated 29.04.2015, by granting permission to the Department to approach the Delhi High Court by way of review petitions. Accordingly, the Department had filed the Review Petition Nos.377/15 in W.P.(C) 2937/2007; 396/2015 in W.P.(C) 8363/207 etc. and the same were dismissed by the Delhi High Court on 09.10.2015. As against the above orders, Civil Appeal Nos.3110/2016 etc., had been filed before the Hon'ble Supreme Court and the same were dismissed on 22.02.2023. He has also placed the copy of the i) orders passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in SLP (C) Nos.11805/2009, etc., dated 29.04.2015; ii) orders passed by the Delhi High Court in Review Petition Nos.377/2015



W.P.No.1907 of 2014

in W.P.No.2937/205; 328/2015 in W.P.(C) 8363/2007 etc., dated 09.10.2015; iii) and the orders passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in Civil Appeal Nos.3110/2016 etc., dated 22.02.2023.

4. It is to be noted that, while passing the impugned order, the Tribunal had granted the benefits to the respondents, subject to the outcome of SLP (c) Nos.11805 to 11808/2009, pending before the Hon'ble Supreme Court. Subsequently, the Hon'ble Supreme Court had disposed the above Special leave petitions by granting permission to approach the Delhi High Court. Accordingly, the Department had filed the review petitions and the same were dismissed by the Delhi High Court. Further, as against the dismissal order passed in the review petitions, Civil Appeals (as stated supra) had also been filed and the same were also dismissed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court, vide order dated 22.02.2023.

5. In view of the above, the impugned orders passed by the Tribunal in the original application as well as the review application, which are challenged in the writ petition have reached finality and hence, we have no



W.P.No.1907 of 2014

hesitation to conclude that the impugned orders passed by the Tribunal does not warrant any interference by this Court. Therefore, there is no merits in the writ petition and the same is liable to be dismissed.

6. Accordingly, this writ petition is dismissed. No costs. Consequently, connected miscellaneous petition is closed.

(D.K.K.J.)

(P.D.B.J.)

20.10.2023

(4/4)

Internet: Yes/No

Index : Yes/No

mst

To

1. The Registrar,
Central Administrative Tribunal,
Madras Bench, Chennai 600 104.
2. The General Manager, Union of India,
Southern Railway, Park Town, Chennai 600 003.
3. The Senior Divisional Personnel Officer,
Southern Railway, Palghat Division,
Palghat.



WEB COPY



W.P.No.1907 of 2014

4. The Senior Divisional Financial Manager,
Southern Railway, Palghat Division, Palghat.

D.KRISHNAKUMAR, J.

and

P. DHANABAL, J.

mst

W.P.No.1907 of 2014

20.10.2023

Page 7 of 8



WEB COPY



W.P.No.1907 of 2014

(4/4)