



WEB COPY

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED : 21.01.2022

CORAM

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE S.M.SUBRAMANIAM

W.P.No.43903 of 2016

and

W.M.P.No.37719 of 2016

M/s Petro Chemical Engineering
H.T.Sc.No.1435,
Plot No.B63, (a), Sipcot Industrial
Complex, Gummidipoondi, Thiruvallur District,
Rep. by its Authorised Signatory
K.Thirumalaidasan.

... Petitioner

Vs.

1. The Chairman and Managing Director,
Tamil Nadu Generation and Distribution
Corporation Limited,
144, Anna Salai,
Chennai - 600002.
2. The Superintending Engineer,
Chennai Electricity Distribution Circle/North,
TANGEDCO, No.144, Anna Salai,
Chennai 600002
3. The Central Electricity Authority (CEA)
Rep. by its Chairman,
6th Floor, Selva Bhawan,
R.K.Puram, New Delhi- 110066.
4. The Tamil Nadu Electricity Regulatory Commission
(TNERC),
Rep. by its Secretary,
19A, Rukmani Lakshipathy Salai,
Egmore, Chennai- 600008.

... Respondents

PRAYER : Writ Petition filed Under Article 226 of the Constitution of India, to issue a Writ of Certiorarified Mandamus, Calling for the records of the 2nd respondent culminating in the impugned letter in Lr.No.SE/CEDC/North/EE/GL/AEE/GL/AE/F.HT.1435/D.2088/16 dated 01.12.2016 and quash the same and consequently forbearing the



1st and 2nd Respondents, their men, officers, servants, representatives and/or any one claiming through or under them and/or any other person from in any manner insisting on harmonic control and levying, demanding and/or collecting charges towards compensation for harmonics dumping from the Petitioner for their HT SC No.1435 either through the CC Bills or in any other manner who is connected with 11 Kv supply line.

For Petitioner : Mr. M.Saravanakumar
for Mr.K.Seshadri

For Respondents : Mr.L.Jaivenkatesh
for TANGEDCO [R1 & R2]

No Appearance[R3]

O R D E R

The impugned demand notice passed by the 2nd respondent, dated 01.12.2016, is sought to be quashed in the present writ petition and a further direction is also sought to forbear 1st and 2nd respondent from in any manner levying, demanding and/or collecting surcharges for not providing the harmonic controls from the petitioner, who is connected with 11 KV supply line.

2. The relief sought for in the present writ petition is similar to the relief sought for by the writ petitioners in a batch of writ petitions in W.P.No. 25 of 2015 [M/s.S.Palaniyandi Mudaliar Memorial Hospital v. TANGEDCO], etc. and batch, which was decided by this Court on 05.06.2017.

3. The relevant paragraphs of the said order are extracted hereunder :

"24. In view of the above, since the harmonics have several undesirable effects and affects power quality, on 21.02.2007, the Central Electricity Authority (CEA) introduced a new Regulation and accordingly, its Technical Standards for Connectivity to the Grid Regulations, 2007, came for enforcement. Applicability of the Regulations is provided in Regulation 3, which reads as under:

"3. Applicability of the Regulations -
These Regulations shall be applicable to all the users, requesters, Central Transmission Utility and State Transmission Utility."

It is clear from the above that the said



WEB COPY

Regulation is applicable only to four categories, namely, Users, Requesters, Central Transmission Utility and State Transmission Utility.

25. In this context, let me find out the meaning given under the CEA Regulations, 2007, for Users and Requesters. Section 2(34) defines the meaning of "User", which is given as under:-

"2(34)-- User means a person such as, a Generating Company including captive generating plant or Transmission Licensee (other than the Central Transmission Utility and State Transmission Utility) or Distribution Licensee or Bulk Consumer, whose electrical plant is connected to the grid at voltage level 33kv and above."

Section 2(25) defines the meaning of "Requester", which is given as under:-

"2(25)-- Requester means a person, such as a Generating Company including captive generating plant or Transmission Licensee (excluding Central Transmission Utility and State Transmission Utility) or Distribution Licensee or Bulk Consumer, who is seeking connection of his new or expanded electrical plant to the Grid at voltage level 33kv and above."

A conjoint reading of the above said provisions show that a person such as, Generating Company including captive generating plant or Transmission Licensee or Distribution Licensee or Bulk Consumer, whose electrical plant is connected to the grid at voltage level 33 kv and above. Therefore, it is clear that the above said Regulations are applicable to only those consumers whose electrical plant is connected to the Grid at the voltage level of 33kv and above, hence, the petitioners, who are connected to the Grid at voltage level of 11kv/22kv supply lines, cannot be made applicable under the said Regulations.

26. Again, to be more clear, it is also pertinent to refer to Section 34 of the Electricity Act, 2003, dealing with the Grid Standards, which is given as under:-

"34. Grid Standards.---- Every transmission licensee shall comply with such technical standards, of operation and maintenance of transmission lines, in



29. It is an admitted fact that the CEA Regulations came into force in the year 2007, however, even after a lapse of 9 years, the TANGEDCO has not published any notification in the official Gazette enforcing the consumers, who are connected with 11kv/22kv supply lines, to install harmonic filers so as to levy harmonic compensation charges.

"This is reference to your letter dated 07.08.2015 on the above subject. It is to inform that almost 305 case are filed in the Hon'ble Court by the petitioners having grievances similar to this case. It is to submit that:

(ii) Further any consumer who is connected below 33kv to the distribution system is not governed by the Grid Standards for connectivity to the Grid.

<https://hcservices.ecourts.gov.in/hcservices/>



WEB COPY

Grid is high voltage backbone system of inter-connected transmission lines, sub station and generating plants.

Therefore, only systems which can directly affect the Grid are covered under such Standards and as such the present petition for the consumers connected at 33kv or above which are defined as Bulk Consumer shall be covered for Harmonic Compensation."

31. Subsequent to the above said communication, one Mr.P.D.Siwal, Secretary to the Central Electricity Authority, New Delhi, issued a clarification on 26.08.2015 with regard to applicability of Part IV of CEA Regulations, 2007. Relevant portion of the said communication is extracted below:

"This has reference to the Part IV of the CEA (Technical Standards for Connectivity to the Grid) Regulations, 2007. It is clarified that:

(iii) The condition of voltage and current harmonic as prescribed under Part IV is applicable only to the consumers which are defined as bulk consumers and drawing power at 33kv and above.

(iv) For the purpose of bulk consumer means a consumer who avails supply at voltage of 33kv or above.

Therefore, Part IV of CEA Regulations is applicable only to consumers drawing power at 33kv or above and any consumer who is drawing power below 33kv shall not be covered under Part IV of CEA (Technical Standards for Connectivity of the Grid) Regulations, 2007."

From the above said communications of the Chief Engineer (Legal) as well as the Secretary of the Central Electricity Authority, New Delhi, it is crystal clear that the consumers connected with 11kv/22kv supply lines are placed outside the scope and purview of the Part IV of the CEA Regulations, 2007, and that it has further categorically clarified that 11kv/22kv supply lines consumers are not subjected to harmonic control norms, however, 33kv and above supply lines consumers are alone directed to comply with harmonic control norms. Thus, the impugned demands issued by the respondent/TANGEDCO directing the petitioners, who are admittedly connected with 11kv/22kv supply



WEB COPY

lines, are against the CEA Regulations, 2007.

32. Further, it is also pertinent to note that the CEA, who is the competent authority to declare the harmonic distortion levels, has not declared harmonic distortion levels to the consumers connected with 11kv/22kv either through the CEA Regulations, 2007, or by any other relevant provisions. Therefore, until the CEA prescribes any standard of harmonics for 11kv/22kv supply lines consumers and makes them also obligatory for harmonic controls, no obligation can be cast upon the 11kv/22kv supply lines consumers for compliance.

33. Taking support from Sections 50, 86 and 181 of the Act read with Regulation 4(1)(iv) of the Tamil Nadu Electricity Supply Code, learned Additional Advocate General sought to sustain the impugned order levying harmonic charges on the 11kv/22kv supply line consumers. In this context, let me extract below the above said provisions:

50. The Electricity Supply Code :- The State Commission shall specify an Electricity Supply Code to provide for recovery of electricity charges, intervals for billing of electricity charges, disconnection of supply of electricity for nonpayment thereof, restoration of supply of electricity, tampering, distress or damage to electrical plant, electric lines or meter, entry of distribution licensee or any person acting on his behalf for disconnecting supply and removing the meter, entry for replacing, altering or maintaining electric lines or electrical plant or meter.

"Section 86 - Functions of State Commission.-

(1) The State Commission shall discharge the following functions, namely:--

(a) determine the tariff for generation, supply, transmission and wheeling of electricity, wholesale, bulk or retail, as the case may be, within the State: Provided that where open access has been permitted to a category of consumers under section 42, the State Commission shall determine only the wheeling charges and surcharge thereon, if any, for the said category of consumers;

(b) regulate electricity purchase and



WEB COPY

procurement process of distribution licensees including the price at which electricity shall be procured from the generating companies or licensees or from other sources through agreements for purchase of power for distribution and supply within the State;

(c) facilitate intra-State transmission and wheeling of electricity;

(d) issue licences to persons seeking to act as transmission licensees, distribution licensees and electricity traders with respect to their operations within the State;

(e) promote cogeneration and generation of electricity from renewable sources of energy by providing suitable measures for connectivity with the grid and sale of electricity to any person, and also specify, for purchase of electricity from such sources, a percentage of the total consumption of electricity in the area of a distribution licensee;

(f) adjudicate upon the disputes between the licensees and generating companies and to refer any dispute for arbitration;

(g) levy fee for the purposes of this Act;

(h) specify State Grid Code consistent with the Grid Code specified under clause (h) of subsection (1) of section 79;

(i) specify or enforce standards with respect to quality, continuity and reliability of service by licensees;

(j) fix the trading margin in the intra-State trading of electricity, if considered, necessary;

(k) discharge such other functions as may be assigned to it under this Act."

Section 50 of the Act dealing with the Electricity Supply Code statutorily provides for the cases, inter alia, with regard to the tampering of electric lines or meter and method of collection of electricity charges. Similarly, Section 86 of the Act empowers the State Commission to determine the tariff for generation, supply, transmission and wheeling of electricity, wholesale, bulk and retail within the State. But, till date, it has not provided for setting up of standards for harmonics charges. Therefore, neither Section 50 nor Section 86 of the Act supports respondent TANGEDCO in the matter of levying of harmonic charges on the



WEB COPY

11kv/22kv supply line consumers.

34. Likewise, Section 181 gives power to the State Commission to make Regulations consistent with the Act and Rules to carry out the provisions of this Act. By exercising such power, the Tamil Nadu Electricity Regulatory Commission had issued the Tamil Nadu Electricity Supply Code, wherein the Regulation 4(1)(iv) of the Tamil Nadu Electricity Supply Code, which is extracted below, deals with additional charges for harmonic dumping.

"4.Charges recoverable by the Licensee -
The charges, recoverable by the Licensee from the consumers are:-

xxxx

(1). Tariff related charges, namely, -

(iv). Additional charges for harmonics dumping

Where any equipment installed by a consumer generates harmonics, the consumer shall provide adequate harmonic suppression units to avoid dumping of harmonics into Licensee's distribution system and the Licensee is at liberty to provide suitable metering equipment to measure the harmonic level pursuant to such harmonic. Where the consumer fails to provide such units, he shall be liable to pay compensation at such rates as the Commission may declare from time to time."

In view of Regulation 4(1)(iv) of the Tamil Nadu Electricity Supply Code, although the State has got power to direct the consumers to install harmonic filters irrespective of their voltage connection as stated by learned Additional Advocate General for the TANGEDCO, the same cannot be sustained in view of non-specification of any standard of harmonics for 11kv/22kv/supply line consumers by the CEA, who, being an Apex Body as per Section 73(d) of the Act, has exclusive powers to specify the Grid Standards for operation and maintenance of transmission lines.

35. Thus, for all the reasons stated above, the impugned demands are quashed. Consequently, the writ petitions are allowed. No Costs. Consequently, connected miscellaneous petitions are also closed. "

4. In view of the fact that the case of the petitioner is also similar to that of the cases cited supra, and the



petitioner is also entitled to the relief. Accordingly, the impugned demand notice is quashed and the writ petition is allowed. No costs. Consequently, connected miscellaneous petition is closed.

WEB COPY

Sd/-
Assistant Registrar (CS-II)

//True Copy//

Sub Assistant Registrar

shr/ska

To

1. The Chairman
Tamilnadu Generation and Distribution Corporation Limited.
(TANGEDCO),
144 Anna Salai,
Chennai 600002
2. The Superintending Engineer.
Chennai Electricity Distribution Circle/North,
TANGEDCO,
No.144, Anna Salai,
Chennai 600002
3. The Chairman,
The Central Electricity Authority (CEA),
6th Floor, Selva Bhawan,
R.K.Puram, New Delhi-110 066.
4. Tamilnadu Electricity Regulatory Commission
No.19A, Rukmani Lakshmipathy Salai,
Egmore, Chennai -600008

+1cc to Mr.K.Seshadri, Advocate, S.R.No.4452

W.P.No.43903 of 2016
and
W.M.P.No.37719 of 2016

GJ (CO)
SU (09/02/2022)