

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT MADRAS

DATED : 18.12.2015

CORAM

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE K.KALYANASUNDARAM

W.P.No.38940 of 2015

and

M.P.No.1 of 2015

Dr.K.Veeramani

... Petitioner

Vs.

- 1 The State of Tamil Nadu  
Represented by the Secretary to Government,  
Commercial Taxes and Registration Department,  
Fort St.George, Chennai-600 009.
  - 2 The Principal Secretary /  
Commissioner of Commercial Taxes,  
Ezhilagam, Chepauk,  
Chennai-600 005.
- ... Respondents

Prayer: Petition filed under Article 226 of the Constitution of India to issue a Writ of Mandamus Forbearing the Respondents from effecting any promotion to the cadre of Joint Commissioner of Commercial Taxes pending disposal of the petitioner's representations dated 10.07.2015 & 23.10.2015 and the decision of the High Level Committee Constituted under G.O.(D) No.132, (Commercial Taxes and Registration (E1) Department) dated 31.03.2015 on the issue of inter-se seniority among the direct recruits and promotees.

For Petitioner : Mr.M.Sivavarthanan

For Respondent : Mr.S.Kanmani Annamalai  
Additional Government Pleader (Taxes)

O R D E R

By consent, the writ petition is taken up for final disposal.

2.The petitioner would state that he joined the services of Commercial Tax Department as direct recruit Assistant Commissioner of Commercial Taxes (previously known as Commercial

Tax Officer) through Group I services during the year 2002 and got promotion to the post of Deputy Commissioner of Commercial Taxes (previously known as Assistant Commissioner) vide G.O.Ms.No.132, CT & R Department dated 18.10.2013. The petitioner is presently working as Deputy Commissioner (CT) and according to him, he is awaiting further promotion to the post of Joint Commissioner of Commercial Taxes.

3.The petitioner would further state that the post of Assistant Commissioner of Commercial Taxes (previously known as Commercial Tax Officer) comes under the Category 4 of the Tamil Nadu Commercial Taxes Services and as per Rule 2(a) of the Tamil Nadu Commercial Taxes Services, the appointment to the said categories are made by the following methods:

1. Direct recruitment or
2. Recruitment by transfer from the category of Commercial Tax Officers in the Tamil Nadu Commercial Taxes Subordinate Service or
3. Recruitment by transfer from the category of Section Officers of the Tamil Nadu Secretariat in Category 3 in Class XII of the Tamil Nadu General Service.

4.The petitioner would further state that in terms of Rule 2 (c) of Tamil Nadu Commercial Taxes Services, appointments to the permanent vacancies for the posts included in the Category 4 would be made in the following manner:

1. Recruitment by transfer
2. Recruitment by transfer
3. Direct recruitment

5.It is the case of the petitioner that the normal method of recruitment is more than one method of recruitment. The seniority of a person in that category has to be determined with reference to the date on which he is appointed to that category in accordance with General Rule 35(aa) of the Tamil Nadu State and Subordinate Rules and further that the first respondent while issuing the G.O.(Ms) No.116 Commercial Taxes and Registration (E1) Department dated 24.08.2012, regarding inter-se seniority list by direct recruitment and recruitment by transfer in the regular list of Commercial Tax Officer / Assistant Commissioner (CT) for the years from 1984 - 2010, has not followed the same and the resultant position is, the officials who later on entered into service have marched over the petitioner and other persons similarly placed.

6.It is also stated by the petitioner that Group I Officers made a challenge to G.O.Ms.No.116, Commercial Taxes and Registration (E1) Department dated 24.08.2012 passed by the first respondent in W.P.No.18264 of 2013 and the same is

pending.

7.It is also stated by the petitioner that based on the orders passed by this Court in W.P.No.12786 of 1985 dated 19.06.1986 as well as the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India dated 10.02.1999 in Civil Appeal No.1454 of 1987, inter-se seniority in the Commercial Taxes Department between direct recruits and transferees is fixed only in relation to permanent posts and the Commercial Taxes Staff Association took a stand that due to above fixation of inter-se seniority, the direct recruits (Group II Officers) gain seniority over their transferee counterparts and they got promotion quickly than the transferees.

8.Inorder to address the said grievance, the first respondent has also constituted a High Level Committee by passing G.O.(D) No.132, Commercial Taxes and Registration (E1) Department, dated 31.03.2015, consisting of Principal Secretary to Government, Finance Department, Principal Secretary to Government, Personnel and Administrative Reforms Department, Principal Secretary to Government, Commercial Taxes & Registration Department, Secretary, Law Department and Principal Secretary/ Commissioner of Commercial Taxes and the Group I Officers had also submitted a joint representation dated 10.07.2015 to the High Level Committee and the petitioner has also submitted individual representations dated 09.09.2015 and 23.10.2015 to the first respondent through proper channel for redressal of their grievance. The petitioner apprehending that pending decision by the High Level Committee, promotion is sought to be made to fill up the post of Joint Commissioner, came forward to file this writ petition.

9.The learned counsel appearing for the petitioner would submit that the first respondent in all fairness should have deferred the promotion to the post of Joint Commissioner till the High Level Committee constituted under G.O.(D) No.132, Commercial Taxes and Registration (E1) Department, dated 31.03.2015 took a decision and also drawn the attention of this Court to the joint representation dated 10.07.2015 submitted by the Group I Officers as well as the individual representation dated 23.10.2015 submitted by the petitioner and prays for appropriate orders.

10.Per contra, Mr.S.Kanmani Annamalai, learned Additional Government Pleader (Taxes) who accepts notice on behalf of the respondents would submit that the challenge made to G.O.Ms.No.116, Commercial Taxes and Registration (E1) Department dated 24.08.2012 is still pending adjudication and seeks time to get instructions.

11.This Court has carefully considered the rival submissions and also perused the materials placed before it.

12.A perusal of the above said order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India has taken into consideration several intervention applications filed by direct recruits as well as by promotees and upon hearing submission appearing for the State Government/ respondents, has directed the State Government to consider their grievance with regard to the provisional seniority within a stipulated time frame and also made it clear that if the intervention applicants are aggrieved by any order that may be passed on such consideration, it will be open to them to have recourse of such remedy as is available in law and dismissed all the interlocutory applications.

13. Group I Officers of the Commercial Tax Department as well as the petitioner had submitted his representation dated 23.10.2015 and the same is pending consideration before the High Level Committee.

14.In the light of the above facts and circumstances, this Court is of the view that the representation dated 10.07.2015 submitted by the Group I Officers of the Commercial Tax Department to the High Level Committee constituted under G.O.(D) No.132, Commercial Taxes and Registration (E1) Department, dated 31.03.2015 have to be disposed of within a stipulated time and till then further decision effecting promotion to the post of Joint Commissioner shall be deferred.

15.Though the petitioner prayed for a larger relief, this Court in the light of the above facts and circumstances and without going into the merits of the claim projected by the petitioner either in this writ petition or in his representation dated 23.10.2015 or in the representation dated 10.07.2015 submitted by the Group I Officers of the Commercial Tax Department, directs the High Level Committee constituted under G.O.(D) No.132, Commercial Taxes and Registration (E1) Department, dated 31.03.2015 to consider the said representation on merits and in accordance with law after putting on notice, the persons concerned and pass orders within a period of six weeks from the date of receipt of a copy of this order and communicate the decision taken, to the petitioner as well as the persons concerned and till then, the first respondent shall defer further decision for effecting promotion to the post of Joint Commissioner of Commercial Taxes.

16.The writ petition is disposed of accordingly. No costs. Consequently, the connected miscellaneous petition is also closed.

Sd/-  
Assistant Registrar(CCC)

True Copy

Sub Assistant Registrar

To

- 1 The Secretary to Government,  
The State of Tamil Nadu  
Commercial Taxes and Registration Department,  
Fort St.George, Chennai-600 009.
- 2 The Principal Secretary /  
Commissioner of Commercial Taxes,  
Ezhilagam, Chepauk,  
Chennai-600 005.

+1cc to Mr.M.Sivavarthanan, Advocate sr.68680

W.P.No.38940 of 2015  
and  
M.P.No.1 of 2015

sk[co]  
srg 22/12/2015



WEB COPY