

**IN THE HIGH COURT OF PUNJAB & HARYANA AT
CHANDIGARH.**

CWP No.6001 of 2016(O&M)

Date of Decision:-09.05.2017

Gurpreet Singh.

.....Petitioner.

Versus

State of Punjab & Ors.

.....Respondent.

CORAM:- HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE JASWANT SINGH

Present:- Mr. Kapil Kakkar, Advocate for the Petitioner.

Mr. Vaibhav Sharma, Deputy Advocate General, Punjab.

Mr. Amrit Paul, Advocate for respondent-3-GNDU, Amritsar.

JASWANT SINGH, J (ORAL)

Petitioner, who had applied for the post of Lecturer in the Subject of History (advertised by respondent no.2), is seeking quashing of the result on the ground that the answer key to the question nos.57 & 67 of Booklet 'C' are wrong and consequently, has sought directions for reevaluation of his answer sheet.

Learned Counsel for the petitioner has argued that answers to question nos.57 and 67, as given by the respondents are absolutely incorrect. As per the counsel, the answer to question no.57 i.e. “*Karl Marx is known for his Work?*”, as per 2016 edition of General Studies Paper-1 for Civil Services Preliminary Examination, published by MC Graw Hill Education is “Das Kapital”. However, there is no such option given in the answers to be ticked by the candidates. As far as question no.67 i.e. “*From which language the word Punjabi derived from?*”, is concerned the answer to it is Sanskrit because Punjabi language originated from Sanskrit, as is evident from the Book titled as “*Punjabi Adhyan Te Adhyapan Badalde*

Prepekh” written by Jeet Singh Annexure P-12. However, as per the respondents the answer to the said question is “*Persian*” which is wrong. Thus, the learned Counsel for petitioner has argued that the petitioner should be given benefit of two marks for the above said two wrong questions.

On the other hand Learned Counsel for the respondents have argued that there is no ambiguity either in the question or in the answers. As per the learned Counsel, Karl Marx is known for his work “*The Capital*” which is the literal translation of word “*Das Kapital*”. As far as the second question is concerned, he has argued that word Punjabi is derived from Persian, although, Punjabi language might have its origin from Sanskrit. Thus, the answer keys to both the above questions are correct and therefore, no interference is warranted by cancelling the above said questions.

After hearing learned Counsel for the parties and perusing the paper book this Court is of the considered view that the present petition is devoid of any merit and the same deserves to be dismissed.

This Court is taking the questions one by one to come to a concrete conclusion as to whether there is any ambiguity in the answer keys/questions or not.

As far as the first question is concerned, the respondents have placed on record the relevant pages of book “*Fifty Great Thinkers on History*” written by Marrie Hughes-Warrington (2004 edition) wherein it has been mentioned that Marx's major works included Capital (Annexure R-3/1). Not only this, respondents have also placed on record the front page of the book “*CAPITAL*” written by Karl Marx (Annexure R-3/2). Even the material placed on record by the learned counsel for the petitioner shows that the famous work of Karl Marx was “*Das Kapital*”. Hence, if we consider all the options that were given for question no.57 i.e. (A) *The Capital* (B) *The Wealth of Nations* (C) *The Prince* (D) *War and Peace*; there remains no doubt that the answer could not have been any other option than option “A” i.e. *The Capital*. Hence, there is no mistake on part of the respondents to consider option A to be correct answer.

As far as the second question is concerned, the contention raised by the petitioner is completely misconceived. The petitioner is wrongly reading the question as if it has been asked as to from where

Punjabi language has been derived. A bare perusal of the question would show that the candidate had to answer from which language word Punjabi is derived. Thus, the petitioner is wrongly confusing the answer to the aforesaid question as if he had to answer the origin of Punjabi language. Whereas in essence the candidate had to answer as to from where word Punjabi has been derived. Hence, there is no ambiguity in this question at all, especially in view of the fact that the respondents have placed on record documents Annexure R-3/3 to R-3/5 which are the pages from various text books dealing with the history of Punjab, wherein it has been categorically mentioned that Punjabi word has been derived from Persian.

In view of the above, finding no merit in the present petition, the same is hereby dismissed.

(JASWANT SINGH)
JUDGE

May 09, 2017
Vinay

Whether speaking/reasoned	Yes/No
Whether Reportable	Yes/No