

**IN THE HIGH COURT OF MANIPUR
AT IMPHAL**

PIL No.20 of 2017

Md. Abdul Zabar, aged about 59 years, S/o (L) Md. Mufijuddin,
r/o. Lilong Haoreibi Mayai Leikai, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal
District, Manipur, PIN – 795130.

....Petitioner/s

- Versus -

1. The State of Manipur represented by the
Commissioner/Secretary, Consumer Affairs, Food and Public
Distribution, Government of Manipur at Imphal.
2. District Supply Officer, Consumer Affairs, Food and Public
Distribution, Thoubal District, Manipur.
3. Md. Muhibur Rahaman, aged about 30 years, S/o (L) Md.
Ajjur Rahman, r/o. Lilong Haoreibi Tera Makhong, P.O. &
P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur, PIN – 795130.
4. Md. Zakir Hussain, aged about 32 years, S/o Md. Abdul Jalil,
r/o. Lilong Haoreibi Sambrukhong, P.O. & P.S. Lilong,
Thoubal District, Manipur, PIN – 795130.
5. Md. Sahidur Rahaman, aged about 28 years, S/o (L) Md.
Ahimuddin, r/o. Lilong Haoreibi Mayai Leikai, P.O. & P.S.
Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur, PIN – 795130.
6. Md. Farhan, aged about 30 years, S/o (L) Md. Nasib Ali, r/o.
Lilong Haoreibi Mayai Leikai, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal
District, Manipur, PIN – 795130.

7. Md. Iqbal, aged about 40 years, S/o (L) Md. Jafar Ali, r/o. Lilong Leihaothong Mathak, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur, PIN – 795130.
8. Md. Tamijur Rahman, aged about 36 years, S/o Md. (L) Nijamuddin, r/o. Lilong Leihaothong Makha, P.O. & P.S. Lilong Thoubal District, Manipur, PIN – 795130.
9. Md. Roshan Ali, aged about 34 years, S/o (L) Md. Yusuf Ali, r/o. Lilong Ahanbi Salam Mathak, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
10. Md. Arshad Ali, aged about 32 years, S/o (L) Md. (L) Md. Abdul Samed, r/o. Lilong Ahanbi Salam Makha, Thoubal District, Manipur, PIN – 795130.
11. The Centre for Voluntary Action (CVA), through its Secretary, at Lilong Bazar Pt-II, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
12. Md. Ali, aged about 34 years, S/o (L) Md. Tomcha, r/o. Lilong Bazar Part-II, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
13. Kh. Talibur Rahman, aged about 30 years, S/o Kh. Azizur Rahman, r/o. Lilong Hangamthabi, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
14. Mrs. Fajilatun, aged about 33 years, W/o (L) Naseruddin, r/o. Lilong Tamyai Sumang, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
15. Syed Sakibuddin, aged about 33 years, S/o Sayed Jalauddin, r/o. Lilong Turel Ahanbi Kaleikhong Mathak, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
16. Lilong Keirak Weavers Co-Operative Society (Mrs. Roheda Begum) Lilong Turel Ahanbi Kaleikhong Mathak, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.

17. Md. Riyazuddin, aged about 30 years, S/o (L) Md. Abdul Rahaman, r/o. Lilong Turel Ahanbi Chingkhram Maning, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
18. Chanam Santosh Meitei, aged about 45 years, S/o (L) Chanam Mani Singh, r/o. Lilong Khunou, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
19. Md. Najeruddin, aged about 46 years, S/o (L) Md. Muhiruddin, r/o. Chaobok Mairan Khun, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
20. Md. Madani Ali, aged about 35 years, S/o (L) Md. Yakub Ali, r/o. Haoreibi Turel Ahanbi Darul-Uloom, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
21. Shahid, aged about 37 years, S/o (L) Mv. Rashiad Ali, r/o. Makha Leikai Lairaba Khong, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
22. Md. Abdul Sarif, aged about 36 years, S/o Md. Abdul Zabbar, r/o. Makha Leikai Konjin, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
23. Md. Hamidur Rahaman, aged about 42 years, S/o (L) Md. Sirajuddin, r/o. Makha Leikai Tangki Makha, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
24. Md. Ataur Rahaman, aged about 52 years, S/o Md. Amubi, r/o. Lilong Chingkhram Makha (A), P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
25. Md. Maniruddin, aged about 40 years, S/o (L) Md. Muheiyuddin, r/o. Lilong Chingkhram Makha (B), P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.

26. Md. Abdullah, aged about 35 years, S/o Md. Jahir Ali, r/o. Nungei Chongtham, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
27. Md. Azmal Khan, aged about 40 years, S/o Md. Siraj Khan, r/o. Nungei, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
28. Md. Abdur Rashid, aged about 42 years, S/o (L) Md. Siroj Ali, r/o. Atoukhong Mamang, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
29. Md. Basir Rahaman, aged about 45 years, S/o (L) Md. Abdul Gani, r/o. Atoukhong Maning, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
30. Md. M.V Jabar, aged about 35 years, S/o Not known, r/o. Haoreibi Turel Ahanbi, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
31. Wahida Begum, aged about 40 years, W/o Md. Alimuddin, r/o. Haoreibi Turen Ahanbi Ubak Thong Makha, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
32. Md. Maheijuddin, aged about 42 years, S/o (L) Md. Sanajao, r/o. Chingjao, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
33. Md. Noorul Haque, aged about 35 years, S/o Md. Ziauddin, r/o. Turel Ahanbi Dam Makha, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.

34. Md. Sirajuddin, aged about 32 years, S/o Kamaluddin Khan, r/o. Chandakhong Makha, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
35. Md. Nurullah, aged about 41 years, S/o Md. Tomba, r/o. Khekman Keibung Mathak, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
36. Md. Fakiruddin, aged about 38 years, S/o Md. Babu, r/o. Khekman Keibung Mayai, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
37. Lourembam Rameshwar Singh, aged about 40 years, S/o (L) Bijoy Singh, r/o. Khekman Wangmataba Awang, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
38. Lourembam Sorokumar Singh, aged about 41 years, S/o (L) L. Gouro Singh, r/o. Khekman Wangmataba Makha, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
39. Md. Manigun, aged about 43 years, S/o Not Known, r/o. Khekman Amackham Mathak, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
40. Lourembam Jiten Singh, aged about 40 years, S/o L. Nila Singh, r/o Khekman Amackham Makha, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
41. Huirongbam Premjit Singh, aged about 41 years, S/o H. Inaocha Singh, r/o. Khekman Mathak, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.

42. Thongam Jiten Singh, aged about 43 years, S/o Thongam Maipak Singh, r/o. Khekman Makha, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
43. Oinam Deben Singh, aged about 40 years, S/o (L) O. Chaoba Singh, r/o. Oinam Swombung Dam Mathak, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
44. Laiphram Ratun Singh, aged about 46 years, S/o (L) Babu Singh, r/o. Oinam Swombung Dam Makha, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
45. Khumanthem (o) Pramo Devi, aged about 40 years, C/o Kh. Angou Singh, r/o. Oinam Lairenbi Mathak, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
46. Oinam Manorama Devi, aged about 44 years, D/o Oinam Bimol Singh, r/o. Oinam Lairenbi Makha, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur – 795130.
47. Sharungbam Mocha Singh, aged about 43 years, S/o (L) Sh. Gourahari Singh, r/o. Oinam Laiphrakpam, P.O. & P.S. Lilong, Thoubal District, Manipur, PIN – 795130.
48. The Union of India, represented by the Secretary/Director, Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution, Govt. of India, New Delhi.
- (48.) impleaded vide Hon'ble Court's order 07/06/2018 in PIL No.15/2016.

...Respondent/s

BEFORE
HON'BLE THE ACTING CHIEF JUSTICE MV MURALIDARAN
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A. GUNESHWAR SHARMA

For the Petitioner/s : None

Amicus Curiae : Ms. I. Bimola, junior counsel to
Mr. RK Deepak, Advocate

For the State : Mr. Athouba Khaidem, GA

For the Union of India : Mr. Kh. Samarjit, DSGI

Date of Hearing &
Judgment & Order : **12.06.2023**

JUDGMENT AND ORDER
(ORAL)

A. Guneshwar Sharma, J. :

[1] The present PIL has been filed inter-alia for issuing a Writ of Mandamus directing the State Respondent to distribute entitled foodgrains meant for card holders particularly, Antyodaya Anna Yojna Ration Card holders, Priority Households Card Holders in the State of Manipur, and more particularly, Antyodaya Anna Yojna Ration Card holders of Lilong Assembly Constituency of Manipur who have been deprived of their monthly entitlement of receivable foodgrains under the scheme under National Food Security Act (NFSA), 2013 and to strictly implement various schemes under the NFSA, 2013 in the entire State of Manipur so that the right to receive foodgrains at subsidized prices by persons belonging to eligible households of the State of Manipur under the Targeted Public

Distribution System (TPDS) is safeguarded, fulfilled and protected by the State authority. The prayer in petition is reproduced as:

- i) *To issue a rule-nisi in this behalf;*
- ii) *To make the rule absolute if and when the respondents fail to show cause or sufficient cause in this regard;*
- iii) *To issue a Writ of Mandamus directing the respondent no.1 to distribute the entitled foodgrains meant for card holders particularly, Antyodaya Anna Yojna Ration Card holders, Priority Households Card Holders in the State of Manipur, and more particularly, Antyodaya Anna Yojna Ration Card holders, Priority Households Ration Card Holders of Lilong Assembly Constituency of Manipur who have been deprived of their monthly entitlement of receivable foodgrains under the scheme under National Food Security Act (NFSA), 2013;*
- iv) *To direct the respondent no.1 to strictly implement various schemes under the NFSA, 2013 in the entire State of Manipur so that right to receive foodgrains at subsidized prices by persons belonging to eligible households of the State of Manipur, as provided u/S. 3 read with S.10 of NFSA, 2013, under the Targeted Public Distribution System (TPDS) is safeguarded, made fulfilled and protected by the State authority.*
- v) *In the interim, to direct respondents no.1 and 2 to conduct an enquiry at the Lilong A/C to find out the cause for not distributing the entitled receivable foodgrains to the respective card holders, particularly, Antyodaya Anna Yojna Ration Card holders, Priority Households Ration Card Holders of Lilong Assembly Constituency of Manipur for the months of September, October, December 2016 and January, February, March of 2017 except for the month of November, 2016 and to place a detailed report before this Hon'ble Court, within a month.*
- vi) *And on receiving the enquiry report from the respondents no.1 and 2 and on finding from the said report that the entitled foodgrains were not distributed for the months of*

September, October, December, 2016 and January, February, March of 2017 except for the month of November, 2016 to the respective card holders, particularly, Antyodaya Anna Yojna Ration Card holders, Priority Households Ration Card Holders of Lilong Assembly Constituency of Manipur, then to direct the respondents no.1 and 2 to distribute the same. And also to fix and find out the persons responsible for the non-distribution.

[2] On 25.08.2017, this Court issued notice to the respondents and also recorded the submission of the Advocate General that Manipur State Consumer Disputes Redressal Commission was designated as the State Food Commission for State of Manipur under Section 16 read with Section 18 of the National Food Security Act, 2013 vide notification dated 03.10.2015.

[3] It may be noted that PIL No.15 of 2016 titled M. Poireihenba Meitei vs. Union of India & 3 others was also filed with similar relief for the district of Bishnupur and this PIL No.20 of 2017 was for the whole of State. Accordingly, vide order dated 07.06.2018, this Court closed PIL No.15 of 2016 and merged the same with PIL No.20 of 2017. Similarly, another PIL being PIL No.2 of 2017 titled R.K. Premjit vs. State of Manipur and others was also merged with PIL No.20 of 2017 vide order dated 05.02.2020 and the same was closed and Dr. RK Deepak, advocate was appointed as amicus curiae to assist the Court in PIL No.20 of 2017. Thereafter, only PIL No.20 of 2017 remains as a consolidated case to consider all the reliefs prayed in the other PILs.

[3.1] It may also be pointed out that vide judgment and order dated 13.05.2022 in PIL No.11 of 2020 titled The Human Rights Alert & Another vs. State of Manipur and others, the Hon'ble Division Bench of this Court disposed of the same by passing a series of directions with respect to the proper distribution of essential commodities at the price fixed by the Government and to ensure distribution of essential commodities to the beneficiaries. It was directed that Department of Consumer Affairs of Food and Public Distribution (CAF & PD), Government of Manipur to upload all the eligible households (district-wise) at its official website and to disclose and notify to the public, through the print and electronic media, the details of the **authorized agencies** like names, addresses, etc. as defined in PDS (Control) Order 2015 or the contractors through whom foodgrains will be lifted by it to ensure distribution specially keeping it with the Covid-19 Pandemic prevailing at that time. Para 15 of the judgment and order dated 13.05.2020 passed in PIL No.11 of 2020 is reproduced below.

[15] In view of the above and for the reasons stated hereinabove, the instant PIL stands disposed of with the following conditions:

(a) The Secretary/ Commissioner/ Principal Secretary, Department of CAF & PD, Government of Manipur is directed to upload the list of identified eligible households (district-wise) at its official website within a week from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment and order and inform, thereafter, the public about it;

(b) The Registrar General, High Court of Manipur is directed to furnish the list of complainants, along with their complaints received by this Court, to the Secretary/ Commissioner/ Principal

Secretary, Department of CAF & PD, Government of Manipur who shall get it verified within two days from the date of receipt thereof and if any of the complaints is found to be correct, rice shall be given to them, forthwith, with receipts to be obtained from them;

(c) The State Government and in particular, the Secretary/ Commissioner/ Principal Secretary, Department of CAF & PD, Government of Manipur shall disclose and notify to the public, through the print and electronic media, the details of the authorized agencies like names and addresses etc. as defined in PDS (Control) Order, 2015 or the contractors through whom foodgrains will be lifted by it within three days from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment and order;

(d) The State Government and in particular, the Secretary/ Commissioner/ Principal Secretary, Department of CAF & PD, Government of Manipur shall inform the public through the print and electronic media, the name and designation of the authorized officers/ subordinate officers to whom the power of the State Government has been delegated as provided in Section 35 of the Food Act, 2013 within three days from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment and order;

(e) No any person other than the authorized officer/ subordinate officer delegated with the power by the State Government, through the authorized agencies or the contractors duly disclosed and notified by the State Government as per direction (c) above, shall be permitted to lift PDS items including rice from the FCI depots or from the depots of the Food & Civil Supplies Department. If any person other than the authorized officer/ officer delegated with power by the State Government, through

the authorized agencies/ contractors duly notified by the State Government, is found by the public including CSOs, Clubs, Student's Organizations, Meirapaibi etc. to be lifting or to have lifted foodgrains from the FCI depots or depots of the Food & Civil Supplies Department, the Secretary/ Commissioner/ Principal Secretary (CAF & PD), Government of Manipur shall be responsible for it;

(f) The General Manger, FCI, Manipur Branch is directed not to allow lifting of foodgrains by any person other than the authorized officer/ officer delegated with the power by the State Government as provided in Section 35 of the Food Act, 2013 through the authorized agencies or the contractors whose names have been duly notified by the State Government, failing which he shall be responsible for it;

(g) The fair price shop owners are directed to maintain records in the form of receipts or entries made in the ration cards to show the factum of having duly distributed PDS items including rice to the card holders. If any fair price shop owner is found not maintaining such records by any CSO or Local Club or Student's Organisation or Meirapaibi etc. or it is reported by the card holder that no such receipt is issued to him, the concerned authority shall enquire into it within a week and, if found correct, shall take immediate actions against the fair price shop owner including the cancellation of licence. Such an enquiry report shall be made known to the public through print and electronic media or by uploading it in the official website, failing which the concerned authority shall be responsible for it;

(h) Any entitled person/ card holder who is aggrieved due to non-supply or supply of less quantity of PDS items including rice by

the fair price shop owner, may approach any Legal Aid Clinic or the front office/the Secretary, District Legal Services Authority or the Member Secretary, Manipur Legal Services Authority for assistance towards lodging a complaint;

(i) Any entitled person/ card holder who is aggrieved due to non-supply or supply of less quantity of PDS rice by the fair price shop owner, may approach any CSO or Local Club or Student's organization or Meirapaibi etc. operating in that area for assistance and in the event of any request being made by him, such organization is humbly requested to extend its valuable help;

(j) All CSOs or Local Clubs or Student's Organisations or Meirapaibis etc. are requested to inspect the records relating to Targeted Public Distribution System which are alleged to have been placed by the State Government in the public domain and during the course of inspection, if any irregularity/ illegality is found or detected by them, the same may please be informed to the concerned Vigilance Committee or the District Grievance Redressal Officer or the State Food Commission for appropriate action. Any decision/ action taken by any of the above mentioned authorities shall be made known to the public, failing which they shall be responsible for it;

(k) The authorized officer/ subordinate officer delegated with the State Government's power as provided in Section 35 of the Food Act, 2013 and all the fair price shop owners are directed to hand over the ration cards, if not already done, to the identified and eligible households within a week from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment and order by the State Government which shall, in turn, inform all the fair price shop owners about this

order. In case they fail to hand over the same as directed above, they shall be responsible for it;

(l) The State Government and in particular, the Secretary/ Commissioner/ Principal Secretary (CAF & PD), Government of Manipur is directed to take immediate and appropriate steps, if not already taken, to introduce a system by which a web-based data capturing of all transactions which involve digitization of data of beneficiaries, linking of beneficiaries data with Adhar, uploading of data on the national portal etc. is ensured;

(m) The authorized officer/ subordinate officer delegated with the State Government's power as provided in Section 35 of the Food Act, 2013 or for that matter, the Deputy Commissioner, if State's power happens to be delegated upon him, shall inform the public, well in advance, the date and time when foodgrains will be lifted either from the FCI depots or from the State Civil Supplies go-down and delivered to the fair price shops so that public will have the opportunity to inspect the fair price shops. Foodgrains so lifted, shall be delivered to the fair price shops on the same day in respect of the valley areas and latest by the next day in respect of the hill areas. It is made clear that no foodgrains shall be lifted without informing the public as aforesaid;

(n) There are thousands of households which keep their paddy reserved for a year and in addition thereto, there are many Class-I officers, Income Tax Payees including contractors, businessmen etc. in the State. Keeping in mind the uncertainty of the COVID-19 crisis coming to an end in the near future, the State Government may identify them and persuade them to desist from

accepting relief items free of cost so that the same can be given to the needy persons;

(o) Many persons including MLAs, CSOs, Clubs, Social Workers etc., are seen quite often in the print and electronic media extending help to the people in the form of donation or distribution of essential commodity with the result that one person, sometimes, might have received it from different persons, while other might have received it from one person only. The State Government may consider this aspect and lay down the guideline so that such situation can be obviated in future;

(p) The Secretary/ Commissioner/ Principal Secretary (CAF & PD), Government of Manipur is directed to examine the correctness of the allegation as mentioned in para 11 above that MLAs are involved, in some manner, in the lifting, delivery and distribution of PDS items including rice and if it is true, an immediate action shall be taken to ensure that they are not involved at all, an affidavit of compliance thereof shall be filed within two weeks from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment and order;

(q) All Non-card holders also shall be given rice free of cost as announced by the Hon'ble Chief Minister, Manipur and any non-card holder is aggrieved due to the non-supply or supply of less quantity of rice may lodge a complaint in the same manner as has been directed by this Court at direction (h) & (i) above. On receipt of such a complaint, it is the duty of the State Government to ensure that the needful is done immediately without fail.

[4] On 28.09.2022, Mr. N. Mahendra, learned counsel for the petitioner submitted that revised check list for implementation of proper

and effective distribution of foodgrains and other PDS items under NFSA, 2013 and the same was taken on record. The revised check list reads as:

1. *Eradicating extreme poverty and hunger, to recognize the right of everyone to adequate food, access, at the individual level, to adequate quantities of food at affordable prices and paradigm shift – from the then welfare approach to the present right based approach, to this end, National Food Security Act (NFSA), 2013 has been enacted*

2. *Under the provisions of National Food Security Act (NFSA), 2013 various schemes are being taken up and implemented by the concerned authorities of the State of Manipur w.e.f. 24.04.2016, including identification of households to be covered under the Antyodaya Anna Yojana (AAY), identification of the remaining households as priority households (PHH) to be covered under the Targeted Public Distribution System (TPDS), etc. Through the Fair Price Shops (FPS) Agents, the food-grains and other PDS items are distributed to the Ration Card holders. In doing so, appointment of FPS agents in each of the villages, Cluster of villages, Zoning of areas in the entire State of Manipur (coming under each of the 60 Assembly Constituencies) should be more transparent without political interference.*

3. *Appointed persons as FPS agents should open a registered shop and to display information on a Notice Board at a prominent place in*

the shop on daily basis (as per S.11, S.27 read with rules made under S.40 NFSA, 2013) regarding:

- i) List of Antyodaya Anna Yojna and Priority Household beneficiaries identified under S.10 read with S.9 and S.3 of NFSA, 2013;*
- ii) Entitlement of essential commodities;*
- iii) Scale of issue;*
- iv) Retail issue Prices;*
- v) Timings of opening and closing of the Fair Price Shop;*
- vi) Stock of essential commodities received during the month and*
- vii) Opening and closing stock of essential commodities;*
- viii) To properly maintain records of ration card holders (AAY & PHH), Stock Register, issue or sale register;*
- ix) To display samples of food grains/ commodities being supplied through the Fair Price Shop;*
- x) Issue/distribution to the consumers against cash memo/records (to be supplied by the State Authority) and to make necessary entries in the respective Ration Cards (RCs) of the consumers;*

(Usually, in the field, there are no shops being run by any of those FPS Agents in the manner as required to do as stated above).

(It may be noted that every person belonging to priority households identified under the relevant provisions {i.e., S.10(1)} of National Food Security Act (NFSA), 2013 are entitled to receive five kilograms of food-grains per person per month at subsidized prices specified in Schedule I from the State Government under the Targeted Public Distribution System: provided that the households covered under Antyodaya Anna Yojana shall, to such extent as may be specified by the Central Government for each State in the said scheme, be entitled to thirty-five kilograms per household per month at the prices specified in Schedule I).

4. *Computerization of the PDS operations, in general, at the State Level and "computerization of TPDS operations" in particular, in the State of Manipur. Ration Card database: New Computerized Ration Cards having two unique identifiers a numeric code and a bar code printed on Ration Cards be directed to be issued within six months or so;*

5. Commissioners (from advocates) may be appointed to bring first hand reports from the public, one from urban area and another from rural area (both Hill and Plain);

6. Strengthening of the Grievance Redressal Mechanism by constituting a functioning State Food Commission as provided and mandated U/S.16 of the NFSA, 2013.

*7. Directions, if any, passed by this Hon'ble Court in this PIL, the same be treated as a **Continuing Mandamus**.*

[4.1] Para 3 of the check list mentions a notice board to be shown by fair price shop agents at their shop as per Section 11, 27 read with rules made under Section 40, NFSA, 2013.

[4.2] In pursuance to Para 4 of the check list, ration card has been computerized with QR Code at the State level, district level, block level and village level, vigilance committees for targeted public distribution system have been constituted vide order dated 25.09.2017.

[5] In pursuance to the check list submitted by the learned counsel for the petitioner, State Government filed additional affidavit dated 17.01.2023 stating that in pursuance to the direction of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in W.P.(C) No.196 of 2001 on the recommendation of Justice Wadhwa Committee, State Government issued order dated 14.12.2012 prescribing procedures for selection and appointment of fair price shop in Manipur. It is also stated that the State Government prescribed the display board as mentioned in the revised check list including all the details of the beneficiaries, etc. Sample is shown as below:

FAIR PRICE SHOP NO : 130

IMPHAL EAST DISTRICT

Name of Agent	:	RK Sandrajit Singh
Address of FPS Agent	:	Chongabi Bazar & Kongba Bazar
Mobile Number	:	8794060279
Name of A/C	:	5-Thongju A/C
Ward No.	:	3,4 & 5
Polling Station	:	5/36 & 5/37
Latitude	:	24.784877'
Longitude	:	93.958566'
No. of AAY Cards	:	68
No. of AAY Beneficiaries	:	124
No. of PHH Card	:	383
No. of PHH Beneficiaries	:	1129
Shop Timing	:	7:00 A.M. to 1:00 P.M.

CARD TYPE	COMMODITIES		RATE	
NFSA	Wheat	Rice	Wheat	Rice
AAY	Nil	35Kgs per card	Nil	Rs. 3/Kg
PHH	Nil	5Kgs per Beneficiaries	Nil	Rs. 3/Kg

Months: NOV. - 2022

Scheme: PMGKAY

TOLL FREE NO. 1800 345 3821

[6] Mr. Athouba Khaidem, learned GA submits that in terms of the step taken by the State Government, there is substantive compliance of the revised check list as proposed by the petitioner and he further submits that other issue involved in the other relief in the present case has been taken care by judgment and order dated 13.05.2022 passed by a Division Bench of this Court in PIL No.11 of 2020 titled Human Rights Alert and Another vs. State of Manipur and Others (supra). Mr. Athouba Khaidem, learned GA submits that the present PIL may be closed.

[7] We have perused the materials on record and all connected appeals and specially the check list submitted by the petitioner and the additional affidavit dated 17.01.2023 filed by the State Respondent showing compliance of the check list.

[8] With the issuance of the order dated 14.12.2012 by State Government for selection procedures of FPS Agents and formation of vigilance committees of State at various levels; prescribing the details of the display board to be shown at fair price shop; computerization of the ration card with QR Code and other measures and steps already taken in pursuance to the directions issued earlier by this Court and specially in PIL No.11 of 2020, we are of the view that there has been substantial compliance of the reliefs prayed for in the present PIL and other connected PILs merged with this present PIL. Accordingly, this PIL No.20 of 2017 is closed.

[9] Authorities shall also make endeavor for compliance of the various directions issued by Hon'ble Supreme Court and this Court and also for proper implementation of the National Food Security Act, 2013 and Schemes connected with it.

JUDGE

ACTING CHIEF JUSTICE

FR/NFR

- *Larson*