IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED: 27.08.2020

CORAM

THE HONOURABLE DR. JUSTICE ANITA SUMANTH

W.P. No.11623 of 2020
and WMP.No.14251 of 2020

S.R.Blue Metals
Represented by its Managing Partner Mr.S. Ramachandran
9954 / 31 Samuthira Towers G-4 Nizam Colony
Pudukkottai 622 001. .. Petitioner

Vs.

1 The Principal Commissioner and
Commissioner of Commercial Taxes
Ezhilagam Chepauk Chennai 600 005

2 The Assistant Commissioner (ST)
Pudukottai Assessment Circle Pudukottai

3 The Joint Commissioner (ST)
Computer Cell PAPJM Building
Greams Road Chennai 600 006 .. Respondents

Prayer: Writ Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying to Writ of Mandamus to direct the respondents to issue C forms under the Central Sales Tax 1956 read with the Central Sales Tax (Registration and Turnover) Rules 1957 to the petitioner for the purchase of High Speed Diesel Oil from the suppliers in other States in view of the recent order dated 13.7.2020 passed by the Honble Madras High Court in the case of M/s. Ram Blue Metals in W.P. No. 9142 / 2020

WEB COPY

For Petitioner : Mr.P.Rajkumar

For Respondents: Ms. G.Dhanamadhiri
Government Advocate

https://hcservices.ecourts.gov.in/hcservices/

O R D E R

Mr.Dhanamadhiri, learned Government Advocate (Taxes) accepts notice for all three respondents. By consent of, and at request of learned counsel for the petitioner and Mrs.Dhanamadhiri, the Writ Petition is taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission.

2. Both learned counsel draw my attention to an order passed in W.P.Nos.4173 and 4176 in the case of M/s. Dhandapani Cement Private Limited Vs. The State of Tamil Nadu, wherein the identical issue as arising before me has been considered and decided by me in the following terms:

> 'Mr.V.Haribabu, learned Additional Government Pleader (Taxes)takes notice for the respondents. By consent of both sides, finalorders are passed in these Writ Petitions even at the stage of admission.
>
> 2. The petitioners in the Writ Petitions have expressed their difficulty in obtaining 'C' forms under the provisions of the Central Sales Tax Act, 1956 in order to avail concessional benefit of tax for purchase of High Speed Diesel from suppliers in other States.
>
> 3. At the outset, Mr.P.Rajkumar, learned counsel for the petitioner and Mr.V.Haribabu, learned Additional Government Pleader for the revenue agree that the issue in regard to entitlement to 'C' Forms for purchase of High Speed Diesel from supplies outside Tamil Nadu, to enable the dealers to seek a concessional rate of tax, is covered in favour of the assessee by a decision of this Court in M/s Ramco Cements Ltd. V. The Commissioner of Commercial Taxes (W.P.Nos.19460 of 2018) dated 26.10.2018 in a batch of over fifty (50) Writ Petitions.
>
> 4. A learned Single Judge of this Court in considering the issue held categorically that the benefit of the concessional rate is available to dealers who purchase High Speed Diesel from neighbouring States by way of inter-state sales. Reference is made to the decisions of other Courts that have considered an

WEB COPY

https://hcservices.ecourts.gov.in/hcservices/

identical issue, holding the same in favour of the assessee. In fact, the decision of the Punjab and Haryana High Court has been carried to the Supreme Court in special leave and has been confirmed in State Of Haryana & Others Vs. Caparo Power Ltd. & Others in Special Leave Petition (Civil No. 20572 of 2018). The issue has also been considered in Hindustan Zinc Limited & Several Others Vs. The State of Rajasthan & others (S.B.Civil Writ Petition No.5506/2018 dated 18.05.2018) and Shree Raipur Cement Plant (A unit of Shree Cement Limited) Vs. State of Chhattisgarh, Finance department (Tax Division) (W.P.(T) No.83 of 2018 dated 18.05.2018) and held in favour of the assessee.

5. Mr.Haribabu does not dispute the above position. However, he maintains that the State proposes to challenge the order of the learned Single Judge in the case of M/s. Ramco Cements Ltd (supra) though no such appeal has been filed thus far.

6. In such circumstances, till such time the order of this court in the case of M/s Ramco Cements Ltd (supra) is either stayed or reversed it is incumbent upon all Assessing Authorities within the State of Tamil Nadu to apply the rationale of the decision to all pending assessments. The Petitioner in these Writ Petitions has stated on affidavit that it is unable to download the 'C' forms from the websites as the same stand blocked from use. Upon enquiry with the Assessing Authorities, they have been informed that the benefit of the decision in M/s Ramco Cements Ltd can be extended only to those dealers that are party to the decision. This stand is unacceptable in so far as the decision of this Court as well as other High Courts, one of which has been confirmed by the Supreme Court, are decisions in rem, applicable to all dealers that seek benefit thereunder, of course, in accordance with law.

7. For the above reasons, these Writ Petitions are allowed. Consequently, necessary action to be taken by the department, forthwith. No costs. Connected Miscellaneous petitions are closed.'

WEB COPY

https://hcservices.ecourts.gov.in/hcservices/

3. The State has, after the date of the above order, filed a Writ Appeal in W.A.No.3403 of 2019 challenging the decision in the case of Ramco Cements (Supra) that has been considered and dismissed by a Division Bench of this Court on 09.03.2020. Ms.Dhanamadhiri, agrees that there is complete identity on facts and in law in the matter before me as well as in the matter considered earlier. I thus reiterate the view taken in the above matter.

4. In the result, the writ petition is allowed. Consequently, necessary action be taken by the Department forthwith. No costs. Consequently, connected miscellaneous petition is closed.

-s/d-
Assistant Registrar

True Copy

Sub-Assistant Registrar

To
1 The Principal Commissioner and
Commissioner of Commercial Taxes
Ezhilagam Chepauk Chennai 600 005

2 The Assistant Commissioner (ST)
Pudukottai Assessment Circle Pudukottai

3 The Joint Commissioner (ST)
Computer Cell PAPJM Building
Greams Road Chennai 600 006

+1 CC to The Special Government Pleader, sr 28095.

W.P. No.11623 of 2020
and WMP.No.14251 of 2020

GP(CO)

SP(07/10/2020)

WEB COPY

https://hcservices.ecourts.gov.in/hcservices/