

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED: 14.02.2020

CORAM

THE HONOURABLE DR. JUSTICE ANITA SUMANTH
Writ Petition No.3648 of 2020
and
WMP. No.4295 of 2020

M/s.Pranar Oil and Chemicals India Pvt. Ltd,
Represented by its Managing Director,
Arunkumar solanki

...Petitioner

Vs.

1. The State of Tamil Nadu,
Represented by the Secretary to Government,
Commercial Taxes Department,
Fort St. George, Chennai - 600 001.
2. The Principal Commissioner & Commissioner of
Commercial Taxes,
Ezhilagam, Chepauk,
Chennai - 600 005.
3. The Assistant Commissioner (ST),
Gandhipuram Assessment Circle,
Gandhipuram, Coimbatore - 641 018.
4. The State Tax Officer,
Gandhipuram Assessment Circle,
Coimbatore - 641 018.
5. Commercial Tax Officer,
Balasundharam Road,
Coimbatore.

... Respondents

PRAYER: PETITION filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India praying for the issuance of Writ of Mandamus to direct the respondents 2 to 5 herein to issue "C" declaration forms under the Central Sales Tax Act, 1956 to the petitioner herein for their purchases of High Speed Diesel Oil effected from the supplier in other States.

For Petitioner : Ms. J.R.Pabhakaran
For Respondents : Mr. M.Hariharan,
Additional Government Pleader (Taxes)

O R D E R

Mr. M.Hariharan, learned Additional Government Pleader (Taxes) accepts notice for the respondents. At request of both learned counsel this Writ Petition has taken up for final hearing even at the stage of admission.

2. Both learned counsel draw my attention to an order passed in W.P.Nos.4173 and 4176 in the case of M/s. Dhandapani Cement Private Limited Vs. The State of Tamil Nadu, wherein the identical issue as arising before me has been considered and decided by me in the following terms:

'Mr.V.Haribabu, learned Additional Government Pleader (Taxes) takes notice for the respondents. By consent of both sides, final orders are passed in these Writ Petitions even at the stage of admission.

2. The petitioners in the Writ Petitions have expressed their difficulty in obtaining 'C' forms under the provisions of the Central Sales Tax Act, 1956 in order to avail concessional benefit of tax for purchase of High Speed Diesel from suppliers in other States.

3. At the outset, Mr.P.Rajkumar, learned counsel for the petitioner and Mr.V.Haribabu, learned Additional Government Pleader for the revenue agree that the issue in regard to entitlement to 'C' Forms for purchase of High Speed Diesel from supplies outside Tamil Nadu, to enable the dealers to seek a concessional rate of tax, is covered in favour of the assessee by a decision of this Court in M/s Ramco Cements Ltd. V. The Commissioner of Commercial Taxes (W.P.Nos.19460 of 2018) dated 26.10.2018 in a batch of over fifty (50) Writ Petitions.

4. A learned Single Judge of this Court in considering the issue held categorically that the benefit of the concessional rate is available to dealers who purchase High Speed Diesel from neighbouring States by way of inter-state sales. Reference is made to the decisions of other Courts that have considered an identical issue, holding the same in favour of the assessee. In fact, the decision of the Punjab and Haryana High Court has been carried to the Supreme Court in special leave and has been confirmed in State Of Haryana & Others Vs. Caparo Power Ltd. & Others in Special Leave Petition (Civil No. 20572 of 2018). The issue has also been considered in Hindustan Zinc Limited & Several Others Vs. The State of Rajasthan & others (S.B.Civil Writ Petition No.5506/2018 dated 18.05.2018) and Shree Raipur Cement Plant (A unit of Shree Cement Limited) Vs. State of Chhattisgarh, Finance department (Tax Division) (W.P.(T) No.83 of 2018 dated 18.05.2018) and held in favour of the assessee.

5. Mr.Haribabu does not dispute the above position. However, he maintains that the State proposes to challenge the order of the learned Single Judge in the case of M/s. Ramco Cements Ltd (supra) though no such appeal has been filed thus far.

6. In such circumstances, till such time the order of this court in the case of M/s Ramco Cements Ltd (supra) is either stayed or reversed it is incumbent upon all Assessing Authorities within the State of Tamil Nadu to apply the rationale of the decision to all pending assessments. The Petitioner in these Writ Petitions has stated on affidavit that it is unable to download the 'C' forms from the websites as the same stand blocked from use. Upon enquiry with the Assessing Authorities, they have been informed that the benefit of the decision in M/s Ramco Cements Ltd can be extended only to those dealers that are party to the decision. This stand is unacceptable in so far as the decision of this Court as well as other High Courts, one of which has been

confirmed by the Supreme Court, are decisions in rem, applicable to all dealers that seek benefit thereunder, of course, in accordance with law.

7. For the above reasons, these Writ Petitions are allowed. Consequently, necessary action to be taken by the department, forthwith. No costs. Connected Miscellaneous petitions are closed.'

3. The State has, after the date of the above order, filed a Writ appeal challenging the decision in the case of Ramco Cements (Supra) that is pending. No stay of the order of the learned single Judge has been obtained. Barring the aforesaid, there is complete identity on facts and in law in the matter before me as well as in the matter considered earlier. I thus reiterate the view taken in the above matter.

4. In the result, this writ petition is allowed. Consequent action be taken by the Department forthwith. Connected Miscellaneous Petition is closed. No costs.

Sd/-

Assistant Registrar (CS V)

//True Copy//

Sub Assistant Registrar

To

1. The Secretary to Government,
The State of Tamil Nadu,
Commercial Taxes Department,
Fort St. George, Chennai - 600 009.
2. The Principal Commissioner & Commissioner of
Commercial Taxes,
Ezhilagam, Chepauk,
Chennai - 600 005.

3. The Assistant Commissioner (ST),
Gandhipuram Assessment Circle,
Gandhipuram, Coimbatore - 641 018.

4. The State Tax Officer,
Gandhipuram Assessment Circle,
Coimbatore - 641 018.

5. Commercial Tax Officer,
Balasundharam Road,
Coimbatore.

+1cc to Ms. J.R.Pabhakaran, Advocate sr.12888
+1cc to Special Government Pleader sr.12246

Writ Petition No.3648 of 2020
and
WMP. No.4295 of 2020

ssv(co)
nr 17/02/2020



WEB COPY