

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED: 05.11.2019

CORAM:

THE HONOURABLE MRS.JUSTICE R. HEMALATHA

C.M.A.No.145 of 2014

1.Muniammal
2.Nagaraj
3.Chandra
4.Jothi

... Appellants/Petitioner

vs.

The Managing Director,
Tamil Nadu State Transport Corporation Ltd.,
Bharathipuram (Salem Division II),
Dharmapuri.

...Respondent/Respondent

PRAYER: Civil Miscellaneous Appeal filed under Section 173 of the Motor Vehicles Act, 1988 against the decree and judgment dated 26.04.2012 in M.C.O.P.No.646 of 2009 on the file of the Motor Accident Claims Tribunal / Additional District Court, Krishnagiri.

Appellants : Mr.M.Sriram

Respondent : Mr.S.V.Vasanth Kumar

J U D G M E N T

The appellants are the claimants in M.C.O.P.No.646 of 2009 on the file of the Motor Accident Claims Tribunal / Additional District Court, Krishnagiri. They filed the claim petition under Section 163(A) of the Motor Vehicles Act, 1988 seeking compensation of Rs.7,00,000/- for the death of one Tippannan @ Muniappan, husband of the first claimant, father of the claimants 2 to 4 in a road accident on 25.05.2008.

2. The case of the claimants in nutshell is as follows:

On 25.05.2008, the deceased Tippannan @ Muniappan was walking along Sub Jail Road, Mosque Street, Krishnagiri and at about 11.30 a.m, a speeding bus bearing Registration No. TN 29 1419, belonging to TNSTC, hit him, as a result whereof, he sustained fatal injuries and died in the Hospital on the same date.

3. According to the claimants, the accident took place due to the rash and negligent driving of the driver of the bus

bearing Registration No. TN 29 1419 belonging to the respondent / Tamil Nadu State Transport Corporation Limited and therefore, they are liable to pay compensation.

4. The learned Additional District Judge / Motor Accident Claims Tribunal, Krishnagiri after analysing the evidence on record, awarded a compensation of Rs.3,87,700/- together with interest at the rate of 6% per annum to the claimants. Not being satisfied with the quantum of compensation awarded by the Tribunal, the claimants have filed the present appeal under Section 173 of the Motor Vehicles Act, 1988.

5. Heard Mr.M.Sriram, learned counsel appearing for the appellants and Mr.S.V.Vasantha Kumar, learned counsel appearing for the respondent.

6. In the claim petition, it is contended that the deceased was a vegetable vendor, earning a sum of Rs.3,300/- per month. In the absence of income proof, the Tribunal fixed the monthly income of the deceased as Rs.3,300/-. It is pertinent to point out that the accident took place in the year 2008 and in the facts and circumstances, this Court is of the opinion that fixing a sum of Rs.7,500/- as notional monthly income of the deceased would meet the ends of justice. The Tribunal did not award any amount towards "future prospects" of the deceased, especially, when the deceased was aged 50 years on the date of the accident. As per the decision of the Supreme Court of India in National Insurance Co. vs Pranay sethi and others reported in 2017 (2) TNMAC 601, 10% should be added towards future prospects of the deceased. Since there are four dependents, 1/3rd of the deceased's income should be deducted towards his personal expenses. The proper multiplier to be adopted in the instant case is 13 as per the decision rendered in Sarla Verma and others vs. Delhi Transport Corporation and another reported in (2009) 6 SCC 121.

Calculation

Notional Income = Rs.7,500/-
10% Future Prospects = Rs.750/-
Total = Rs.7,500/- + Rs.750/- = Rs.8,250/-
After 1/3 deduction = Rs.5,500/-

Loss of dependency

= Rs.5,500/- x 12 x 13
= Rs.8,58,000/-

7. Apart from the above said amount, the appellants / claimants are entitled to a sum of Rs.15,000/-, Rs.40,000/- and Rs.15,000/- towards "loss of estate", "loss of consortium" and "funeral expenses" respectively, as per the decision rendered in National Insurance Co. vs Pranay sethi and others reported in 2017 (2) TNMAC 601 (SC). The award passed by this Court under various heads is extracted hereunder:

S.No.	Head	Amount granted by this court
1.	Loss of dependency	Rs.8,58,000/-
2.	Loss of estate	Rs.15,000/-
3.	Loss of consortium	Rs.40,000/-
4.	Funeral expenses	Rs.15,000/-
Total		Rs.9,28,000/-

8. Thus, the compensation awarded by the Tribunal is enhanced from Rs.3,87,700/- to Rs.9,28,000/- which would carry interest at the rate of 7.5% per annum.

9. In the result,

(i) The Civil Miscellaneous Appeal is partly allowed.
No costs.

(ii) The compensation awarded by the Tribunal is enhanced from Rs.3,87,700/- to Rs.9,28,000/-.

(iii) The appellants / claimants are directed to pay court fee for the enhanced compensation amount, if any, within a period of three weeks from the date of this order and the Registry is directed to draft the decree only after receipt of the Court fee.

(iv) The respondent / Tamil Nadu State Transport Corporation Limited is directed to deposit the enhanced compensation amount i.e., Rs.9,28,000/- (less the amount already deposited) together with interest at the rate of 7.5% per annum from the date of claim petition till the date of deposit to the credit of M.C.O.P.No.646 of 2009 on the file of the Motor Accident Claims Tribunal / Additional District Court, Krishnagiri within a period of four weeks from the date of receipt of a copy of this order.

(v) On such deposit being made, the appellants / claimants are at liberty to withdraw the same as per the orders passed by the Tribunal after following due process of law. The ratio of apportionment made by the Tribunal shall be kept intact.

Sd/-

Assistant Registrar

//True copy//

Sub Assistant Registrar

mtl

To

The Motor Accidents Claims Tribunal,
The Additional District Judge,
Krishnagiri.

+1cc to Mr.S.V.Vasanth Kumar, Advocate SR.No.91760

+1cc to Mr.Mukund R.P.Pandiyan, Advocate SR.No.91761

C.M.A.No.145 of 2014

RSI (CO)
GMY (03/02/2020)