

LPA no. 1134 of 2017 (O&M) 1

**IN THE HIGH COURT OF PUNJAB AND HARYANA AT
CHANDIGARH**

LPA no. 1134 of 2017 (O&M)

Date of Decision : 12.03.2019

Priya Mann

....Appellant(s)

Versus

University Grants Commission and another

...Respondent(s)

**CORAM : HON'BLE MR.JUSTICE MAHESH GROVER
HON'BLE MR JUSTICE LALIT BATRA**

Present : Mr.Rahul Sharma, Advocate for the appellant

Mr. Salil Sablok, Advocate for UGC-respondent no.1

Mr. Harsh Aggarwal, Advocate for respondent no. 2

MAHESH GROVER, J.(ORAL)

The appellant had disputed a question and claimed marks on account of ambiguity in the answer key.

We had on 18.1.2019 passed an order noticing the question and controversy in detail and deemed it appropriate to refer the matter to the Department of English, Panjab University to give a conclusive information which has now been received with a categorical assertion that the answer of the disputed question is not the one as claimed by the appellant. For the sake of clarity, we reproduce the question and the opinion of the experts as below:-

“Question No.26- How many legends of good women could

Chaucer complete in his The Legend of Good Women?

(A) Six (B) Seven (C) Eight (D) Nine

“In our opinion the answer to the question under discussion is **(D), Nine.**

The reason: The Legend of Good Women by Geoffrey Chaucer consists of the Prologue and nine parts. Each part except the fourth one deals with good woman, while the fourth part deals with two, Hypispyle and Medea. The ninth part dealing with Hypermnestra is left unfinished. The nine women whose stories are narrated by Chaucer in the first eight parts are 1. Cleopatra, 2. Thisble, 3. Dido, 4.Hypispyle, 5. Medea, 6. Laucrece or Lucertiatia, 7. Ariadne, 8. Philomela, and 9. Phillis or Phyllis. The legend of the tenth woman, Hypermnestra, narrated in ninth part is left unfinished.”

In view of above, we deem it appropriate to give a quietus to the controversy and decline interference. Hence, instant appeal is hereby dismissed.

(Mahesh Grover)
Judge

12.03.2019
rekha

(Lalit Batra)
Judge

Whether speaking/reasoned
Whether reportable

Yes/No
Yes/No