

**IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT BOMBAY
CIVIL APPELLATE JURISDICTION**

WRIT PETITION NO. 1057 OF 2020

Bhawarlal Parasmal Joshi	...Petitioners
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 542 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Girish Shrichand Jani	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 546 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Mukesh And Naresh Arjundas Kandhari	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 548 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Alka Sanjeevkumar Nichani	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 550 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Jayantilal Bhavanji Gada	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 552 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Ahuja Chandarlal Arjundas	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 559 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Talareja Manoharlal Haridaslal	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 1235 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Rohit Ramesh Vishnu	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 1239 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Raju Pralhad Mangtani	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 1259 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Pawar Dinesh Gopal	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 1268 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Sanjay Purushottam Kekade	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 1986 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Mutha Champalal Bansilal (deceased) Through Legal Heir Himatlal Champalal	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 2000 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Basavraj Shivpadappa Chinchure	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 2094 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Ashok Piraji Pawar	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 2127 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Ahuja Dinesh Prakash	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 2133 OF 2021**

Solapur Municipality Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Arjun Mohandas Wadhariya	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 2476 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Mulchand Devji Shah Decd. Thr Lhr Amit Mulchand Shah	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 2599 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Jagdish Hirji Shah	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 2602 OF 2021**

The Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai	...Petitioner
Versus	
Dhiren Jayantilal Gada	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 2640 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Petitioners
Versus	
Ashok Manikchand Shah Decd. Thr. Lhr Abhijeet Ashok Shah	...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 2645 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Gani Husainsab Choudhari ...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 2653 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Hitendra Ratansinh Shah ...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 3819 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation, Solapur & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Raju Murlidhar Kandhari Decd.
Thr. Lhr Kavita Raju Kandhari ...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 3820 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Smt. Kavita Shrichand Jani ...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 3881 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Ramesh Jugraj Goyal (deceased)
Thru Lhrs Kranti Ramesh Goyal ...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 3894 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Vinod Ratansinh Shah ...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4062 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Ramesh S-o Ramchandra Vishnu ...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4084 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Ratansinh Hansraj Shah (deceased)
Through Legal Heir Praveen Ratansinh Shah ...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4086 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Sangita Sanjay Soni ...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4104 OF 2021**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus

Ratansinh Hansraj Shah (deceased)
Through Legal Heir Hitendra Ratansinh Shah ...Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4252 OF 2021

The Solapur Municipal Corporation
Through Its Superintendent & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Pankaj Madhukar Kalekar ...Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4737 OF 2021

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Omprakash Dnyandev Barad ...Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4741 OF 2021

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Rimpal Khushal Dedhiya ...Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4769 OF 2021

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
C.B. Katte ...Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4773 OF 2021

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Manik S-o Dhanaraj Goyal ...Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4782 OF 2021

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Tara Pravinchand Shah ...Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4941 OF 2021

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Jalinder Ranu Magrumkhane ...Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 4943 OF 2021

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Bharat Jalinder Magrumkhane ...Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION(ST) NO. 99049 OF 2020

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Petitioners
Versus
Bhawarlal Parasmal Joshi ...Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1049 OF 2020**

Omprakash Dnyandev Barad	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1074 OF 2020**

Vinod Ratanshi Shah	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1068 OF 2020**

Deepak Murlidhar Kandhari	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1075 OF 2020**

Rohit Ramesh Vishnu	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1342 OF 2022**

Raju Murlidhar Kandhari	
Through Kavita Raju Kandhari	...Petitioner
Versus	

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1060 OF 2020

Smt. Tara Pravin Shah ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1339 OF 2022

Mukesh Arjundas Kandhari & Another ...Petitioners
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1066 OF 2020

Smt. Sushmatai Murlidhar Ghadge ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1070 OF 2020

Dhiren Jayantilal Gada ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

WITH

WRIT PETITION NO. 1079 OF 2020

Girish Shrichand Jani	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1340 OF 2022**

Gani Husainsab Choudhari Decd. Through Lhr Maboob Gani Jussainsab Choudhari	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 930 OF 2020**

Kavita Jani	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 923 OF 2020**

Pankaj Madhukar Kalekar	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 939 OF 2020**

Ramesh Ramchandra Vishnu	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 924 OF 2020**

Bharat Jalinder Magrumkhane	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 925 OF 2020**

Jalinder Ranu Magrumkhane	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 919 OF 2020**

Sangeeta Sanjay Soni	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 929 OF 2020**

Ramesh Kanji Dedhiya Decd. Through Lhr Khushal Ramesh Dedhiya	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 921 OF 2020**

Ashok Manikchand Shah Decd.
Through Lhr Abhijeet Ashok Shah
and Anjali Ashok Shah ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corproation
Through Superintendant Of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 922 OF 2020**

Ashok Piraji Pawar ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 927 OF 2020**

Dinesh Prakash Ahuja ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1067 OF 2020**

Himmatlal Champalal Muttha ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1078 OF 2020**

Smt. Jayaben W/o. Jayantilal Gada ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 931 OF 2020**

Alka Sanjeevkumar Nichani	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1071 OF 2020**

Manik Dhanraj Goyal	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 928 OF 2020**

Sanjeev Tikamdas Nichani	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1082 OF 2020**

Ramesh Goyal Decd Through Kranti Ramesh Goyal	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 934 OF 2020**

Mulchand Devji Shah Since Deced	
Throu Legal Heir Amit Mulchand Shah	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through	
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 937 OF 2020

Smt. Laxmiben Mulchand Shah	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through	
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1076 OF 2020

Ratanashi Hansraj Shah Decd	
Through Praveen Ratanshi Shah	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through	
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 941 OF 2020

Sunil Rajgopal Upadhye	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through	
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1073 OF 2020

Basavraj Shivpadappa Chinchure	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through	
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1083 OF 2020**

Jayantilal Bhavanji Gada	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1081 OF 2020**

Rimpal Khushal Dedhiya	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1059 OF 2020**

Raju Pralhad Mangtani	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1058 OF 2020**

Manoharlal Haridasamal Talreja	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 920 OF 2020**

Jagdish Hirji Shah	...Petitioner
Versus	

The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1065 OF 2020

Chandarlal Arjundas Ahuja ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1069 OF 2020

Kanhaiyalal Mohandas Vadhariya ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 938 OF 2020

Manoj Parasmal Joshi ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 1080 OF 2020

Sanjay Purushotam Kekade ...Petitioner
Versus
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through
Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors. ...Respondents

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 940 OF 2020

Sanjay Rajgopal Upadhye	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 926 OF 2020**

C.B. Katte Dced. Through Lhr Rohit Katte	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 933 OF 2020**

Wadhariya Bhajandass Khatanmal Decd. Through LHr Arjundas M. Wadhariya	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO. 918 OF 2020**

Sankatlal Gowardhan Upadhey Decd. Through LHr Gaurav B. Upadhey	...Petitioner
Versus	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation Through Its Superintendent of Land And Estates & Ors.	...Respondents

...

WRIT PETITION NO.13914 OF 2022

Dinesh Gopal Pawar	Petitioner
V/S	
The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Respondents

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.13330 OF 2023**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Petitioner
V/S	
Sanjay Rajgopal Upadhye	Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.13331 OF 2023**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Petitioner
V/S	
Kanhaiyyalal M. Wadhariya	Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.6381 OF 2022**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Petitioner
V/S	
Sushmatai Murlidhar Ghadge	Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.6378 OF 2022**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Petitioner
V/S	
Govind Shrichand Jani	
(deceased) through Legal Heirs	
Kavita Shrichand Jani	Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.6380 OF 2022**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Petitioner
V/S	
Laxiben Mulchand Shah	Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.6377 OF 2022**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Petitioner
V/S	
Jayaben Jayantilal Gada	Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.6383 OF 2022**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Petitioner
V/S	
Deepak Murlidhar Kandhari	Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.6376 OF 2022**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Petitioner
V/S	
Dedhiya Ramesh Kanji deceased, through Legal Heir Khushal Ramesh Dedhiya	Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.13365 OF 2023**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Petitioner
V/S	
Upadhye Vyankatlal Gowardhan	Respondent

**WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.6382 OF 2022**

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	Petitioner
V/S	
Nichani Tikamdas Chimandas deceased through Legal Heir Sanjeev Tikamdas Nichani	Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.6379 OF 2022

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioner
V/S	
Sunil Rajgopal Upadhye	Respondent

WITH
WRIT PETITION NO.13332 OF 2023

The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.	...Petitioner
V/S	
Manoj Parasmal Joshi	Respondent

...

Mr. G.S. Godbole, Senior Advocate i/b Mr. Kausthubh Thipsay, Mr. Rahul Soman for successor-in-title of lessees and subtenants.

Mr. G.S. Godbole, Senior Advocate i/b Mr. Shivraj Patne, Mr. Shon Gadgil for successor-in-title of lessees and subtenants.

Mr. Atul Damle, Senior Advocate i/b Mr. Vishwanath Patil for Solapur Municipal Corporation.

...

Mr. Shivraj Patne, for the Petitioner in WP 13914 of 2022 and for Respondents in other Writ Petitions.

Mr. Vishwanath Patil, for the Respondent-Solapur MC in WP 13914 of 2022 and for Petitioner-Solapur MC in other Writ Petitions.

....

CORAM	: SANDEEP V. MARNE, J.
DATE	: NOVEMBER 3, 2023.

P.C.:

1. It is submitted that in the earlier order dated 17 October 2023 in para 3, Writ Petition (Stamp) Nos.2094 of 2021, 3897 of 2021 and 4769 of 2021 are inadvertently typed. The same be deleted from para 3 of the said order.

2 It is further submitted that Writ Petition Nos.918 of 2020 (Sankatlal Gowardhan Upadhye vs. The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.), 1083 of 2020 (Jayantilal Bhavanji Gada vs. The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.), 1067 of 2020 (Himmatlal Champalal Muttha vs. The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.), 1340 of 2022 (Gani Husainsab Choudhari vs. The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors.), 6380 of 2022 (The Solapur Municipal Corporation vs. Laxmiben Mulchand Shah) and Writ Petition (Stamp) No.1986 of 2021 (The Solapur Municipal Corporation & Ors. vs. Mutha Champalal Bansilal), the sole Petitioner has expired. Mr. Godbole, the learned Senior Counsel, seeks leave to bring on record legal heirs of deceased Petitioners. Leave is granted. Amendment to be carried out forthwith. Consequential amendment be carried in cross Writ Petitions filed by the Respondent-Corporation.

3 Order be corrected and read accordingly.

(SANDEEP V. MARNE, J.)