



W.P.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023

WEB COPY IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED: 03.08.2023

CORAM:

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE N.SATHISH KUMAR

**WP.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023**

**WMP.Nos. 21078, 21079, 29242, 20245, 20246, 20247, 20248, 20249,
20251 & 21259 of 2023**

W.P.No.18476 of 2023

S.Karuppasamy

... Petitioner

Vs

1. The Government of Tamilnadu,
Rep. by its Additional Chief Secretary,
Environment and Forest Department,
Fort St. George, Chennai – 600 009.

2. The Principal Chief Conservator of Forests,
Panagal Maaligai, Jeenis Road,
Saidapet, Chennai – 600 015.

... Respondents

Prayer in W.P.No.21349 of 2023 :- Writ Petition filed under the Article
226 of Constitution of India, to issue a Writ of Mandamus directing the



W.P.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023

WEB COPY

respondents to regularize the service of the petitioner as Forest Watcher from 24.01.1995 notionally for purpose of getting pension by taking into account their seniority and qualification on par with their juniors namely last junior one Mr.P.Karuppiah, in the light of the Orders passed in W.P.No.15561 of 2006 dated 10.03.2008, W.A.No.690 of 2008 dated 13.10.2009, W.P.No.23374 of 2008 dated 30.10.2009, W.A.No.607 of 2010 dated 29.03.2010 and proceedings of the second respondent dated 07.10.2011 and light of the order passed in W.P.28327 of 2022 dated 22.10.10.2022.

For Petitioner : Mr.S.Mani in all WPs

For Respondents : Mr.R.Neelakandan, AAG VIII
Asst. by Mr.S.Arumugam,
Government Advocate – R1 & R2

COMMON ORDER

These Writ Petitions have been filed to direct the respondents to regularize the service of the petitioners as Forest Watcher from 24.01.1995 notionally for purpose of getting pension by taking into account their seniority and qualification on par with their juniors namely last junior one Mr.P.Karuppiah, in the light of the Orders passed in



W.P.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023

WEB COPY

W.P.No.15561 of 2006 dated 10.03.2008, W.A.No.690 of 2008 dated 13.10.2009, W.P.No.23374 of 2008 dated 30.10.2009, W.A.No.607 of 2010 dated 29.03.2010 and proceedings of the second respondent dated 07.10.2011 and light of the order passed in W.P.28327 of 2022 dated 22.10.10.2022.

2. The Writ Petitions in W.P.No.18476, 20876, 20886, 22494 of 2023 have been filed by the petitioners to consider their representations and to regularize their services as Forest Watcher from 24.01.1995 in the light of the above Orders passed by this Court.

3. The Writ Petition in W.P.No.18802 of 2023 has been filed by the wife to consider their representations and to regularize the services of their husband as Forest Watcher from 24.01.1995 in the light of the above Orders passed by this Court.

4. The Writ Petitions in W.P.Nos.20878, 20881, 20882, 20883, 21717, 21915 of 2023 have been filed call for the entire records which



W.P.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023

WEB COPY

culminated in issuing the G.O. (2D)No.76 Environment Climate change and Forests (FR.2ii) Department dated 05.04.2023 on the file of the First Respondent and quash the same so and consequently directing respondents to regularize the service of Petitioners in the cadre of forest watcher for purpose of getting minimum pension / Family Pension on par with Juniors namely P.Karuppiah S.No.4608 with effect from 24.01.1995 in the light of the order passed by this Honble High Court in W.P. No.15561 of 2006 dated 10.03.2008 W.A. No.690 of 2008 dated 13.10.2009 W.P.No.23374 of 2008 dated 30.10.2009 W.A.No.607 of 2010 dated 29.03.2010 and proceedings of the second respondent dated 07.01.2011 and Order in W.P.No.19020 of 2021 dated 09.09.2021 within a time limit that may be fixed by this Court.

5. The facts in all the Writ Petitions are almost identical, barring the dates and therefore, the facts as spoken in W.P.No.18476 of 2023 is taken up for dealing the facts.



W.P.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023

WEB COPY

6. The case of the petitioner is that her husband was appointed as Plot Watcher on temporary basis on 01.01.1986 on daily wage basis and subsequently, his service as plot watcher was regularized on 27.05.2014. Whereas, his juniors were regularised as early as on 24.01.1995. Hence, there is vast disparity and discrimination in the matter of regularization of service of the husband of petitioner on par with his juniors, Venkatachalam and others were brought in regular time of scale on 24.01.1995. According to the petitioner, similarly placed persons, namely, P.Sundaram and P.Govindan and 23 others filed W.P.No.15561 of 2006 and 23374 of 2008 before this Court and the same was disposed on 10.03.2008 and 30.10.2009 with a direction to consider their claim for appointment as Forest Watcher on par with their juniors. As against the said Order, the Department went on appeal in W.A.No.690 of 2008 and 607 of 2010 and the same were dismissed by the Division Bench of this Court on 13.10.2009 and 29.03.2010 respectively. Pursuant to the dismissal of the appeals, the respondents implemented the Order of this Court by passing Order dated 15.11.2010 and 07.01.2010 respectively and in the light of the G.O.[2D] No.122 dated 12.08.2022. In the light



W.P.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023

of the above Order of this Court, the petitioner made a representation to the respondents on 23.05.2022 to regularise the service of the petitioner on par with his juniors with effect from 24.01.1995 and the same was not considered by the respondents. Hence, the present Writ Petition has been filed.

7. The case of the petitioner is that that the service of similarly placed persons have been regularized with effect from 24.01.1995 in the light of the Orders of this Court in W.A.Nos.690 of 2008 and 607 of 2010 dated 13.10.2009 and 29.03.2010 respectively and the Government Order in G.O.[2BD] No.64 Forest Department dated 08.03.1999.

8. The learned Additional Advocate General placed reliance on the Order of the Division bench of this Court in W.A.No.158 of 2016 and batch cases and submitted that in the above Writ Appeal, the Division Bench of this Court has held that the Government servants who were appointed in non-provincialized service, consolidate pay, honoarium or daily wages basis before 01.04.2003, but were absorbed in regular



W.P.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023

WEB COPY

service after 01.0.2003, will not be entitled to count half of their past service for the purpose of determination of qualifying service for pension. Further, Special Leave Petitions filed by certain petitioners against the said Order has also been dismissed. Hence, submitted that the impugned Order does not warrant any interference.

9. Admittedly, the grievance of the writ petitioner is that he is seeking regularization of service for pensionary benefits. It is the contention of the writ petitioners that similarly persons have been given such benefits as per Orders in W.A.Nos.690 of 2008 and 607 of 2010 dated 13.10.2009 and 29.03.2010 respectively and the Government Order in G.O.[2BD] No.64 Forest Department dated 08.03.1999. As per the above Government Order, the relief has been extended to similarly placed persons. Hence, the respondents are directed to consider the case of the petitioners in the light the above Government Order, as the benefit has been extended to similarly placed person. In fact the plot watchers are frontline soldiers in forest and they are main protectors of the forest. These facts cannot be disputed by any one. Hence, while passing the



W.P.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023

WEB COPY

Orders, the Government shall take into consideration the nature of service rendered by the petitioners and also the fact that when similarly placed persons have already been granted the relief, if the petitioners are not granted such relief, the same is nothing but discrimination and it violates Article 14 of Constitution of India. In such view of the matter, the respondents shall extend the benefits as per above Government Orders as it is extended to similarly situated persons.

10. As far as the Writ Petition in W.P.No.18802 of 2023 is concerned, the respondents are directed to extend the benefits to the husband of the petitioner as per the above Government Order as it is extended to similarly situated persons. As far as the other Writ Petitions are concerned, the respondents are directed to extend the benefits to the petitions as per the above Government Order as it is extended to similarly situated person. Such an exercise shall be completed within a period of six months from the date of receipt of a copy of this Order.



W.P.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023

WEB COPY

11. With the above directions, the impugned Orders passed in Writ Petitions in W.P.Nos.20878, 20881, 20882, 20883, 21717, 21915 of 2023 are set aside. Accordingly, Writ Petitions are disposed of. Consequently, connected miscellaneous petitions are closed. No costs.

03.08.2023

Index:Yes/No

Neutral Citation : Yes/No

vrc

To,

1. The Additional Chief Secretary,
Environment and Forest Department,
Fort St. George, Chennai – 600 009.
2. The Principal Chief Conservator of Forests,
Panagal Maaligai, Jeenis Road,
Saidapet, Chennai – 600 015.



WEB COPY



W.P.Nos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882, 20878,
21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023

N.SATHISH KUMAR, J.

VRC

**W.PNos.18476, 18802, 20876, 20881, 20883, 20886, 20882,
20878, 21717, 21915 and 22494 of 2023**

03.08.2023