



WEB COPY



W.P. No. 11005 of 2023

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED : 11.04.2023

CORAM

THE HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE P.D. AUDIKESAVALU

**W.P. No. 11005 of 2023
and
W.M.P. Nos. 10891 and 10892 of 2023**

G.John Anthony

... Petitioner

-VS-

1. The Government of Tamil Nadu,
Rep. by its Principal Secretary,
Environment, Climate Change and Forest Department,
Fort St.George,
Chennai – 600009.

2. The Principal Chief Conservator of Forests,
Head of Forest Department,
Guindy-Velachery Main Road,
Near Kannigapuram Check Post,
Guindy,
Chennai – 600032.

3. The District Forest Officer,
Dharmapuri Forest Division,
Dharmapuri District – 05.

...

Respondents

Prayer:- Writ Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India, 1950, praying to issue a Writ of Certiorarified Mandamus, to call for the records of the Third Respondent in his proceeding in Na. Ka. No. 1241/2023/P1 dated 31.03.2023 quash the same as illegal and consequently direct the Third Respondent to allow the Petitioner to serve as drive in the Third Respondent



W.P. No. 11005 of 2023

Office.

WEB COPY

For Petitioner : Mr. S.Anbazhagan
For Respondents : Mr. R.Anitha,
Special Government Pleader

ORDER

Heard Mr. S.Anbazhagan, Learned Counsel for the Petitioner and Mrs. R.Anitha, Learned Special Government Pleader, who takes notice for the Respondents, and perused the materials placed on record, apart from the pleadings of the parties.

2. The Petitioner, who is working as Driver in the Forest Department of the Government of Tamil Nadu has been transferred from Dharmapuri to Harur, which is assailed in this Writ Petition.

3 The legal position relating to the scope of interference of the Court on transfers in public employment under Article 226 of the Constitution is well settled as reflected in the following extracts from the rulings of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India:-



W.P. No. 11005 of 2023

WEB COPY (i) **Mrs. Shilpi Bose -vs- State of Bihar** [(1992) SCC (L&S) 127]:

“ In our opinion, the Courts should not interfere with transfer orders which are made in public interest and for administrative reason unless the transfer orders are made in violation of any mandatory statutory rule or on the ground of mala fide. A Government servant holding a transferable post has no vested right to remain posted at a place or the other, he is liable to be transferred from one place to the other. Transfer orders issued by the competent authority do not violate any of his legal rights. Even if a transfer order is passed in violation of executive instructions or orders, the Courts ordinarily should not interfere with the order, instead the affected party should approach the higher authorities in the Department. If the Courts continue to interfere with day to day transfer orders passed by the Government and its subordinate authorities, there will be complete chaos in the Administration which would not be conducive to public interest.”



W.P. No. 11005 of 2023

WEB COPY

(ii) ***Union of India -vs- S.L.Abbas*** [(1994) SCC (L&S) 230]:

“ Who should be transferred where, is a matter for the appropriate authority to decide. Unless the order of transfer is vitiated by mala fides or is made in violation of any statutory provisions the Court cannot interfere with it. While ordering the transfer, there is no doubt, the authority must keep in mind the guidelines issued by the Government on the subject. Similarly, if a person makes any representation with respect to his transfer, the appropriate authority must consider the same having regard to the exigencies of administration. The guidelines say that as far as possible, husband and wife must be posted at the same place. The said guideline however, does not confer upon the Government employee a legally enforceable right.”



(iii) ***State of Punjab -vs- Joginder Singh Dhatt*** [(1994) SCC (L&S) 230]:

WEB COPY “ *This Court has time and again expressed its disapproval of the Courts below interfering with the order of transfer of a public servant from one place to another. It is entirely for the employer to decide when, where and what point of time a public servant is to be transferred from his present posting. Ordinarily the Courts have no jurisdiction to interfere with the order of transfer. The High Court grossly erred in quashing the order of transfer of the respondent from Hoshiarpur to Sangrur. The High Court was not justified in extending its jurisdiction under Article 226 of the Constitution of India in a matter where, on the face of it, no injustice was caused.*”

(iv) ***Abani Kanta Ray -vs- State of Orissa*** [(1996) SCC (L&S) 175]:

“ *It is settled law that a transfer which is an incident of service is not to be interfered with by the Courts unless it is shown to be clearly vitiated by mala fides or infraction of any professed norm or principle governing the transfer.*”



W.P. No. 11005 of 2023

Having due regard to the aforesaid dictum laid down in the binding decisions, in

the absence of *malafides* or violations of statutory provisions, it is not possible for this Court to entertain this Writ Petition challenging the order of transfer. However, it is incumbent upon the concerned authorities to examine the representation that may be made by the Petitioner to re-consider the order of transfer with reference to applicable guidelines for transfer issued by the Government of Tamil Nadu and after affording an opportunity of personal hearing to him, pass reasoned order dealing with each of the contentions raised on merits and in accordance with law expeditiously and in any event, within a period of 15 days from the date of receipt of its copy.

5. In the result, the Writ Petition is disposed on the aforesaid terms. Consequently, the connected Miscellaneous Petition is closed. No costs.

11.04.2023

kv

Index: Yes/No

Neutral Citation: Yes/No

Note: Issue order copy by 26.07.2023.

To

1. The Principal Secretary,
The Government of Tamil Nadu,
Environment, Climate Change and Forest Department,



W.P. No. 11005 of 2023

Fort St. George,
Chennai – 600009.

2. The Principal Chief Conservator of Forests,
Head of Forest Department,
Guindy-Velachery Main Road,
Near Kannigapuram Check Post,
Guindy,
Chennai – 600032.
3. The District Forest Officer,
Dharmapuri Forest Division,
Dharmapuri District – 05.



WEB COPY



W.P. No. 11005 of 2023

P.D. AUDIKESAVALU, J.

kv

W.P. No. 11005 of 2023

11.04.2023