

**IN THE HIGH COURT AT CALCUTTA**

**(Civil Appellate Jurisdiction)**

**APPELLATE SIDE**

**Present:**

**The Hon'ble Justice Subrata Talukdar**

**And**

**The Hon'ble Justice Supratim Bhattacharya**

**MAT 1594 of 2018**

**[Assigned]**

**WEST BENGAL BOARD OF PRIMARY EDUCATION & ORS.**

**VS**

**PRATIVA MONDAL**

**IA NO: CAN/1/2019(Old No:CAN/5471/2019),**

**CAN/3/2019(Old No:CAN/8274/2019),CAN/4/2021, CAN/5/2021**

**CAN/6/2022, CAN/7/2022, CAN/8/2022, CAN/9/2022, CAN/10/2022,  
CAN/11/2022, CAN/12/2022, CAN/13/2022, CAN/14/2022,  
CAN/15/2022, CAN/16/2022, CAN/17/2022, CAN/18/2022,  
CAN/19/2022, CAN/20/2022, CAN/21/2022, CAN/22/2022,  
CAN/23/2022, CAN/24/2022, CAN/25/2022, CAN/26/2022,  
CAN/27/2022, CAN/28/2022, CAN/29/2022, CAN/30/2022,  
CAN/31/2022, CAN/32/2022, CAN/33/2022, CAN/34/2022,  
CAN/35/2022, CAN/36/2022, CAN/37/2022, CAN/38/2022,  
CAN/39/2022, CAN/40/2022, CAN/41/2022, CAN/42/2022,  
CAN/43/2022, CAN/44/2022, CAN/45/2022, CAN/46/2022,  
CAN/47/2022, CAN/48/2022, CAN/49/2022, CAN/50/2022,  
CAN/51/2022, CAN/52/2022, CAN/53/2022, CAN/54/2022,  
CAN/55/2022, CAN/56/2022, CAN/57/2022, CAN/58/2022,  
CAN/59/2022, CAN/60/2022, CAN/61/2022, CAN/62/2022,  
CAN/63/2022, CAN/64/2022, CAN/65/2022, CAN/66/2022,  
CAN/67/2022, CAN/68/2022, CAN/69/2022, CAN/70/2022,  
CAN/71/2023, CAN/72/2023, CAN/73/2023, CAN/74/2023,  
CAN/75/2023, CAN/76/2023, CAN/77/2023**

---

**With**

**MAT/953/2021**

**WEST BENGAL BOARD OF PRIMARY EDUCATION AND ORS**

**VS**

**PAYEL BAG AND ORS**

**With**

**MAT/999/2021**

**WASIM AKRAM MONDAL AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**IA NO: CAN/1/2021, CAN/2/2021**

**With**

**WPA/10005/2021**

**SRIMONTA PAL AND ORS.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/10304/2019**

**GOLAM MOSTAFA**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/10306/2019**

**SUMANA DEY**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

---

**WPA/10308/2019**

**MUNMUN GHOSH**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/1053/2022**

**SUTAPA ROY AND OTHERS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/10540/2019**

**TAPAS MONDAL**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/10541/2019**

**TARIT GHOSH**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/10543/2019**

**RAJESH MONDAL**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/10800/2019**

**SHIBNATH KUMBHAKAR**

---

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/10803/2019**

**SHAFIKUL ISLAM SEKH**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/10909/2018**

**SOURAV ROY**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/10954/2021**

**SUSANTA BETAL AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/10956/2019**

**KUMARI ASTHA**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/10958/2021**

**NABAKANTA SASMAL AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

---

**With**  
**WPA/1099/2021**  
**MIHIR DAS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL**

**With**  
**WPA/11001/2019**  
**ANOWAR HOSSAIN**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**  
**WPA/11002/2019**  
**ANUP SAHOO**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**  
**WPA/11003/2019**  
**MD. SALIM SEIKH**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**  
**WPA/11004/2019**  
**SANTANU PATRA**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**  
**WPA/1125/2021**

---

**MD TANMIR AHMED AND ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**With**  
**WPA/11433/2020**  
**SATYAJIT DAS THAKUR AND ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**With**  
**WPA/11701/2019**  
**PRADIPTA SAHA**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/11702/2019**  
**KAMAL MANDAL**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/12021/2019**  
**ARIFUL ISLAM**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/13016/2019**  
**MD. SABIR SK.**  
**VS**

---

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/1316/2022**

**SRIKUMAR MUKHOPADHYAY AND ANR**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/1353/2020**

**KHOKAN DAS & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/1396/2021**

**PRIYANKA BANDYOPADHYAY AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/14722/2021**

**RAMA BISWAS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ANR**

**With**

**WPA/14728/2021**

**ANKITA DEY**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ANR**

**With**

---

**WPA/14736/2021**

**LIPIKA GHOSH**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ANR**

**With**

**WPA/16242/2019**

**RAJ KUMAR DEY**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/16244/2019**

**ABDUL ALIM**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/164/2022**

**ANUARUL HOQUE**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/16436/2018**

**NIRABUL HOSSAIN**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/16438/2018**

**SHREYA CHAKRABORTY**

---



**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/16440/2018**

**SATHI MAJHI**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/16448/2018**

**RAKHI CHOUDHURY**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/16449/2018**

**BINITA RAY CHAUDHURI**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/16536/2021**

**ATIUR AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/16598/2019**

**TAPAS RAKSHIT & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

---

**With**  
**WPA/17003/2019**  
**MARJINA KHATUN**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/17009/2018**  
**ASHIS KUNDU & ANR**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/17018/2018**  
**BACCHU SAIKH & ANR**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/17024/2018**  
**MOHAMMAD ALI**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/17025/2018**  
**SAMIM BEGUM**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/1704/2021**

---

**BAPAN BANERJEE**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/1729/2022**

**RANU SULTANA**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/1732/2022**

**RUNA RUKSENA PARVIN**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/17406/2019**

**PAMPA BISWAS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/17408/2019**

**UTPAL MARJIT**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/17619/2018**

**DEBABRATA HALDER**

**VS**

---

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/17749/2018**

**PRADIP KUMAR MAITY & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/17944/2019**

**MD. JAMALUDDIN SAIKH @ SK.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/18329/2021**

**ANAMIKA CHOUDHURY AND OTHERS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/18370/2019**

**SUJATA KHAN & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/18865/2018**

**SOMNATH NANDY & ANR**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

---

**WPA/18880/2021**  
**MURSHID ALAM MOLLA AND ANR**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**  
**WPA/19052/2019**  
**ROSHNARA KHATUN**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**  
**WPA/19087/2019**  
**SUJIT MAHATA**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**  
**IA NO: CAN/1/2020**  
**with**  
**WPA/1940/2021**  
**ASGAR SK AND OTHERS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**  
**IA NO: CAN/1/2022**  
**with**  
**WPA/19432/2019**  
**MD MAINUL SK**  
**VS**

---

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/19607/2018**

**DALIA KHATUN**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/19608/2018**

**SUMIT GHOSH**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/19672/2019**

**DILDAR HOSSAIN**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**IA NO: CAN/1/2020**

**With**

**WPA/1971/2021**

**SITAL RAJAK AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/19733/2018**

**KAMLA HOSSEN MONDAL**

**VS**

---

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/1991/2021**  
**BIPUL SARKAR AND OTHERS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**With**  
**WPA/20132/2018**  
**RUNA GHOSH & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/20219/2019**  
**DIPAK MONDAL & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/202/2022**  
**DEBASHREE DEY AND ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**With**  
**WPA/20227/2019**  
**DEBASISH MUKHERJEE**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**

---

**WPA/20246/2018**  
**SRIMANTA DE & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/20249/2018**  
**SURUCHI SAHA & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/20251/2018**  
**CHANDAN NANDI**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/20253/2018**  
**RAGHUNATH BANERJEE & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/20255/2018**  
**SUBRATA CHOUDHURY**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/20257/2018**  
**RATAN KARMAKAR**

---



**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/20258/2018**

**SUDIPTA DAS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/20260/2018**

**RINKU BARMAN**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/20262/2018**

**ABDUL NASIM MONDAL**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/20263/2018**

**PULAK BARMAN**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/20264/2018**

**HOSSEN ALI**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

---

**With**  
**WPA/20265/2018**  
**BABOR SK**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**  
**WPA/20314/2018**  
**PRIYANKA BHATTACHARYA**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**With**  
**WPA/20317/2018**  
**TANVI AZMI**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**With**  
**WPA/20332/2019**  
**ISMAIL JABIULLAH**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**  
**WPA/20341/2019**  
**MANIRUL HOQUE**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**  
**WPA/204/2021**

---

**DIBYENDU NANDI AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/204/2022**

**MD ANGUR ALI AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/20422/2018**

**SK. ALKAS ALI**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/20425/2018**

**PRIYANKA KONAR**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**With**

**WPA/20484/2018**

**SONAMONI SARKAR & ORS.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**With**

**WPA/20495/2018**

**TARAK NATH KUNDU & ORS**

**VS**

---

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**With**  
**WPA/20642/2021**  
**SHILPI MALAKAR**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**  
**WPA/2097/2022**  
**MD. ILIAS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**  
**WPA/20987/2019**  
**DALIA BHATTACHARJEE & ORS.**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**  
**WPA/20988/2019**  
**ARJINA KHATUN & ORS.**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**  
**WPA/20989/2019**  
**SUDEV CH. SARKAR & ORS.**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

---

**with**

**WPA/20990/2019**

**SAJJAK ALAM & ORS.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/20991/2019**

**KUNAL ROY & ORS.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/21191/2018**

**LIPIKA SAHA**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/21398/2018**

**MONIMALA JANA & ORS.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/21407/2018**

**SUDIP GHOSH**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/21411/2018**

---

**AYESHA KHATUN & ORS.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/21531/2018**

**MIRZA ALIUL AZIM & ANR.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/21649/2018**

**KANU BALLAV ADHIKARI**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/21650/2018**

**BUDDHADEV JANA**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/21717/2019**

**JOYDEV KUNDU**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/21725/2018**

**NUPUR SAMANTA**

**VS**

---

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/21751/2019**

**MOUMITA DEBNATH & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/21766/2018**

**SOUGATA MUKHERJEE & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/21859/2018**

**BIDHAN MANDAL & ORS.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/219/2021**

**BEAUTY GHOSH**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/22274/2018**

**SAHAJAN ALI & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

---

**WPA/2245/2021**  
**MD. ABDUL KAYUM AND ORS**  
**VS**  
**THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/22507/2018**  
**MD. AKID JAVED & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/22701/2019**  
**MD. WASHIM AKRAM**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/22732/2018**  
**TANUSHRI MAHATO**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**IA NO: CAN/1/2020**  
**with**  
**WPA/22848/2018**  
**TAJUDDIN AHMED & ANR**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/229/2021**

---



**KAZI MOFIJUL ISLAM AND ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/22962/2018**

**CHAITALI DEY**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/22998/2018**

**SAJID AHMED & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/23013/2018**

**TATHAGATA NANDY & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/23016/2018**

**SAHIDA BANU**

**VS**

**STATE OF W.B. & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/23122/2018**

**ATASHI DUTTA**

**VS**

---

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL &ORS**

**with**

**WPA/23129/2018**

**JAYASHREE DE**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL &ORS**

**with**

**WPA/23132/2018**

**SANJUKTA SARKAR**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL &ORS**

**with**

**WPA/23141/2018**

**PINKEY DEY**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL &ORS**

**with**

**WPA/23353/2018**

**MONONJIT SARKAR**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/23609/2019**

**PRADIP SAU & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

---

**WPA/24496/2018**  
**SABINA KHATUN & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/24499/2018**  
**SUDIP KUMAR GHOSH & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/24520/2018**  
**TARUN MAHATA & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/24522/2018**  
**RAMIZ AHMED & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/24523/2018**  
**MUNSEHWAR CHOUDHURY & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/24556/2018**  
**LUTFAR RAHAMAN & ORS**

---

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/2460/2018**

**TAMALI DATTA ROY**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/2469/2021**

**MIR JASMINA AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**IA NO: CAN/1/2022**

**with**

**WPA/24917/2018**

**ASHOK KUMAR MAITY**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/24919/2018**

**APURBA KUMAR MAL**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/24986/2018**

**BIBHAS MANDAL**

**VS**

---

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/25180/2018**

**SONALI SADHAK**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/25374/2018**

**PIYALI PAKHIRA**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/25375/2018**

**GOUTAM MOUR**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/25376/2018**

**MITHU GHOSH(MOUR)**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/25502/2018**

**LABANYAMOY GHOSH**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

---

**WPA/26065/2018**  
**A.I. MEHEDI HASSAN**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/26067/2018**  
**SAMIM MEHEDI HASAN**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/26069/2018**  
**DIBYENDU BHUIN**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/26071/2018**  
**NASERIN RAHAMAN & ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/26076/2018**  
**MANTU PARAMANIK**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/26078/2018**  
**SK. ANIRUDDHA & ORS**

---

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/26084/2018**

**GAUTAM BARMAN & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/26146/2018**

**KAZI MD MOHSIN & ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**IA NO: CAN/1/2022**

**with**

**WPA/2628/2021**

**BAPI DAS AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/26317/2018**

**SAIFUDDIN SK**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/26320/2018**

**SANTOSH MALIK & ORS**

**VS**

---

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/2719/2021**  
**PARAMA GHOSH**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/2800/2019**  
**SHIB SANKAR PAL& ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL& ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/2802/2021**  
**SUMITRA BHUNIA**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/2811/2019**  
**REBA KHATUN**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL &ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/300/2021**  
**BAMA CHARAN SATPATI**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**

---



**WPA/303/2021**  
**TAPAS KUMR JANA**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/307/2021**  
**DIPANKAR PATRA**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/310/2021**  
**SUBHAJIT SUTRADHAR**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/3121/2021**  
**TUMPA NAYAK**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/314/2019**  
**ALOKE SARKAR**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**  
**with**  
**WPA/348/2022**  
**FARHANA ISLAM AND ORS**

---

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/350/2022**

**SAHIUR RAHAMAN MIDDHYA AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/351/2022**

**SUKUR MOHAMMAD AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/4083/2021**

**CHUMKI MANDAL AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/4414/2021**

**NAJEM HOSSAIN AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**IA NO: CAN/1/2022**

**with**

**WPA/4451/2019**

**DIPAK JANA**

**VS**

---

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/4903/2019**

**RIPON SK.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/4920/2021**

**NARGIS AKTAR BANU AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/4954/2020**

**KATHAKALI MANDAL (GHOSH)**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/4955/2020**

**PALASH MANDAL**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/5482/2021**

**ALI REZA SHAIKH AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

---

**WPA/5550/2021**  
**MASUD KARIM AND ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/5584/2022**  
**MD NASIMUL GANI AND ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/5663/2021**  
**TANMAY GHOSH**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/6158/2022**  
**PRASANTA DEBNATH AND ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/6291/2021**  
**DEBASIS ROY**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/668/2021**  
**MAHENUR KHATUN AND OTHERS**

---

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/685/2021**

**SUBHAS GHOSH AND OTHERS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/689/2022**

**SAIKAT GANGULY AND ANR**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/738/2021**

**KOUSIK JANA AND OTHERS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/7809/2019**

**BASIR AHMED**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**IA NO: CAN/39/2019(Old No:CAN/10172/2019), CAN/54/2019(Old No:CAN/10552/2019), CAN/55/2019(Old No:CAN/10564/2019), CAN/68/2019(Old No:CAN/10734/2019), CAN/73/2019(Old No:CAN/10866/2019), CAN/74/2019(Old No:CAN/11884/2019), CAN/75/2020(Old No:CAN/2535/2020), CAN/76/2020(Old No:CAN/2536/2020), CAN/77/2020(Old No:CAN/2537/2020), CAN/78/2020(Old No:CAN/2881/2020), CAN/79/2020, CAN/80/2020, CAN/81/2020, CAN/82/2021, CAN/83/2021, CAN/84/2021,**

CAN/85/2021, CAN/86/2021, CAN/87/2021, CAN/88/2022,  
 CAN/89/2022, CAN/90/2022, CAN/91/2022, CAN/92/2022,  
 CAN/93/2022, CAN/94/2022, CAN/95/2022, CAN/96/2022,  
 CAN/97/2022, CAN/98/2022, CAN/99/2022, CAN/100/2022,  
 CAN/101/2022, CAN/102/2022, CAN/103/2022, CAN/104/2022,  
 CAN/105/2022, CAN/106/2022, CAN/107/2022, CAN/108/2022,  
 CAN/109/2022, CAN/110/2022, CAN/111/2022, CAN/112/2022,  
 CAN/113/2022, CAN/114/2022, CAN/115/2022, CAN/116/2022,  
 CAN/117/2022, CAN/118/2022, CAN/119/2022, CAN/120/2022,  
 CAN/121/2022, CAN/122/2022, CAN/123/2022, CAN/124/2022,  
 CAN/125/2022, CAN/126/2022, CAN/127/2022, CAN/128/2022,  
 CAN/129/2022, CAN/130/2022, CAN/131/2022, CAN/132/2022,  
 CAN/133/2022, CAN/134/2022, CAN/135/2022, CAN/136/2022,  
 CAN/137/2022, CAN/138/2022, CAN/139/2022, CAN/140/2022,  
 CAN/141/2022, CAN/142/2022, CAN/143/2022, CAN/144/2022,  
 CAN/145/2022, CAN/146/2022, CAN/147/2022, CAN/148/2022,  
 CAN/149/2022, CAN/150/2022, CAN/151/2022, CAN/152/2022,  
 CAN/153/2022, CAN/154/2022, CAN/155/2022, CAN/156/2022,  
 CAN/157/2022, CAN/158/2022, CAN/159/2022, CAN/160/2022,  
 CAN/161/2022, CAN/162/2022, CAN/163/2022, CAN/164/2022,  
 CAN/165/2022, CAN/166/2022, CAN/167/2022, CAN/168/2022,  
 CAN/169/2022, CAN/170/2022, CAN/171/2022, CAN/172/2022,  
 CAN/173/2022, CAN/174/2022, CAN/175/2022, CAN/176/2022,  
 CAN/177/2022, CAN/178/2022, CAN/179/2022, CAN/180/2022,  
 CAN/181/2022, CAN/182/2022, CAN/183/2022, CAN/184/2022,  
 CAN/185/2022, CAN/186/2022, CAN/187/2022, CAN/188/2022,  
 CAN/189/2022, CAN/190/2022, CAN/191/2022, CAN/192/2022,  
 CAN/193/2022, CAN/194/2022, CAN/195/2022, CAN/196/2023,  
 CAN/197/2023, CAN/198/2023, CAN/199/2023, CAN/200/2023,  
 CAN/201/2023, CAN/202/2023 IA NO: CAN/39/2019(Old  
 No:CAN/10172/2019), CAN/54/2019(Old No:CAN/10552/2019),  
 CAN/55/2019(Old No:CAN/10564/2019), CAN/68/2019(Old  
 No:CAN/10734/2019), CAN/73/2019(Old No:CAN/10866/2019),  
 CAN/74/2019(Old No:CAN/11884/2019), CAN/75/2020(Old  
 No:CAN/2535/2020), CAN/76/2020(Old No:CAN/2536/2020),  
 CAN/77/2020(Old No:CAN/2537/2020), CAN/78/2020(Old  
 No:CAN/2881/2020), CAN/79/2020, CAN/80/2020, CAN/81/2020,  
 CAN/82/2021, CAN/83/2021, CAN/84/2021, CAN/85/2021,  
 CAN/86/2021, CAN/87/2021, CAN/88/2022, CAN/89/2022,  
 CAN/90/2022, CAN/91/2022, CAN/92/2022, CAN/93/2022,  
 CAN/94/2022, CAN/95/2022, CAN/96/2022, CAN/97/2022,  
 CAN/98/2022, CAN/99/2022, CAN/100/2022, CAN/101/2022,  
 CAN/102/2022, CAN/103/2022, CAN/104/2022, CAN/105/2022,  
 CAN/106/2022, CAN/107/2022, CAN/108/2022, CAN/109/2022,  
 CAN/110/2022, CAN/111/2022, CAN/112/2022, CAN/113/2022,  
 CAN/114/2022, CAN/115/2022, CAN/116/2022, CAN/117/2022,

CAN/118/2022, CAN/119/2022, CAN/120/2022, CAN/121/2022,  
 CAN/122/2022, CAN/123/2022, CAN/124/2022, CAN/125/2022,  
 CAN/126/2022, CAN/127/2022, CAN/128/2022, CAN/129/2022,  
 CAN/130/2022, 21 CAN/131/2022, CAN/132/2022, CAN/133/2022,  
 CAN/134/2022, CAN/135/2022, CAN/136/2022, CAN/137/2022,  
 CAN/138/2022, CAN/139/2022, CAN/140/2022, CAN/141/2022,  
 CAN/142/2022, CAN/143/2022, CAN/144/2022, CAN/145/2022,  
 CAN/146/2022, CAN/147/2022, CAN/148/2022, CAN/149/2022,  
 CAN/150/2022, CAN/151/2022, CAN/152/2022, CAN/153/2022,  
 CAN/154/2022, CAN/155/2022, CAN/156/2022, CAN/157/2022,  
 CAN/158/2022, CAN/159/2022, CAN/160/2022, CAN/161/2022,  
 CAN/162/2022, CAN/163/2022, CAN/164/2022, CAN/165/2022,  
 CAN/166/2022, CAN/167/2022, CAN/168/2022, CAN/169/2022,  
 CAN/170/2022, CAN/171/2022, CAN/172/2022, CAN/173/2022,  
 CAN/174/2022, CAN/175/2022, CAN/176/2022, CAN/177/2022,  
 CAN/178/2022, CAN/179/2022, CAN/180/2022, CAN/181/2022,  
 CAN/182/2022, CAN/183/2022, CAN/184/2022, CAN/185/2022,  
 CAN/186/2022, CAN/187/2022, CAN/188/2022, CAN/189/2022,  
 CAN/190/2022, CAN/191/2022, CAN/192/2022, CAN/193/2022,  
 CAN/194/2022, CAN/195/2022, CAN/196/2023, CAN/197/2023,  
 CAN/198/2023, CAN/199/2023, CAN/200/2023, CAN/201/2023,  
 CAN/202/2023

with

WPA/7988/2021

RENUKA DAS AND ORS

VS

STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.

with

WPA/8028/2022

KARTIK PRAMANIK AND ORS

VS

STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.

with

WPA/816/2021

NITAI MANDAL AND ORS

---

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/824/2021**

**SHAMIM RAHAMAN AND ORS**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

**with**

**WPA/8290/2019**

**LILABATI DEY**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/8613/2019**

**JAKIR HOSSAIN**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/8614/2019**

**JOSHEF REJA SK.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

**with**

**WPA/8889/2021**

**ELIUS HASAN AND ORS.**

**VS**

**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**

---



**with**  
**WPA/9188/2021**  
**BASIRUDDIN AND ORS**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL AND ORS.**  
**with**  
**WPA/9947/2019**  
**GOUTAM KOTAL**  
**VS**  
**STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS**

For the appellants : Mr. Lakhi Kumar Gupta

in MAT 1594 of 2018  
& all other matters  
Mr. Subir Sanyal  
Mr. Saikat Banerjee  
Mr. K. Chowdhury  
Mr. Ratul Biswas

For the Respondent in : Mr. Bikash Ranjan Bhattacharyya  
MAT 1594 of 2018 & Mr. Dibyendu Chatterjee  
Writ Petitioner in WPA Ms. Piyali Paul  
10005 of 2021, Ms. Jhuma Chakraborty  
WPA 10909 of 2018, Mr. Rahul Deb Goenka  
WPA 14736 of 2021, Mr. Pritam Mazumder  
WPA 16598 of 2019  
WPA 17749 of 2018,  
WPA 18370 of 2019,  
WPA 1991 of 2021,  
WP 20132 of 2018,  
WPA 20219 of 2019,  
WPA 21717 of 2019,  
WPA 21751 of 2019,  
WPA 22274 of 2018,  
WPA 22507 of 2018,  
WPA 22848 of 2018,  
WPA 23013 of 2018,  
WPA 23016 of 2018,  
WPA 24496 of 2018,  
WPA 24499 of 2018,  
WPA 24520 of 2018,

WPA 24522 of 2018,  
 WPA 24523 of 2018,  
 WPA 24556 of 2018,  
 WPA 25180 of 2018,  
 WPA 25502 of 2018  
 and WPA 2628 of 2021,  
 WPA 2021/2019  
 WPA 204/2021,  
 WPA 21751/2019,  
 WPA 8028/2022.

|                       |   |                            |
|-----------------------|---|----------------------------|
| For the petitioner in | : | Mr. Kamalesh Bhattacharyya |
| WPA 5663 of 2021,     |   | Mr. Aninda Bhattacharya    |
| WPA 2800 of 2019 &    |   |                            |
| WPA 26146 of 2018     |   |                            |

|                        |   |                                 |
|------------------------|---|---------------------------------|
| For the Respondent in  | : | Mr. Bikash Ranjan Bhattacharyya |
| MAT 1594/2018 &        |   | Mr. Sudipta Dasgupta            |
| MAT 953/2021 &         |   | Mr. Bikram Banerjee             |
| Writ Petitioner in     |   | Mr. Arka Nandi                  |
| WPA 16436 of 2018,     |   | Ms. Dipa Acharya                |
| WPA 16438 of 2018,     |   | Mr. Sutirtha Nayek              |
| WPA 16440 of 2018,     |   |                                 |
| WPA 16448 of 2018      |   |                                 |
| and WPA 16449 of 2018. |   |                                 |

|                            |   |                       |
|----------------------------|---|-----------------------|
| For the Intervenor in      | : | Mr. Ali Ahsan Alamgir |
| MAT 999 of 2021 and        |   | Ms. Rabia Khatoon     |
| MAT 1594 of 2018 &         |   | Ms. Soma Mal          |
| applicants in CAN 42/2022, |   |                       |
| CAN 43/2022,               |   |                       |
| CAN 61/2022, CAN 62/2022   |   |                       |

and WPA 7809 of 2019 of  
 CAN 120/2022, CAN 146/2022,  
 CAN 147/2022, CAN 149/2022,  
 CAN 155/2022, CAN 157/2022,  
 CAN 158/2022, CAN 162/2022,  
 CAN 167/2022, CAN 171/2022,  
 CAN 177/2022, CAN 178/2022,  
 CAN 180/2022, CAN 181/2022,  
 CAN 196 of 2022 & CAN 199 of 2022.

For the Appellant in MAT 999/2021  
 & Writ Petitioner in WPA10304/23019,  
 WPA10306/2019,  
 WPA10308/2019, WPA10540/2019,  
 WPA10541/2019, WPA10543/2019,  
 WPA10800/2019, WPA10803/2019,  
 WPA11001/2019, WPA11002/2019,  
 WPA 11003/2019, WPA1125/2021,  
 WPA11701/2019, WPA11702/2019,  
 WPA 12021/2019, WPA13016/2019,  
 WPA 16242/2019, WPA16244/2019,  
 WPA 164/2022, WPA17003/2019,  
 WPA 17024/2018, WPA17025/2018,  
 WPA 1704/2012, WPA1729/2022,  
 WPA 1732/2022, WPA17406/2019,  
 WPA17408/2019, WPA 17009/2018,  
 WPA17018 of 2018, WPA 17944/2019,  
 WPA 18865/2018, WPA 18880/2021,

: Mr. Ali Ahsan Alamgir  
 Ms. Rabia Khatoon  
 Ms. Soma Mal

WPA 19052/2019, WPA 19087/2019,  
WPA 19432/2019, WPA 19607/2018,  
WPA 19608/2018, WPA 20227/2019,  
WPA 20314/2018, WPA 20317/2018,  
WPA 20332/2019, 20341/2019,  
WPA 204/2022, WPA 20642/2021,  
WPA 2097/2022, WPA 21191/2018,  
WPA 219/2021, WPA 2245/2021,  
WPA 314/2019, WPA 5584/2022,  
WPA 8290/2019, WPA 8613/2019,  
WPA 8614/2019, WPA 8889/2021,  
WPA 9947/2019, WPA 22732/2018  
& WPA 26146 of 2018.

For the Writ Petitioner in

WPA 10954 of 2021, WPA 10958 of 2021,  
WPA 11433 of 2020, WPA1971 of 2021,  
WPA 20246 of 2018, WPA 20249 of 2018,  
WPA 20251 of 2018, WPA 20253 of 2018,  
WPA20255 of 2018, WPA 20257 of 2018,  
WPA 20258 of 2018, WPA 20260 of 2018,  
WPA 20262 of 2018, WPA 20263 of 2018,  
WPA 20264 of 2018, WPA 20265 of 2018,  
WPA 20484 of 2018, WPA 20495 of 2018,  
WPA 21398 of 2018, WPA 21407 of 2018,  
WPA 21411 of 2018, WPA 21766 of 2018,  
WPA 229 of 2021, WPA 22962 of 2018,  
WPA 22998 of 2018, WPA 23609 of 2019,

: Mr. Firdous Samim

Ms. Gopa Biswas

Ms. Moushumi Hazra

WPA 26065 of 2018, WPA 26067 of 2018  
 WPA 26069 of 2018, WPA 26071 of 2018,  
 WPA 26076 of 2018, WPA 26078 of 2018,  
 WPA 26084 of 2018, WPA 26317 of 2018,  
 WPA 26320 of 2018, WPA 2811 of 2019,  
 WPA 348 of 2022, WPA 349 of 2022,  
 WPA 350 of 2022, WPA 351 of 2022,  
 WPA 4083 of 2021, WPA 7988 of 2021  
 and WPA 824 of 2021.

For the applicants in CAN 7 of 2022  
 and CAN 8 of 2022, CAN 94 of 2022,  
 CAN 102 of 2022, CAN 108 of 2022,  
 CAN 118 of 2022, CAN 132 of 2022,  
 CAN 177 of 2022, CAN 187 of 2022.

: Mr. Firdous Samim  
 Ms. Gopa Biswas  
 Ms. Moushumi Hazra

For the petitioner in WPA  
 19672/2019

: Mr. Amit Kumar Dutta

For the petitioner in WPA 202/2022  
 & applicant in CAN 66/2022,  
 CAN 13 of 2022, CAN 14 of 2022,  
 CAN 15 of 2022, CAN 16 of 2022,  
 CAN 17 of 2022, CAN 19 of 2022,  
 CAN 23 of 2022, CAN 36 of 2022,  
 CAN 37 of 2022, CAN 38 of 2022,  
 CAN 39 of 2022, CAN 44 of 2022,  
 CAN 46 of 2022, CAN 48 of 2022,

: Mr. Gautam Banerjee  
 Mr. Sandip Kumar Mondal  
 Ms. Priya Dey  
 Mr. Sumit Routh  
 Ms. Chumki Das Bairagya  
 Ms. Riya Das

CAN 50 of 2022, CAN 51 of 202,  
 CAN 55 of 2022, CAN 58 of 2022,  
 CAN 60 of 2022, CAN 64 of 2022,  
 CAN 70 of 2022, CAN 73 of 2022,  
 CAN 74 of 2022, CAN 75 of 2022.

For the Appellant in MAT 1594 : Mr. Sudipta Dasgupta  
 of 2018 & Writ Petitioner in  
 WPA 16436 of 2018, WPA 16438  
 of 2018, WPA 16440 of 2018, WPA  
 16448 of 2018, WPA 16449 of 2018

For the petitioner in WPA 1099/2021, : Mr. Goutam Dey  
 WPA 668/2021, WPA 738/2021, Mr. Dipendu Sarka  
 WPA816/2021 Mr. Kaushal Kumar  
 Ms. Ankita Ghosh

For the petitioner in WPA 7809 of 2019. : Mr. Atarup Banerjee  
 Mr. Abu Sohel  
 Ms. Poulami Roy

For the petitioner in WPA18329/2021, : Mr. Avirup Chatterjee  
 WPA 2469/2021, WPA 4414/2021,  
 WPA 4920/2022, WPA 5482/2021,  
 WPA 9188/2021, WPA 1053/2022,  
 WPA 6158/2022

For the petitioner in WPA 22701 of 2019, : Mr. Gazi Faruque Hossain  
 WPA 4954 of 2020, WPA 4955 of 2020, Ms. Priyanka Mondal

WPA 6291 of 2021

for the petitioners in WPA 21859/2018, : Mr. Anindya Bose  
 WPA 23353/2018 WPA 24917/2018, Mr. Diptendu Mondal  
 WPA 24919/2018 WPA 17619/2018, Mr. Nikhil Kr. Gupta  
 WPA 4451/2019 WPA 590/2019, Mr. Mridul Biswas  
 WPA 1396/2021, WPA 23353/2018,  
 WPA 24234/2018.

For the petitioner in WPA 14722 of 2021, : Mr. Avijit Chakraborty  
 WPA 14728 of 2021 and WPA 14736 of 2021.

For the petitioner in WPA 2460 of 2018 : Mr. Sukanta Chakraborty  
 Mr. Juber Ahamed

For the petitioner in WPA 1316 of 2022, : Mr. S.P. Lahiri  
 WPA 2719 of 2021 and WPA 5550 of 2021. Mr. R. Naskar

For the petitioner in WPA 21725/2018, : Ms. Rama Haldar  
 WPA 2802/2021, WPA 689/2022,  
 WPA 21649/2018, WPA 21650/2018,

For the applicant/petitioner in : Mr. Biswarup Biswas  
 CAN 56/2022 & 57/2022 of MAT Mr. Samik Dey  
 1594 of 2018 Mr. Subhadeep Adhikari

For the addition of party : Mr. Ritam Chowdhury  
 in CAN 63 of 2022, CAN 69 of 2022.

|                                                                  |                                                                                                  |
|------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| For the petitioner in<br>WPA 21766 of 2018.                      | : Ms. Priyakshi Banerjee<br>Mr. Sabyasachi Roy                                                   |
| For the State in WPA 16448 of 2018                               | : Mr. Rajarshi Basu<br>Mr. S.T. Mina                                                             |
| For the State in WPA 5663 of 2021,<br>WPA19432 of 2019           | : Mr. Rajaram Banerjee                                                                           |
| For the Resp. in WPA 16448 of<br>2018.                           | : Mr. Pratick Sardar                                                                             |
| For the State in WPA 10954 of 2018,<br>WPA 10958 of 2018         | : Mr. Bhaskar Prasad Vaisya<br>Mr. Ranjan Saha                                                   |
| For the applicant in CAN 37 of 2022<br>& CAN 49 of 2022          | : Mr. Rabi Sankar Chattopahyay<br>Mr. Sayan Chattopadhyay<br>Mr. Ivan Sarkar<br>Mr. R. Ali Molla |
| For the applicant in CAN 150/2022<br>of WPA 7809/2019            | : Mr. Anshuman Chakraborty<br>Mr. Prasanta Bishal                                                |
| For the applicant CAN 152/2022,<br>CAN 159/2022 of WPA 7809/2019 | : Mr. Prabir Kr. Chowdhuri                                                                       |
| For the State in WPA 16536 of 2021                               | : Mr. Bhaskar Prasad Vaisya<br>Mr. Arindam Chattopadhyay                                         |



|                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                   |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| For the State in WPA 20988 of 2019                                                                                                                                                                           | : Mr. Bhaskar Prasad Vaisya<br>Mr. Sagnik Chatterjee                              |
| For the State in WPA 7809 of 2019<br>& for DPSC in WPA 8290 of 2019                                                                                                                                          | : Mr. Bhaskar Prasad Vaisya<br>Mr. Suman Dey                                      |
| For the State in MAT 953 of 2021                                                                                                                                                                             | : Mr. Amal Kumar Sen, Ld. AGP<br>Mr. Sajal Pandit                                 |
| For the State in WPA 14728 of 2021                                                                                                                                                                           | : Mr. Pinaki Dhole<br>Mr. Avishek Prasad                                          |
| For the DPSC in MAT 1594 of 2018<br>& for State in WPA 16536 of 2021                                                                                                                                         | : Mr. Arindam Chattopadhyay                                                       |
| For the State in WPA 10909 of 2018,<br>WPA 20255 of 2018, WPA 21766 of 2018,<br>WPA 23609 of 2019 and WPA 2460 of 2018,<br>WPA 16536/2021                                                                    | : Mr. Arindam Chattopadhyay<br>Ms. Lipika Chatterjee<br>Mr. Bhaksar Prasad Vaisya |
| For the State in WPA 20257 of 2018,<br>WPA 20314/2018                                                                                                                                                        | : Mr. Susanta Pal<br>Mr. Prabir Kumar Roy                                         |
| For the State in WPA 25375 of 2018                                                                                                                                                                           | : Mr. Susovan Sengupta<br>Mr. Manas Kumar Sadhu                                   |
| For the DPSC, Nadia/State in<br>MAT 1594 of 2018, WPA 12021/2019,<br>WPA 10306/2019, WPA 10541/2019,<br>WPA 10909/2018, WPA 10950/2019,<br>WPA 11001/2019, WPA 1125 /2021,<br>WPA 17024/2018, WPA17944/2019, | : Mr. Arindam Chattopadhyay<br>Ms. Lipika Chatterjee                              |

WPA 19052/2019, WPA19607/2018,  
 WPA 8614/2019, WPA 19733/2018,  
 WPA 20255/2018, WPA 20257/2018,  
 WPA 21760/2018, WPA 2460/2018,  
 WPA 314/2019, WPA 19672/2019,  
 WPA 3121 of 2021, WPA 23609/2018,  
 WPA 2460/2018, WPA 314/2019,  
 WPA 19672/2019, WPA 3121/2021,  
 WPA 12021/2019, WPA 10956/2019,  
 WPA17014/2018, WPA 17944/2019,  
 WPA19052/2019, WPA 19607/2018,  
 WPA 8614/2019.

For the DPSC, Dakshin Dinajpur in  
 WPA 17749 of 2018 and State in  
 WPA 1732/2022, WPA 7988/2021

Mr. Supriya Chattopadhyay

: Mr. Supriya Chattopadhyay  
 Ms. Iti Dutta

For the State in WPA 1053 of 2022,  
 WPA 2802 of 2021 & WPA 8290 of 2019.

: Mr. Suman Dey

For the DPSC in WPA 21649 of 2018,  
 WPA 21650/2018

: Mr. Bhaskar Prasad Vaisya  
 Mr. Nilay Baran Mondal

For the DPSC, Purba Medinipur in  
 WPA 7809/2019

: Mr. Kamal Mishra

For the DPSC in WPA 20132 of 2018

: Mr. Bhaskar Prasad Vaisya  
 Mr. Suman Dey

Mr. Sagnik Chatterjee  
 Mr. Pinaki Bhattacharyya  
 Mr. Nilay Baran Mondal

For the State in WPA 10954/2018,  
 WPA 10958/2018 WPA 202/2022

: Mr. Bhaskar Prasad Vaisya  
 Mr. Raja Saha  
 Mr. Suman Dey

for the State in WPA 8028 of 2022

: Mr. Raja Saha  
 Mr. Binekananda Tripathy

for the State in WPA 7809/2019  
 & WPA 202 of 2022

: Mr. Bhaskar Prasad Vaisya  
 Mr. Suman Dey

For the Added Resp. in  
 WPA 7809 of 2019

: Mr. Asit Baran Ghosh  
 Mr. Somesh Ghosh

For the Resp. in MAT 1594/2018  
 of CAN 65/2022

: Ms. Aparupa Bhattacharyya

For the applicant in CAN 37 of 2022  
 in MAT 1594 of 2018 and CAN 168 of 2022  
 & CAN 183 of 2022 in WPA 7809 of 2019

: Mr. Santanu Maji  
 Mr. Sayan Chattopadhyay  
 Mr. Subhayu Das

For the applicant in CAN 39 of 2022,  
 CAN 52 of 2022 & CAN 72 of 2022  
 of MAT 1594 of 2018

: Mr. Sandipan Das  
 Ms. Indrani Roy

For the NCTE in all matters

: Mr. Sauvik Nandy

For the Writ Petitioner in WPA 2397 of 2021,  
 WPA 2400 of 2021, WPA 2733 of 2021,  
 WPA 3969 of 2022 & WPA 3972 of 2022  
 and for applicant in CAN 80 of 2020 and  
 CAN 82 of 2021 of WPA 7809 of 2019  
 and CAN 7990 of 2019 and CAN 8003 of 2019  
 of MAT 1594 of 2018 and WPA 7909 of 2019

: Mr. Gopal Das

....

For the petitioner/respondent in  
 WPA 2460/2018

: Ms. Tamali Dutta Roy  
 Mr. Sukanta Chakraborty  
 Mr. Zubin Ahamed

For the applicant in CAN 11 of 2022  
 of MAT 1594 of 2018

: Mr. Samim Ahammed  
 Ms. Ambiya Khatun

For the applicant in CAN 1 of 2022  
 of WPA 19672 of 2019

: Mr. K.D. Poddar  
 Mr. Amit Kr. Dutta

.....

For the applicant in CAN 56 of 0222,  
 CAN 57 of 2022. In MAT 1594/2018.

: Mr. Suman Dey  
 Mr. Subhadeep Adhikari

For the State in WPA 22962 of 2021,  
 WPA 10803 of 2019, WPA 14736 of 2021

: Mr. Sudipta Panda  
 Ms. Munmun Tewari

for the petitioner in WPA 3121/2021.

: Ms. Sujata Mukherjee

For the State in WPA 2097/2022,  
 WPA 5584/2022

: Mr. Swapan Kr. Dutta, Ld.AGP  
 Mr. Pradyut Kr. Das

Mr. Rajat Dutta

for the State in WPA 20990/2019,  
WPA 10800/2019

: Mr. Sajal Kumar Pandit

For the State in  
WPA 8290 of 2019.

: Mr. Rabindra Nath Pal

For the State in WPA 24556/2018

: Mr. Tapas Kumar Mondal

For the DPSC, Nadia in  
MAT 1594/2018

: Mr. Arindam Chattopadhyay

For the State in WPA 10308/2019,  
WPA 16598/2019, WPA 17025/2018,  
WPA 17406/2019, WPA 19733/2018  
& WPA 20251/2018

: Mr. Tulshi Das Roy

For the applicants in  
all matters.

: Mr. Goutam Banerjee  
Ms. Priya Dey

For the applicants of CAN 193 of 2022  
& CAN 194 of 2022 in WPA 7809 of 2019.

: Ms. Reshmi Ghosh  
Mr. Golam Mahiuddin  
Mr. Raja Mandal

For the applicant of CAN 53 of 2022  
in MAT 1594 of 2018

: Ms. Sonam Ray

For the State in WPA 6291 of 2021

: Mr. Debasis Roy

Sk. Md. Masud

Heard On : 06.01.2023

Judgement Delivered On : 13.04.2023

**Supratim Bhattacharya, J.:-** This bunch of appeals with their connected applications as well as the several writ petitions attached to this bunch of appeals involve a common question of fact and law. The common question is the claim of the private respondents to MAT 1594 of 2018 and MAT 953 of 2021 and the appellants in MAT 999 of 2021 along with the several writ petitioners in the writ petitions appearing for analogous consideration with, these appeals, pertains to grant of six marks against six wrong question and answer keys of the Teacher Eligibility Test (TET), 2014 Examination conducted by the West Bengal Board of Primary Education (for short, the *Board*).

By an initial Order dated 3<sup>rd</sup> of October, 2018 in the writ petition being WP 23006 (W) of 2017, a Hon'ble Single Bench was pleased to grant six marks to all the writ petitioners who arrived before the Court with the complaint that the six questions and answer keys of the TET 2014 paper were wrong.

The Secretary West Bengal Board of Primary Education was directed to award marks to the petitioner/petitioners who attempted the wrong question/options in the key answers of JGB question booklet series and after awarding marks if it is found that the petitioner/petitioners is/are otherwise eligible then the Secretary is further directed to take steps to give appointment

to the petitioner/ petitioners in accordance with law against the available vacant post of assistant teacher/teachers. It has also been mentioned that the said order is strictly restricted in respect of the mentioned writ petitions.

The fact of the present case is that the respondents/petitioners had appeared in the Teacher Eligibility Test, 2014 (hereinafter referred to as TET 2014) along with other examinees. After the result of the said examination been declared these writ petitioners found themselves to have been unsuccessful in clearing the said examination which is one of the criteria which is required to be possessed for being eligible to be an assistant teacher. Being unsuccessful the writ petitioners challenged the assessment of the said examination. They further challenged the said question paper on the ground that some questions were wrong.

The Hon'ble Single Bench after hearing all the parties concerned appointed the Vice Chancellor Visva Bharati to examine correctness of the 11 questions of JGB Question Booklet series by experts. The Vice Chancellor of Visva Bharati submitted the expert report in respect of the 11 questions in two phases. After going through the aforesaid expert report, the Secretary of West Bengal Board of Primary Education was directed to take the steps as has been directed by the impugned orders.

Being dissatisfied with the order of the Hon'ble Single Bench stating that the impugned orders are strictly restricted in respect of writ petitions/petitioner, one Basir Ahmed filed an independent appeal with the

leave of the Court for a declaration that the order passed by the Learned Single Judge operated *in rem* and not *in personam*. A coordinate Division Bench of this Court rejected the prayer for leave to appeal and being aggrieved by the said rejection a Special Leave Petition was preferred before the Hon'ble Apex Court. By an order dated 1<sup>st</sup> of April 2019 the Hon'ble Supreme Court, *inter alia* granted liberty to file a writ petition which is to be heard along with the appeal filed by the West Bengal Board of Primary Education (for short the Board), in order to bring finality to the dispute. As such this instant appeal.

Being aggrieved and dissatisfied with the Judgement and Order dated 03.10.2018 of the Hon'ble Single Bench passed in W.P. No. 23006 (W) of 2017 the appellant that is the Board has preferred the instant appeal being No. MAT No. 1594 of 2018.

Thereafter one Basir Ahmed preferred a leave to appeal before a concurrent Hon'ble Division Bench of this Court *inter alia* praying that the effect of the Judgement and Order dated 3.10.2018 should be *in rem* instead of being *in personam*. The concurrent Hon'ble Division Bench by an order dated 5.02.2019 dismissed the leave to appeal challenging the said order dated 5.02.2019. The said Basir Ahmed preferred a Special leave to Appeal being SLP (C) No. 5945 of 2019 the Hon'ble Supreme Court was *inter alia* pleased to dispose of the appeal requesting the Hon'ble High Court at Calcutta to expeditiously dispose of the appeal filed by the Board together with other pending writ petitions on the same issue.



The Learned Counsel appearing on behalf of the West Bengal Board of the Primary Education has during his submission stated that the present Mandamus appeal of the Board is from a common Judgement dated 03.10.2018 passed by the Hon'ble Single Bench by which several writ petitions were allowed in part by directing the Board to grant 6 marks to candidates of TET 2014 who had attempted the specified 6 questions where either the question or the answer key of the Board were found wrong by the expert appointed by the Court. This Judgement was confined to the writ petitioners and the Hon'ble Court directed that the vacancies were available, for those who could qualify after grant of additional marks, to be appointed.

He has further submitted that one Basir Ahmed has filed an application for leave to appeal against the Judgement dated 3.10.2018 praying that the said judgement should have been extended to all who have been participated in 2014. He has further submitted that the said seeking leave to appeal was dismissed and thereafter a Special Leave Petition was preferred before the Hon'ble Supreme Court and the Hon'ble Apex Court vide order dated 1.04.2019 directed that Basir Ahmed may file a writ petition seeking similar relief as granted by the Hon'ble Single Judge which is to be heard along with the appeal of the Board and the Hon'ble Apex Court has also directed similar other writ petitions to be heard together.

Learned Counsel has further submitted that two issues are required to be decided by this Hon'ble Court, first whether the direction of the Hon'ble

Single Bench to allow the additional marks for the six wrong questions/answers keys to the candidates who had merely attempted those questions is correct and as to whether the said Judgement of the Hon'ble Single Bench should be restricted to the petitioners who were parties to the writ petitions on which such judgement was passed or whether the benefits of the same should be extended to all candidates who had participated in TET 2014. It has further been submitted that the Hon'ble Single Bench recorded in its order dated 27.7.2017 that the parties consent to abide by the report of the experts.

The Learned Counsel has further submitted that the direction for awarding additional marks does not appear to be wholly correct. He has further submitted that it is true that errors in the Question Booklet constitute a fault on the part of the Board for which the candidates must not suffer. He has further submitted that where the answer given by the candidates is incorrect as per the report of the expert then the said candidate must not be entitled to any additional marks for that particular question. He has further submitted that where a candidate had marked the option for which he or she has not been awarded marks as it did not tally with the answer key of the Board but the answer matches with the expert view then the said candidate must be entitled to additional marks.

Learned Counsel has submitted that awarding marks as directed by the Hon'ble Single Bench for merely attempting is contrary to and in consistent

with the basic system of marking in any examination. Learned Counsel has relied upon a judgement of the Hon'ble Supreme Court passed in *Rishal vs Rajastahan Public Service Commission* reported in (2018) 8 SCC 81. Wherein the Hon'ble Supreme Court directed award of additional marks for the question attempted were the same as per the expert opinion. He has further submitted that it does not appear from the said Judgement as to whether such other candidates approached the High Court or not.

He has also submitted that there are many other writ petitioner/applicants claiming similar reliefs which have been filed subsequently and are still being filed are highly belated and are fence sitters and such petitions are to be dismissed as laid down in the *lis* between *UP Jal Nigam vs Jaswant Singh* reported in 2006 11 SCC 464. Learned Counsel has further submitted that those who may qualify on the basis of additional marks may be allowed to participate in future recruitment process by relaxing their upper age limit as a one-time measure in respect of the first recruitment process to be initiated hereafter.

The Learned Counsel has further submitted that the entire exercise of grant of additional marks is to be carried out on the basis of the digitized data of original OMR Sheet preserved as record of the Board since the original OMR Sheets of all the candidates numbering nearly 13 lakhs were destroyed by the Board. The Learned Counsel has further submitted that in MAT 953/2021 further directions has been sought for *inter alia* of the Hon'ble Court to the

award of cost of Rs. 20 thousand to each of the 19 petitioners by the then President of the Board personally for the reason that the President is in the helm of affairs of the Board.

The Learned Counsel appearing on behalf of the respondent/writ petitioners has submitted that the Board has *inter alia* filed the instant appeal on the ground that the Hon'ble Single Bench has erred in fact as well as in law in directing the Board to award marks to the respondent writ petitioners who attempted the wrong questions/answers as because it is the contention of the Board that respondents /writ petitioners who attempted 6 wrong questions and have chosen the wrong key answers cannot claim marks for the said questions. The Learned Counsel has further submitted that if the Board chooses not to award any mark for attempting wrong questions and/ or answers it would be highly improper and arbitrary as the key answer provided by the Board has not been found to be correct by the experts but marks have been awarded to the candidates for the said questions who answered according to the Board's key answer.

It has further been submitted by the Learned Counsel that when several candidates have been given marks for attempting wrong options given by the Board and have qualified the TET 2014 and many of them have also been appointed through the 2016 selection process as such denial to give marks to the petitioners and/or candidates who have attempted the wrong questions is absolutely violation of principle of equality and violates the Article 14 of the

Constitution of India. It has further been submitted that subsequently the Board has initiated another selection process for recruitment of Primary Teachers from amongst the TET 2014 qualified candidates by publication of notice dated 23.12.2020. the Learned Counsel has further submitted that when the notification dated 23.12.2020 was published it was in the knowledge of the Board that 6 question and/ or options were wrong in the Question Booklet and several candidates who have answered according to the Boards key answers have been awarded marks for 6 wrong question though the answers were wrong as per the report of the Expert Committee. He has further submitted that in spite of knowledge of the said fact the Board did not choose to reevaluate the OMR Sheets of the TET 2014 and decided to proceed with the selection process.

Learned Counsel has further submitted that the respondent and other similarly placed candidates are being penalized for no fault on their part. The Learned Counsel has also submitted that the Board issued a further notification for publication of list of candidates for scrutiny verification and interview who have qualified TET 2014 after awarding 6 marks for attempting the wrong questions. The Learned Counsel has further submitted that by publication of the notice dated 20.12.2021 the Board has accepted the order dated 03.10.2018 and has awarded 6 marks to the candidates who have attempted the said wrong questions and now the Board cannot say that the candidates who have only correctly answered the 6 wrong questions as per the

opinion of the experts will be entitled to get marks for the said wrong questions.

From the impugned Judgement it reveals that the Hon'ble Single Bench has directed the Secretary, West Bengal Board of Primary Education to award marks to the petitioner/petitioners who attempted the wrong question/options in the key answers of JGB Question Booklet series and after awarding marks if it is found that the petitioner/petitioners is/are otherwise eligible then the Secretary is further directed to take steps to give appointment to the petitioner/petitioners in accordance with law against the available vacant post of Assistant Teachers. It has also been stated that the order is strictly restricted in respect of writ petitions mentioned as above.

The crux of the instant appeals is as to whether the marks which were allotted for the wrong question/options are to be allotted to which category of the examinees if any and as to whether the said Judgement and order is to be treated *in personam* or *in rem*.

As regards to the aforementioned first issue this Court is of the view that those examinees who were definite about the said wrong questions/options which are under discussion might not have attempted those questions as because a person having the accurate knowledge knowing the correct answer would not have opt for any of the wrong option though the said examination did not have the provision for negative marking for giving wrong answers. As such there might have been examinees who knew the correct answer and had

not attempted the same knowing the options given in the OMR sheet to be wrong.

As per the directions by the Hon'ble Single Bench only those examinees who attempted the wrong questions/options the key answers of JGB Question Booklet series are to be awarded marks so those examinees who abstained from answering the wrong question/options having the knowledge of the correct option might be the losers as they are not be awarded marks.

As regards to the wrong options in the key answers this Court was initially of the view that those who have opted the correct options as per the experts opinion be awarded marks. If that is directed it would give rise to further complications as all the original OMR Sheets have been destroyed. As such considering the present situation, this Court is of the opinion that, in respect of the questions wherein the options in the key answers are not tallying between the options given by the Board and that of the experts, all the examinees be awarded the marks for the said questions wherein the options in the key answers were not correct.

Having heard the parties and closely considering the materials placed, this Court must examine the issue and award six marks against the six defective questions on the test of prejudice caused to all candidates who appeared in the examination. Considering the order impugned of the Hon'ble Single Bench which granted six marks across the Board to all the six petitioners who approached the Hon'ble Single Bench, this Court is also of the

view that each candidate who appeared in the said examination were equally disadvantaged and/or prejudiced by the said six defective questions and hence be awarded the six marks.

Accordingly, to the mind of this Court both sides of examinees stood equally circumstanced. The fault in not providing the correct question with the correct answer keys and therefore not providing all candidates with a level playing field lies with the Board. The Board cannot therefore now sub-divide and/or micro-manage the issue by leaning towards one set of examinees to the disadvantage of other set.

This Court is also of the considered view that none shall be prejudiced and/or *inter se* performance of any examinee *vis a vis* the other shall not be affected in the event all the candidates are granted six marks against the six wrong questions.

The Secretary of the West Bengal Board is thus directed to award marks to all the examinees irrespective of whether they have attempted the wrong question/options in the key answers of the JGB question Booklet series or not.

This Order shall not however affect steps taken so far by the Board or, already in the process of being taken by the Board, in respect of TET 2014.

In the light of the discussion above, the Order impugned directing payment of costs also stands set aside.



Both the Orders dated 3<sup>rd</sup> October, 2018 and 3<sup>rd</sup> September, 2021 in so far as such Orders grant 6 marks to the candidates stand accordingly affirmed.

In view of the above directions, this Court holds the award of marks to be *in rem* and not *in personam*. The second issue stands accordingly answered.

**MAT 1594 of 2018 with IA NO: CAN/1/2019(Old No:CAN/5471/2019),**

**CAN/3/2019(Old No:CAN/8274/2019),CAN/4/2021, CAN/5/2021**

**CAN/6/2022, CAN/7/2022, CAN/8/2022, CAN/9/2022, CAN/10/2022, CAN/11/2022, CAN/12/2022, CAN/13/2022, CAN/14/2022, CAN/15/2022, CAN/16/2022, CAN/17/2022, CAN/18/2022, CAN/19/2022, CAN/20/2022, CAN/21/2022, CAN/22/2022, CAN/23/2022, CAN/24/2022, CAN/25/2022, CAN/26/2022, CAN/27/2022, CAN/28/2022, CAN/29/2022, CAN/30/2022, CAN/31/2022, CAN/32/2022, CAN/33/2022, CAN/34/2022, CAN/35/2022, CAN/36/2022, CAN/37/2022, CAN/38/2022, CAN/39/2022, CAN/40/2022, CAN/41/2022, CAN/42/2022, CAN/43/2022, CAN/44/2022, CAN/45/2022, CAN/46/2022, CAN/47/2022, CAN/48/2022, CAN/49/2022, CAN/50/2022, CAN/51/2022, CAN/52/2022, CAN/53/2022, CAN/54/2022, CAN/55/2022, CAN/56/2022, CAN/57/2022, CAN/58/2022, CAN/59/2022, CAN/60/2022, CAN/61/2022, CAN/62/2022, CAN/63/2022, CAN/64/2022, CAN/65/2022, CAN/66/2022, CAN/67/2022, CAN/68/2022, CAN/69/2022, CAN/70/2022, CAN/71/2023, CAN/72/2023, CAN/73/2023, CAN/74/2023, CAN/75/2023, CAN/76/2023, CAN/77/2023 With MAT/953/2021**

**With MAT/999/2021 with IA NO: CAN/1/2021, CAN/2/2021**

**With WPA/10005/2021 With WPA/10304/2019**

**With WPA/10306/2019 With WPA/10308/2019**

**With WPA/1053/2022 With WPA/10540/2019**

**With WPA/10541/2019 With WPA/10543/2019**

With WPA/10800/2019 With WPA/10803/2019  
With WPA/10909/2018 With WPA/10954/2021  
With WPA/10956/2019 With WPA/10958/2021  
With WPA/1099/2021 With WPA/11001/2019  
With WPA/11002/2019 With WPA/11003/2019  
With WPA/11004/2019 With WPA/1125/2021  
With WPA/11433/2020 With WPA/11701/2019  
With WPA/11702/2019 With WPA/12021/2019  
With WPA/13016/2019 with WPA/1316/2022  
With WPA/1353/2020 With WPA/1396/2021  
With WPA/14722/2021 With WPA/14728/2021  
With WPA/14736/2021 With WPA/16242/2019  
With WPA/16244/2019 With WPA/164/2022  
With WPA/16436/2018 With WPA/16438/2018  
With WPA/16440/2018 With WPA/16448/2018  
With WPA/16449/2018 With WPA/16536/2021  
With WPA/16598/2019 With WPA/17003/2019  
With WPA/17009/2018 With WPA/17018/2018  
With WPA/17024/2018 With WPA/17025/2018  
With WPA/1704/2021 With WPA/1729/2022  
With WPA/1732/2022 With WPA/17406/2019  
With WPA/17408/2019 With WPA/17619/2018  
With WPA/17749/2018 With WPA/17944/2019  
With WPA/18329/2021 With WPA/18370/2019  
With WPA/18865/2018 With WPA/18880/2021

With WPA/19052/2019 With WPA/19087/2019  
 with IA NO: CAN/1/2020 with WPA/1940/2021  
 with IA NO: CAN/1/2022 with WPA/19432/2019  
 with WPA/19607/2018  
 With WPA/19608/2018 With WPA/19672/2019

With IA NO: CAN/1/2020 With WPA/1971/2021  
 With WPA/19733/2018 With WPA/1991/2021  
 With WPA/20132/2018 With WPA/20219/2019  
 With WPA/202/2022 With WPA/20227/2019  
 With WPA/20246/2018 With WPA/20249/2018  
 With WPA/20251/2018 With WPA/20253/2018  
 With WPA/20255/2018 With WPA/20257/2018  
 With WPA/20258/2018 With WPA/20260/2018  
 With WPA/20262/2018 With WPA/20263/2018  
 With WPA/20264/2018 With WPA/20265/2018  
 With WPA/20314/2018 With WPA/20317/2018  
 With WPA/20332/2019 With WPA/20341/2019  
 With WPA/204/2021 with WPA/204/2022  
 With WPA/20422/2018 With WPA/20425/2018  
 With WPA/20484/2018 With WPA/20495/2018  
 With WPA/20642/2021 with WPA/2097/2022  
 with WPA/20987/2019 with WPA/20988/2019  
 with WPA/20989/2019 with WPA/20990/2019  
 with WPA/20991/2019 with WPA/21191/2018

with WPA/21398/2018 with WPA/21407/2018  
with WPA/21411/2018 with WPA/21531/2018  
with WPA/21649/2018 with WPA/21650/2018  
with WPA/21717/2019 with WPA/21725/2018  
with WPA/21751/2019 with WPA/21766/2018  
with WPA/21859/2018 with WPA/219/2021  
with WPA/22274/2018 with WPA/2245/2021  
with WPA/22507/2018 with WPA/22701/2019  
with WPA/22732/2018 IA NO: CAN/1/2020 with WPA/22848/2018  
with WPA/229/2021 with WPA/22962/2018  
with WPA/22998/2018 with WPA/23013/2018  
with WPA/23016/2018 with WPA/23122/2018  
with WPA/23129/2018 with WPA/23132/2018  
with WPA/23141/2018 with WPA/23353/2018  
with WPA/23609/2019 with WPA/24496/2018  
with WPA/24499/2018 with WPA/24520/2018  
with WPA/24522/2018 with WPA/24523/2018  
with WPA/24556/2018 with WPA/2460/2018  
with WPA/2469/2021 with IA NO: CAN/1/2022 with WPA/24917/2018  
with WPA/24919/2018 with WPA/24986/2018  
with WPA/25180/2018 with WPA/25374/2018  
with WPA/25375/2018 with WPA/25376/2018  
with WPA/25502/2018 with WPA/26065/2018  
with WPA/26067/2018 with WPA/26069/2018  
with WPA/26071/2018 with WPA/26076/2018

with WPA/26078/2018 with WPA/26084/2018  
 with WPA/26146/2018 with IA NO: CAN/1/2022 with WPA/2628/2021  
 with WPA/26317/2018 with WPA/26320/2018  
 with WPA/2719/2021 with WPA/2800/2019  
 with WPA/2802/2021 with WPA/2811/2019  
 with WPA/300/2021 with WPA/303/2021  
 with WPA/307/2021 with WPA/310/2021  
 with WPA/3121/2021 with WPA/314/2019  
 with WPA/348/2022 with WPA/350/2022  
 with WPA/351/2022 with WPA/4083/2021  
 with WPA/4414/2021 with IA NO: CAN/1/2022 with WPA/4451/2019  
 with WPA/4903/2019 with WPA/4920/2021  
 with WPA/4954/2020 with WPA/4955/2020  
 with WPA/5482/2021 with WPA/5550/2021  
 with WPA/5584/2022 with WPA/5663/2021  
 with WPA/6158/2022 with WPA/6291/2021  
 with WPA/668/2021 with WPA/685/2021  
 with WPA/689/2022 with WPA/738/2021  
 with WPA/7809/2019 with

IA NO: CAN/39/2019(Old No:CAN/10172/2019), CAN/54/2019(Old  
 No:CAN/10552/2019), CAN/55/2019(Old No:CAN/10564/2019),  
 CAN/68/2019(Old No:CAN/10734/2019), CAN/73/2019(Old  
 No:CAN/10866/2019), CAN/74/2019(Old No:CAN/11884/2019),  
 CAN/75/2020(Old No:CAN/2535/2020), CAN/76/2020(Old  
 No:CAN/2536/2020), CAN/77/2020(Old No:CAN/2537/2020),  
 CAN/78/2020(Old No:CAN/2881/2020), CAN/79/2020, CAN/80/2020,  
 CAN/81/2020, CAN/82/2021, CAN/83/2021, CAN/84/2021,  
 CAN/85/2021, CAN/86/2021, CAN/87/2021, CAN/88/2022,

|                     |                     |                     |                 |
|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-----------------|
| CAN/89/2022,        | CAN/90/2022,        | CAN/91/2022,        | CAN/92/2022,    |
| CAN/93/2022,        | CAN/94/2022,        | CAN/95/2022,        | CAN/96/2022,    |
| CAN/97/2022,        | CAN/98/2022,        | CAN/99/2022,        | CAN/100/2022,   |
| CAN/101/2022,       | CAN/102/2022,       | CAN/103/2022,       | CAN/104/2022,   |
| CAN/105/2022,       | CAN/106/2022,       | CAN/107/2022,       | CAN/108/2022,   |
| CAN/109/2022,       | CAN/110/2022,       | CAN/111/2022,       | CAN/112/2022,   |
| CAN/113/2022,       | CAN/114/2022,       | CAN/115/2022,       | CAN/116/2022,   |
| CAN/117/2022,       | CAN/118/2022,       | CAN/119/2022,       | CAN/120/2022,   |
| CAN/121/2022,       | CAN/122/2022,       | CAN/123/2022,       | CAN/124/2022,   |
| CAN/125/2022,       | CAN/126/2022,       | CAN/127/2022,       | CAN/128/2022,   |
| CAN/129/2022,       | CAN/130/2022,       | CAN/131/2022,       | CAN/132/2022,   |
| CAN/133/2022,       | CAN/134/2022,       | CAN/135/2022,       | CAN/136/2022,   |
| CAN/137/2022,       | CAN/138/2022,       | CAN/139/2022,       | CAN/140/2022,   |
| CAN/141/2022,       | CAN/142/2022,       | CAN/143/2022,       | CAN/144/2022,   |
| CAN/145/2022,       | CAN/146/2022,       | CAN/147/2022,       | CAN/148/2022,   |
| CAN/149/2022,       | CAN/150/2022,       | CAN/151/2022,       | CAN/152/2022,   |
| CAN/153/2022,       | CAN/154/2022,       | CAN/155/2022,       | CAN/156/2022,   |
| CAN/157/2022,       | CAN/158/2022,       | CAN/159/2022,       | CAN/160/2022,   |
| CAN/161/2022,       | CAN/162/2022,       | CAN/163/2022,       | CAN/164/2022,   |
| CAN/165/2022,       | CAN/166/2022,       | CAN/167/2022,       | CAN/168/2022,   |
| CAN/169/2022,       | CAN/170/2022,       | CAN/171/2022,       | CAN/172/2022,   |
| CAN/173/2022,       | CAN/174/2022,       | CAN/175/2022,       | CAN/176/2022,   |
| CAN/177/2022,       | CAN/178/2022,       | CAN/179/2022,       | CAN/180/2022,   |
| CAN/181/2022,       | CAN/182/2022,       | CAN/183/2022,       | CAN/184/2022,   |
| CAN/185/2022,       | CAN/186/2022,       | CAN/187/2022,       | CAN/188/2022,   |
| CAN/189/2022,       | CAN/190/2022,       | CAN/191/2022,       | CAN/192/2022,   |
| CAN/193/2022,       | CAN/194/2022,       | CAN/195/2022,       | CAN/196/2023,   |
| CAN/197/2023,       | CAN/198/2023,       | CAN/199/2023,       | CAN/200/2023,   |
| CAN/201/2023,       | CAN/202/2023        | IA NO:              | CAN/39/2019(Old |
| No:CAN/10172/2019), | CAN/54/2019(Old     | No:CAN/10552/2019), |                 |
| CAN/55/2019(Old     | No:CAN/10564/2019), | CAN/68/2019(Old     |                 |
| No:CAN/10734/2019), | CAN/73/2019(Old     | No:CAN/10866/2019), |                 |
| CAN/74/2019(Old     | No:CAN/11884/2019), | CAN/75/2020(Old     |                 |
| No:CAN/2535/2020),  | CAN/76/2020(Old     | No:CAN/2536/2020),  |                 |
| CAN/77/2020(Old     | No:CAN/2537/2020),  | CAN/78/2020(Old     |                 |
| No:CAN/2881/2020),  | CAN/79/2020,        | CAN/80/2020,        | CAN/81/2020,    |
| CAN/82/2021,        | CAN/83/2021,        | CAN/84/2021,        | CAN/85/2021,    |
| CAN/86/2021,        | CAN/87/2021,        | CAN/88/2022,        | CAN/89/2022,    |
| CAN/90/2022,        | CAN/91/2022,        | CAN/92/2022,        | CAN/93/2022,    |
| CAN/94/2022,        | CAN/95/2022,        | CAN/96/2022,        | CAN/97/2022,    |

**CAN/98/2022, CAN/99/2022, CAN/100/2022, CAN/101/2022,**  
**CAN/102/2022, CAN/103/2022, CAN/104/2022, CAN/105/2022,**  
**CAN/106/2022, CAN/107/2022, CAN/108/2022, CAN/109/2022,**  
**CAN/110/2022, CAN/111/2022, CAN/112/2022, CAN/113/2022,**  
**CAN/114/2022, CAN/115/2022, CAN/116/2022, CAN/117/2022,**  
**CAN/118/2022, CAN/119/2022, CAN/120/2022, CAN/121/2022,**  
**CAN/122/2022, CAN/123/2022, CAN/124/2022, CAN/125/2022,**  
**CAN/126/2022, CAN/127/2022, CAN/128/2022, CAN/129/2022,**  
**CAN/130/2022, CAN/131/2022, CAN/132/2022, CAN/133/2022,**  
**CAN/134/2022, CAN/135/2022, CAN/136/2022, CAN/137/2022,**  
**CAN/138/2022, CAN/139/2022, CAN/140/2022, CAN/141/2022,**  
**CAN/142/2022, CAN/143/2022, CAN/144/2022, CAN/145/2022,**  
**CAN/146/2022, CAN/147/2022, CAN/148/2022, CAN/149/2022,**  
**CAN/150/2022, CAN/151/2022, CAN/152/2022, CAN/153/2022,**  
**CAN/154/2022, CAN/155/2022, CAN/156/2022, CAN/157/2022,**  
**CAN/158/2022, CAN/159/2022, CAN/160/2022, CAN/161/2022,**  
**CAN/162/2022, CAN/163/2022, CAN/164/2022, CAN/165/2022,**  
**CAN/166/2022, CAN/167/2022, CAN/168/2022, CAN/169/2022,**  
**CAN/170/2022, CAN/171/2022, CAN/172/2022, CAN/173/2022,**  
**CAN/174/2022, CAN/175/2022, CAN/176/2022, CAN/177/2022,**  
**CAN/178/2022, CAN/179/2022, CAN/180/2022, CAN/181/2022,**  
**CAN/182/2022, CAN/183/2022, CAN/184/2022, CAN/185/2022,**  
**CAN/186/2022, CAN/187/2022, CAN/188/2022, CAN/189/2022,**  
**CAN/190/2022, CAN/191/2022, CAN/192/2022, CAN/193/2022,**  
**CAN/194/2022, CAN/195/2022, CAN/196/2023, CAN/197/2023,**  
**CAN/198/2023, CAN/199/2023, CAN/200/2023, CAN/201/2023,**  
**CAN/202/2023 with WPA/7988/2021**

**with WPA/8028/2022 with WPA/816/2021**

**with WPA/824/2021 with WPA/8290/2019**

**with WPA/8613/2019 with WPA/8614/2019**

**with WPA/8889/2021 with WPA/9188/2021 with WPA/9947/2019** stand accordingly **allowed**.

Parties shall be entitled to act on the basis of the server copy of the judgment and order placed on the official website of the Court.

Urgent Xerox certified photo copies of this judgment, if applied for, be given to the parties upon compliance of the requisite formalities.

**I Agree.**

**(Subrata Talukdar, J.)**

**(Supratim Bhattacharya, J.)**