



W.P.(MD)No.28318 of 2022

WEB COPY

BEFORE THE MADURAI BENCH OF MADRAS HIGH COURT

DATED : 16.12.2022

CORAM

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE M.DHANDAPANI

W.P.(MD)No.28318 of 2022

and

W.M.P.(MD)No.22371 of 2022

Dr.E.Kalaiselvi,
Assistant Medical Officer (Sidha),
E.S.I.Dispensary, Thirunagar,
Madurai.

... Petitioner

Vs.

1. The Principal Secretary to Government
Labour and Employment Department,
Secretariat, Chennai-9.
2. The Director of Medical and
Rural Health Services (ESIS)
Thenampet, Chennai- 6.
3. The Regional Administrative Medical Officer
Office of the Regional Administrative Medical Officer,
E.S.I.Campus,
K.K.Nagar, Madurai-20.



W.P.(MD)No.28318 of 2022

WEB COPY

4. The Incharge Medical Officer
E.S.I. Dispensary, Thiru Nagar,
Madurai.

... Respondents

PRAYER : Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying for issuance of Writ of Certiorarified Mandamus, calling for the records connected with the Impugned order of Recovery of Rs.1,33,510/- passed by the 4th respondent in Na.Ka.No.203/voo2/2022 dated 07.12.2022 and quash the same and consequently direct the 4th respondent to continue to pay the Non-Practicing allowance.

For Petitioner : Mr. S.Govindan

For Respondents : Mr.S.P.Maharajan
Additional Government Pleader
For R1 to R4

ORDER

This Writ Petition has been filed to call for the records pertaining to the impugned order of recovery of Rs.1,33,510/- (Rupees One Lakh Thirty Three Thousand Five Hundred and Ten only) passed by the 4th respondent in Na.Ka.No.203/voo2/2022 dated 07.12.2022, quash the same and direct the 4th respondent to continue to pay the Non-Practicing



W.P.(MD)No.28318 of 2022

allowance.

WEB COPY

2. The case of the petitioner is that the petitioner has studied B.S.M.S(Siddha) and joined as Assistant Medical Officer (Siddha) on 31.10.2003. The second respondent had sent a proposal for opening of Siddha Unit at 10, E.S.I Dispensaries in Tamil Nadu to the 1st respondent and had also sent details of expenditure for each dispensary. In the proposal sent by the second respondent to the 1st respondent, it is stated that the Assistant Medical Officers (Siddha) are entitled to receive the Non-practicing allowance of Rs.1,200/- per month for which approval was also granted by the 1st respondent. In fact, non-practicing allowance is not granted to the Medical Officers, who are working in other hospitals as they are not entitled to receive the same. The petitioner has not practiced anywhere except the government hospital and she is receiving non-practicing allowance of Rs.1,200/-.

3. While so, the third respondent vide its letter dated 26.08.2019, had sent a communication to the 4th respondent to take steps for recovery of



W.P.(MD)No.28318 of 2022

non-practicing allowance already paid to the Assistant Medical Officers (Siddha) on the ground of audit objection. Based on the letter of the 3rd respondent, the 4th respondent had taken steps for recovery of non-practicing allowance paid to the petitioner for the period from the month of July 2013 and to stop the payment of Non-practicing allowance. Challenging the said proceedings, the petitioner has filed a writ petition in W.P(MD).No.19810 of 2019. This Court, vide its order dated 14.02.2022, issued a direction to the respondents to issue show cause notice to the petitioners within a period of four weeks from the date of receipt of a copy of the order and on receipt of the show cause notice, the petitioners were directed to submit their reply/objection along with the documents if any within a period of two weeks from the date of receipt of the show cause notice and the respondents were directed to consider the reply/objection if any submitted by the petitioners and pass a speaking order assigning reasons. However, without complying the directions of this Court, the very same order has been re-produced in the impugned order. Challenging the same, the present writ petition has been filed.



W.P.(MD)No.28318 of 2022

WEB COPY

compliance of the order of this Court which is in violation of the principles of natural justice and the impugned order has been issued without issuing the show cause notice. Hence, the impugned order passed by the 4th respondent in Na.Ka.No.203/voo2/2022 dated 07.12.2022 is set aside and the matter is remanded back to the second respondent for fresh consideration.

6. Accordingly, the second respondent is directed to issue a show cause notice to the petitioner within a period of two weeks from the date of receipt of a copy of this order. On receipt of the same, the petitioner is directed to submit her reply/objection along with the documents, if any, within a period of two weeks therefrom and the second respondent is directed to pass appropriate orders on merits and in accordance with law within a period of six weeks thereafter.



W.P.(MD)No.28318 of 2022

7. Accordingly, this Writ Petition is allowed as above. No costs.

Connected miscellaneous petition is closed.

WEB COPY

16.12.2022

Index : Yes / No

Speaking Order : Yes / No

ssb

To

1. The Principal Secretary to Government
Labour and Employment Department,
Secretariat, Chennai-9.
2. The Director of Medical and
Rural Health Services (ESIS)
Thenampet, Chennai- 6.
3. The Regional Administrative Medical Officer
Office of the Regional Administrative
Medical Officer, E.S.I.Campus,
K.K.Nagar, Madurai-20.
4. The Incharge Medical Officer
E.S.I. Dispensary, Thiru Nagar,
Madurai.



WEB COPY



W.P.(MD)No.28318 of 2022

M.DHANDAPANI,J.

ssb

**W.P.(MD)No.28318 of 2022
and
W.M.P.(MD)No.22371 of 2022**

16.12.2022